

***The Life of Milarepa and Walden through the Prism of
Eco-Consciousness***

**A Dissertation Submitted
To
Sikkim University**



**In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirement for the Degree of
Master of Philosophy**

**By
Laden Sherpa
Department of English
School of Languages and Literature
Sikkim University
July, 2021**

सामदुर, तादोंग - 737102
सिक्किम, भारत
03592-251212, 251415, 251656
251067
www.cus.ac.in



6th Mile, Samdur, Tadong-737102
Gangtok, Sikkim, India
Ph. 03592-251212, 251415, 251656
Telefax : 251067
Website : www.cus.ac.in

सिक्किम विश्वविद्यालय SIKKIM UNIVERSITY

(भारत के संसद के अधिनियम द्वारा वर्ष 2007 में स्थापित और नैक (एनएएसी) द्वारा वर्ष 2015 में प्रत्यायित केंद्रीय विश्वविद्यालय)
(A central university established by an Act of Parliament of India in 2007 and accredited by NAAC in 2015)

Date: 15/07/2025

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the dissertation entitled "*The Life of Milarepa and Walden through the Prism of Eco-Consciousness*" submitted to **Sikkim University** for the award of the degree of **Master of Philosophy**, is my original work. Any content or any part of this dissertation has not been submitted to any other institution or for any other academic purposes.

Laden Sherpa
Laden Sherpa

Roll No: 19MPEN04

Registration No: 19/M.Phil. /ENG/04

I recommend that this dissertation be placed before the examiners for evaluation for the award of the degree of **Master of Philosophy** of this University.

Alhauki
Supervisor

अध्यक्ष
Head
अंग्रेजी विभाग
Department of English
सिक्किम विश्वविद्यालय
Sikkim University

अध्यक्ष
Head
अंग्रेजी विभाग
Department of English
सिक्किम विश्वविद्यालय
Sikkim University
Head of the Department

समूर, तदंग - 737102
गंगतोक, सिक्किम, भारत
फोन - 03592-251212, 251415, 251656
फैक्स - 251067
वेबसाइट - www.cus.ac.in



6th Mile, Samdur, Tadong-737102
Gangtok, Sikkim, India
Ph. 03592-251212, 251415, 251656
Telefax : 251067
Website : www.cus.ac.in

सिक्किम विश्वविद्यालय SIKKIM UNIVERSITY

(भारत के संसद के अधिनियम द्वारा वर्ष 2007 में स्थापित और नैक (एनएएसी) द्वारा वर्ष 2015 में प्रत्यायित केंद्रीय विश्वविद्यालय)
(A central university established by an Act of Parliament of India in 2007 and accredited by NAAC in 2015)

Date : 15/07/2021

CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that the dissertation entitled "*The Life of Milarepa and Walden through the Prism of Eco-Consciousness*" submitted to Sikkim University in partial fulfilment of the requirement for the award of the degree of **Master of Philosophy** in the **Department of English**, embodies the result of bona fide research work carried out by **Laden Sherpa** under my guidance and supervision. No part of the dissertation has been submitted for any other degree, diploma, associate-ship or fellowship.

All the assistance and help during the course of the investigation has been duly acknowledged by her.

अध्यक्ष
Head
अंग्रेजी विभाग
Department of English
सिक्किम विश्वविद्यालय
Sikkim University
Dr. Rosy Chamling

Supervisor
Associate Professor
Department of English
School of Languages and Literature
Sikkim University
Place: Gangtok, Sikkim

समूह, सन्दुर, तदोंग - 737102
सिक्किम, भारत
फोन-251212, 251415, 251656
फैक्स - 251067
वेबसाइट - www.cus.ac.in



6th Mile, Samdur, Tadong-737102
Gangtok, Sikkim, India
Ph. 03592-251212, 251415, 251656
Telefax : 251067
Website : www.cus.ac.in

सिक्किम विश्वविद्यालय SIKKIM UNIVERSITY

(भारत के संसद के अधिनियम द्वारा वर्ष 2007 में स्थापित और नैक (एनएएसी) द्वारा वर्ष 2015 में प्रत्यायित केंद्रीय विश्वविद्यालय)
(A central university established by an Act of Parliament of India in 2007 and accredited by NAAC in 2015)

Date: 15.07.2021

PLAGIARISM CHECK CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that plagiarism check has been carried for the following M.Phil. dissertation with the help of **URKUND** Software and the result is 0 % tolerance rate, within the permissible limit (up to 10 % tolerance rate) as per the norm of Sikkim University.

“The Life of Milarepa and Walden through the Prism of Eco-Consciousness”

Submitted by **Laden Sherpa** under the Supervision of **Dr. Rosy Chamling**,
Associate Professor, Department of English, School of Languages and Literature,
Sikkim University, Gangtok – 737102, India

Laden Sherpa
Signature of the Scholar

Countersigned by the Supervisor

Alhamling

अध्यक्ष
Head
अंग्रेजी विभाग
Department of English
सिक्किम विश्वविद्यालय
Sikkim University

Vetted by the Librarian

पुस्तकालयाध्यक्ष

केन्द्रीय

Librarian
Central Library
Sikkim University

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The research on “*The Life of Milarepa and Walden through the Prism of Eco Consciousness*” is a research experience that has helped me not only to renew and reconsider new trends in research but it is a work that also gave me enough space to delve into some literary questions that arose at the beginning of my research journey concerning our understanding of nature and literature.

I would like to express my gratitude to Dr. Rosy Chamling for her support and energy that she infused in me as a Supervisor .Dr. Rosy Chamling not only advised me all through my dissertation but as a scholar I would admit that her sense of meticulousness and rectitude indeed helped me complete my dissertation on time for which I will always remain indebted to her and will try to retain and emulate the sense of commitment that she profusely exuded as a Supervisor .I remain indebted to the teachers of the Department of English, Prof. Irshad G Ahmed ,Dr Parvinder Kaur ,Dr. Ram Bhawan Yadav for lending their guidance for the course work programme and the office incharge of the department Sir Indra who delivered dates and schedules for the important events of our exams during and after the course work period.

I would also like to bestow my reverence to my teachers; Rev .Guerme Sangpo, Lama Singey and Lama Lode Nima who helped me in the explanation of some esoteric Tibetan concepts and words that helped me progress in my study of Jetsun Milarepa .Finally, I mention my parents Passang Dawa Sherpa and Chakey Sherpa and my grandmother Nimchheki Sherpa for lending mental and emotional support for the completion of the research.

Laden Sherpa

CONTENTS

Page No.

Chapter-1: Introduction (1-38)

- 1.1 Introduction
- 1.2 Literature Review
- 1.3 Research Gap and Research Questions
- 1.4 Aims, Objectives and Hypothesis of the Research
- 1.5 Significance and Limitations of the Research
- 1.6 Research Methods and Methodology
- 1.7 Schemes of Chapters
- 1.8 Introducing the Authors
 - 1.8.1 Structuring Author's Work and their Society

**Chapter-2
Emulating the Green: Perceiving and Transforming the Space of Ecology (39-74)**

- 2.1 Introduction
- 2.2 Concepts of Nature in *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) and *Walden* (1854): A Comparative Study
- 2.3 Consciousness of Ecology Through 'Self' and the 'Other'
- 2.4 Shifting Perceptions and Conscious Actions of Jetsun Milarepa and Henry David Thoreau
- 2.5 Ecology and The Mode of Transformative Emulation

**Chapter 3: Delineating Timescapes:
Mindful Perception of Nature in Milarepa and Thoreau (75-112)**

- 3.1 Introduction
- 3.2 A Study of Natural and Non-Natural Time
- 3.3 Transcending Time and Ethnicity through Timescapes
- 3.4 Enactivism and Doctrine of The Hour in *The Life Of Milarepa* (1997) and *Walden* (1854)
- 3.5 Studying Non -Visible Effects of Nature on Milarepa and Thoreau

Chapter 4: Singing Landscapes: A Study of Oral Songs of Milarepa and Eco-Prose of Thoreau (113-158)

- 4.1 Introduction
- 4.2 Mode of Primary Works of Jetsun Milarepa And Henry David Thoreau in the context of oral and written tradition
- 4.3 A Discussion of Genre and Landscape
- 4.4 Representing Nature through the language of Doha Songs and Memoir Writing
- 4.5 Impact of Environment and Ecology on the Choice of Genre and in Genre Formation

Chapter 5: Conclusion (159-168)

Works Cited List (169-175)

CHAPTER 1 -INTRODUCTION

1.1 Introduction

In *Critical Theory Today* (2008), Lois Tyson writes on how theory can act as a lens to look into a world differently, if this is so then we are fortunate to have received a lens of ecocriticism that pertinently helps us to analyse the evolving human-nature relation in the context of emerging literary trends. Ecocriticism has marked a critical emphasis on the study of human word itself when we are correlating it with nature, thus bordering its emphasis on entailing and reconsidering the relation between humans and non-humans by perceiving human race not as opposed to nature and therefore a source of negativity and destruction, but rather as a space to be experimented for fostering this human-nature relationship.

This context and configuration of human nature relationship however is unbounded and has had recorded its expansion by amalgamation of multiple voices and multiple perspectives, whether it is a record of the oral transmutation in generations or some visible sculptured recorded fragments of ages in pages or how the vastness of ecocritical writings has transcended continents and contours and has found roots in the fertile land of the East. Thus in the first chapter of *Ecocriticism* (2004), Greg Garrard succinctly writes, “the subject of ecocriticism is the study of the relationship of the human and the non -human, throughout human cultural history and [which has been] entailing critical analysis of the term human itself”(5).

Ecocriticism is defined much simply and succinctly by Cheryll Glotfelty as:

Ecocriticism is the study of the relationship between literature and the physical environment. Just as feminist criticism examines language and literature from a gender-conscious perspective, and Marxist criticism brings an awareness of

modes of production and economic class to its reading of texts, ecocriticism takes an earth-centered approach to literary studies. (Glotfelty and Fromm xviii)

It is also due to its extensive potential for expansion that ecocriticism has now grown and fostered in various forms that has continuously led to the emergence of varying offshoots like eco-feminism, deep ecology and eco-poetics. Ecopsychology and eco-consciousness are yet concepts additional that has made emergence on this continuous growth of ecocriticism, to have its emergence from psychology to ecopsychology and on consciousness as eco-consciousness. Cheryll Glotfelty in the introduction of the seminal work *The Ecocriticism Reader: Landmarks in Literary Ecology* (1996) likewise writes in the first three lines of his work on what the future of ecocriticism will behold and makes a discussion on the primary task of ecocriticism. Glotfelty asserts, “An ecologically focused criticism is a worthy enterprise primarily because it directs our attention to matters about which we need to be thinking. Consciousness raising is its most important task” (Glotfelty and Fromm xxiv).

As ecological consciousness has been taken as one of the major hallmarks of ecocritical reading, the dissertation as such aims to bring forth a significant relation between the author’s consciousness of the ecology and the influence of ecology on their works through the comparative study of the biography of Jetsun Milarepa’s (A.D.1052- A.D.1135) *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) with Henry David Thoreau’s (1817-1862) monumental work *Walden* (1854).

The biography of Jetsun Milarepa, *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) by Lobsang P. Lhalungpa recounts some of the peculiar journey ever made by man, one who refuted the scholarly institutions of his time and wandered from village to village, teaching enlightenment and the path to Buddhahood through his spontaneously composed songs, seeking “spontaneous realization of most profound nature of mind” (Lopez xvii).

However, it is also a story of an individual who in his search for dharma marks the psycho spiritual connectivity with nature,¹ frames eco critical relationship with the mountainous regions of Tibet. Thoreau's *Walden* (1854) following no different way of a seeker is the record of the journey made by him from his home Massachusetts to the wooded valley, marks the constant attempt made on the part of an individual to resuscitate his conscious being by walling himself with nature. Flaunting the quotidian canons of society, Thoreau sings along with nature such epochal lines as, "Birds do not sing in caves, nor do doves cherish their innocence in dovecots" (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 22).

The dissertation as such attempts to agglutinate these two personalities, two cultures, two thoughts, two individuals by bridging the gap between East and West, 1800 America and 1100 Tibet in an ecocritical discourse of time and space, ecology and ethnicity, and attempts a record of an individual's passage from ego consciousness to eco consciousness. Going along the lines of juxtaposition the research will furnish forth a relative relation between the place and the choice of genre (oral /written, prose/ folk song) in the works written on Milarepa and work composed by Thoreau.

If Thoreau in *Walden* (1854) opted natural setting of Walden space, the exploratory existence which is depicted in *Walden* (1854), Milarepa's life likewise depicts the itinerant passage of his life in the mountainous regions of Tibet. The dissertation as such marks an additional attempt to make a comparative study of the physiology of eleventh century Tibet with nineteenth century America along with

¹Dharma ,the word has been put forth more elaborately by Lobsang P. Lhalungpa in his translator's note to *The Life of Milarepa* as , " two sets of principles for spiritual perfection. First: the teachings embodied in the Three Containers (Tripitaka) and the practice of self-transformation by means of perfect ethics, perfect contemplation, and perfect wisdom. In Mahayana Buddhism all these are condensed into one single principle, namely Bodhichitta - Enlightened Mind - the joint development of boundless compassion and transcendent wisdom. Second: the term 'Dharma' refers to the metaphysical standpoint of Buddhism regarding the relative and absolute nature of reality"(211).

individual author's subjective methods of nature connectivity that inevitably linked/delinked these individuals with the wider socio-cultural the then activities of the century.

1.2 Literature Review

In the survey of the literature not one particular book or article could be found that would deal with both these authors simultaneously, as such the literature review has entailed to assimilate works written on them individually yet which marks a connectivity in this comparative study.

The Yogi of Walden: Henry David Thoreau, Bridging the Philosophies of East and West (2014) by Sundara Bharadwaj is one such work that embarks to show the connecting lane between American Transcendentalism and philosophy of India. It seeks to see the influence of Indian philosophy, Sufism to Buddhism on Thoreau and thereby provides a pedestal where East and West have been brought up in complementary assuage.

Andrew H. Quintman's *The Yogin and the Madman: Reading the Biographical Corpus of Tibet's Great Saint Milarepa* (2014) reflects on the process of rnamthar (spiritual biography)² which is the transmission of a person's biography through oral tradition. It is a work that has successfully brought together new renderings for the connoisseurs' of Tibetan history and has provided a wider perspective to scholars and readers on the traditions of Himalayas, history of Buddhism along with detailed explanation of the life of Milarepa.

Dharma Rain: Sources of Buddhist Environmentalism (2000) edited by Stephanie Kaza and Kenneth Kraft portrays both history and current contemporary

² Namtar or Namthar is "a spiritual biography or hagiography in Tibetan Buddhism ... Namtars do not focus on a literal chronology of events, but rather function as a kind of learning example that hits the key points of the yogi's spiritual life" (Wikipedia Contributors . "Namtar" (biography))

tradition of eco-buddhism. It has critical renderings of environmentalists like Gary Snyder to Joanna Macy, provides the esoteric knowledge that weaves religion with relegation, nature with narration.

Ecocritical Readings Rethinking Nature and Environment (2015) by Shivani Jha calls for the need of action towards environment, actions which are accountable as well as acceptable to society. It reads on the world utopia where a symbiotic relation and respect can be fostered between human and non-humans. Jha has brought forth a chapter in this book titled “Discovering the Forgotten Mate: Thoreau’s *Walden* and Beyond” which brings forth a wider relation between consciousness and being and traces the evolution and significance of *Walden* (1854) from American capitalism to contemporary world.

Thoreau’s Sense of the Place: Essays in American Environmental writing (2000), edited by Richard J. Schneider features the collection of pioneering essays that explains the philosophy of nature and the sense of place as a part of Thoreau’s living existence. The first chapter that deals with amalgamation of science and nature also encumbers the American notion of place and cultural space. The second chapter brings out the relation between genre and narrative discourse. The subsequent chapters likewise construct place from the socially constructed culture and its effect on nature and vice-versa.

As the dissertation emphasises on the perception of an individual toward nature and as the impact of identity formation is important link between self and other contrast, the biography of Milarepa can be coded back to his ethical oral history and Thoreau’s memoir *Walden* (1854) too emancipates culture, memory and self, the work *The Voice of the Past: Oral History* (2017) by Paul Thompson and Joanna Bornat is an important work in this regard that sets philosophical and practical renderings of oral transmission

which further emphasises on memory that plays a pertinent role to weave a relation between culture and self.

In the article “Milarepa and Demons: Aids to Spiritual and Psychological Growth” (Fall 2001) Rachel Berghash and Katherine Jillson speaks on the obstacles of practice in solitude that incarnate with the absence of self sufficiency within oneself, the psychological turmoil within and outside Milarepa. It emphasises on the psychological turmoil as well as a sense of peace which one encounters in the outside environment as well as an internal disturbance that one goes through when one encounters wildness of a wild place, an experience of change that one has in a state of silence as one moves from usual habit of socially clustered environment.

In another article “Timely Ecocriticism: Reading Time Critically in the Environmental Humanities” (Spring 2018) Paul Huebener takes up relation between the field of ecocriticism and time, time that cannot be seen as a single entity but as a collection of multiple contested experiences that shape reality through the negotiations of culture with nature. With the emphasis on time-consciousness, ecocriticism and ethnicity, the article becomes an indispensable study of “time as a form of power and discourse with socio environmental activities” (Huebener 2).

1.3 Research Gap and Research Questions

As a monumental contributor to the history of Tibetan canon, a number of biography is available on the eponymous poet Milarepa and even the orally transmitted songs has reached the print by words of Prof. Grama C.C. Chang , still any ecocritical perceptive of a figure who drew most of his impromptu songs out of nature remains a broach able topic. *Walden* (1854) in a similar context has had many acclaimed works to its credit as an eco critical work for centuries but a broader perspective which serves to provide pertinent link between ecology and consciousness, the relative relation between the

conscious level of an individual which serves to partake in formulation of the level of individual's ecological awareness calls for further study as a topic.

Though works have been published juxtaposing the Tibetan canon and western discourse, still these works often stands in the cauls of hagiographical undertones (Milarepa addressed as yogi of East and Thoreau as yogi of Walden) the proposal as such aims to provide a comparative study of their works by bringing back the humanness of the individuals back to planet Earth and to test them on common human conscious level in their respective space of ecology. In this respect the research aims to discuss and analyse following questions:

1. The research entails to find as to how the state of perception is inevitably linked with habitation of natural place that further renders variation on the state of consciousness.
2. In the transition of genre can environmental status be ascertained out of writer's generic change/choice?
3. The research aims to uncover if the focus of current environmental studies should be on consciousness in action, in what is, rather than what was or what could be.
4. To find out as to how the ecology within a body and the ecology outside is linked within the precinct of conscious acts in the works of Milarepa and Thoreau.
5. Does Thoreau's *Walden* (1854) mark the arrival of modern yogi and can an ecological aware individual be called a yogi too?

1.4 Aims, Objectives and Hypothesis of the Research

1. To analyse the timescapes in the comparative study of the ecology in eleventh century Tibet and nineteenth century America.³
2. To find a relative relation between evolution of a place and the choice of genre in relation to *Walden* (1854) and songs of Milarepa.
3. To furnish forth a connection between ecology within a body and ecology outside in relation to life and nature perception of Milarepa and Thoreau.
4. The objective of the research is to substantiate a position on the effects of landscape inhabitation on individual's consciousness, perception of nature, perception towards life and in a broader sense in the overall writing process or oral transmissions of Thoreau and Milarepa .

Hypothesis:

If ecocriticism implies the deliberate analysis of surrounding phenomenon through individual's ecocentric prism, the state of perception is inevitably linked with "natural history information, personal response to nature and philosophical interpretation of nature" (Lyon 20) rendering variation on the state of consciousness.

1.5 Significance and Limitations of the Research

- The proposed research is significant as it is an attempt to bring out two diverse nature perceptions and genre from America and Tibet in the mode of comparativeness.

³The research aims to use the word "Timescapes" in the context of the importance of looking at environment not only in a perspective landscape mode alone but to study nature and see natural changes in relation to time ,in timescape mode that deals with the invisible and often unaccounted perspective of time which is elaborated and studied by Barbara Adam in the work *Timescapes of Modernity: The Environment and Invisible Hazards* . Routledge, 1998. See p. 9

- No exclusive comparative study has been put forward in regard to these two personalities as such this research is the first attempt to bring Milarepa and Thoreau together through the comparative study of their ecocritical perception.
- The research may be limited in terms of the inclusion of texts as the research will emphasise only on single works of Milarepa and Thoreau, as such only those folk songs that comes near the frame of Milarepa's nature perception will be assimilated in the dissertation.
- Further as the research is author based with wider emphasis on socio-historical background, the variation and structure of oral constructive songs and prose style of the concerned authors will not be dealt in detail.

1.6 Research Methods and Methodology:

The methods adopted in the process of the dissertation is the close reading of Lobsang P. Lhalungpa's *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) and Henry David Thoreau's *Walden* (1854). The research will also assimilate the theoretical framework of ecocriticism and oral history. Further the offshoots of ecocriticism i.e. ecopsychology will be equally emancipated as a methodology of this qualitative research in textual analysis. Collecting the data through comparative analysis, the paper would grade and apply the strategy to see eleventh century nature connectivity versus nineteenth century nature connectivity, data collection versus oral interpretation.

In the method of lens or keyhole comparison, Thoreau's text *Walden* (1854) will be taken as a medium to analyse the eleventh century biography of the Tibetan yogi Milarepa. The organisational scheme being formulation of point to point comparison where with the alternate point of one text will come the comparable point of another text. The proposed work would also use the English translated biography of Milarepa and is deliberated to use some interdisciplinary frameworks for concerned purpose such

as current expansions of publications and articles working on a frame of trans-ecocritical approaches, comparative analysis on works of yogic expansions from Indian Vedic culture to Tibetan canon as intercultural study material.

1.7 Schemes of Chapters:

Chapter One: Introduction

The first chapter of the dissertation will frame an introduction of Milarepa and Thoreau, who have set a transition in perception towards life and nature in their respective fields, well reflected by Thoreau in *Walden* (1854) and Milarepa in his songs. The chapter will address the origin of these authors, their ethnic as well as socio-economic background, further circumscribing the comparativeness in regional mode of existence in Tibet and America respectively. Analysing the respective society's perception toward nature and the ecology of their times it will study how the philosophy of these individuals differed and set a tradition of their own flaunting the already extant canon of society. The chapter will also provide a brief overview of the contrast between the society of America and Tibet while discussing their major works and analyse their modes of writing with broader emphasis on oral and written tradition.

Chapter Two: Emulating the Green: Perceiving and Transforming the Space of Ecology

The second chapter will respectively highlight the western and eastern concept of ecocriticism that is one of the major modes of divergence between Milarepa and Thoreau. It is with the heightened eco-consciousness that Milarepa viewed nature and its abstruse energy to transform human consciousness so much as to emulate the very colour green. The chapter as such will provide specification of self and other in relation to natural and non-natural binary contrast. It will juxtapose ecology that exists within/outside the body mechanism along the lines of binaries and dualities.

Further when Milarepa travels as an itinerant vagabond his composition of songs varies every time in thought and manner of perception, every time he is exposed to a new set of environment his songs, his rhythms, his similes varies, likewise the experience of Thoreau in *Walden* (1854) encapsulated a shift of perception in second year, both of whom will be discussed in this chapter, highlighting the instance of consciousness in action. This chapter will also discuss the transition of perception in Milarepa's view of life and his enemy as he later marks the transformation of perception at a psychological level. Subsequently this change in perception will be juxtaposed with how nature itself marks a change in itself.

Chapter Three: Delineating Timescapes: Mindful Perception of Nature in Milarepa and Thoreau

The third chapter will read environment in relation to time. As Milarepa and Thoreau hail from two different regions and time space, the chapter will read ecology and ethnicity in relation with time factor especially keeping in mind the constructionist approach that marks the everyday influence of people and situations on individuals, which at times can be rendered as a social and ideological structuring. This chapter will also attempt to delineate time and further transcend time by blurring the borders of nation and ethnicity by making a comparative analysis of the 11th and 19th century ecology and the transition in perception of the particular space of ecology with the help of enactivism and pioneering points from Thoreau's doctrine of the hour.

The non natural time that is recorded by the beat of the clock is more about the quantifiable aspect of existence, "based on the principal of repetition without change" (Adam14) and as eco-consciousness is more about vision rather than about visibility, this chapter will deal with non-visible effects of nature on Milarepa and Thoreau. Solitude is one aspect that will be discussed in the chapter along with other non visible

aspects like perception and yogic consciousness, the latent and immanent in relation with natural time. The chapter as such will deal with questions on natural time, Henry Bergson's theory of time and on Barbara Adam's notion of "timescapes", as temporal sustainability of life which shows the fallibility of constraining any cultural human temporal experience to the influence of the clock.

Chapter Four: Singing Landscapes: A Study of Oral Songs of Milarepa and Eco-Prose of Thoreau

The fourth chapter will discuss genre in relation to landscape inhabitation, the impact of ecology on the choice of genre and vice versa. As both Thoreau and Milarepa wrote in dissimilar genre, it will experiment on how differently the landscape sang to these two individuals. If Milarepa's songs are compendium of the environmental sentiments passed down by oral tradition that rewrites the ecological response of the time, Thoreau's transmissions of thoughts to transmission of words in prose work sings of the sight that pictured his sensory vision with contemporary landscape.

To deconstruct the origin of Milarepa's songs the research will look into the origin of Doha tradition,⁴ which was brought by Marpa to Tibet from his teacher Naropa,⁵ likewise with Thoreau, a study will be made on his evolution as a memoir writer. In this regard the chapter will delve into the role of genre in transmission of

⁴The Doha songs made their initial connotation with spiritual messages that were delivered through the songs and hence this form was used synonymously as Songs of realization. Ann Waldman writes on this form of poetry as "a song of realization that acknowledges an encounter with a master teacher, traditionally a guru or a lama, and explores a particular wisdom or teaching transmitted through a kind of call-and-response duet format" (Waldman, Anne. "Poetry as Siddhi")

⁵Naropa is counted among Indian mahasiddhas of his time, was a renowned pundit from India (Nalanda). The incorporation of the name in the study of Milarepa is pertinent also because he is believed to be the personal teacher of Marpa Lochwa who in itself is the renowned teacher, translator and spiritual guide of Jetsun Milarepa. Naropa is also considered to have passed down doha tradition to Marpa, his student and subsequently it is here that we see the emergence of Milarepa as the greatest doha composer who however molded the doha structure in the way it suited the yogi in a mode of spontaneity, composing more than Hundred thousand songs in his lifetime.

thoughts, role of the readers in formation of genre and the reflection of ecological landscape in the choice of genre.

Chapter Five: Conclusion

In every age it is the connection and an endeavour to make a transit from waking consciousness to heightened consciousness that a relation between human and nonhuman aims to entail. This concluding chapter will subsume the result of the comparison between the distinct works of Milarepa and Thoreau. Drawing its conclusion on the revelations of the first four chapters it will provide a resolution on the difference and similarity in the approach of Thoreau and Milarepa towards nature, further analysing importance of these texts in contemporary period. Though Milarepa and Thoreau represented two ages and two places where the methods and the space of environment may vary, but the connection aimed at remains always to find the symbiotic relation. In this alignment of the literature of past and literature of present, of the East and of the West, the yardstick that measures the change and changeability of environmental perception in subsequent years comes up as a point of formidable importance. The final chapter as such will include the outcome of the hypothesis.

1.8 Introducing the Authors

Jetsun Milarepa (A.D.1052-A.D.1135)

Just as the axiom goes that one cannot judge a book by its cover ,in a similar note ,life circumstance and the understanding of human behavior cannot be known and certainly not ascertained by the attire one addresses to clad on ,still in case of Jetsun Milarepa,his name along with his peculiar attire brings us closer to who he was, says a lot about the man .The childhood name of Milarepa as Thopaga heralds back to the incident after

his birth .⁶As a trader, his father travelled to various places and a day came when he was informed of the child's birth in Western Tibet and as for the father it was a good news that was brought to him ,he named the child Thopaga which in English translation simply means a good news. The name Milarepa however goes back to the time when there used to be a man descendent of the tribe Kungpa and he was called Josay .⁷There goes the instance that Josay was called to subside demon of the region. Josay Khungpo was a renowned exorcist of Tibet and when people from the village had any trouble with the demons, to enslave the spirits Josay was often called, thus in a similar note he was called to subside a demon and in the tone of great exorcist Josay threatened the demon in Tibetan tonality as:

‘I, Khyungpo Josay, have come. I shall eat the flesh of demons and drink their blood. Just wait!’ As he spoke, he lunged forward. The demon was panic-stricken and screamed out with terror, ‘Papa Mila! Papa Mila!’⁸... From this moment on, everyone called him Mila to illustrate the power of Josay's virtues, and Josay kept Mila as the family name. (Lhalungpa 13)

There is thus various instances of the use of native idioms in the biography of Milarepa and the tone of the native exorcist carries the essence of humour and confidence of the man which is retainable even in the translated languages .This incident thus narrates

⁶ Thopaga-As the birth of the child came to the father as a good news ,the father of Milarepa named him Thopaga which is translated as good news .Still there are other versions of translations that takes the name Thopaga as “delighted to hear”,the delight that the father felt after getting the news of the birth of the first child ,while it was believed that Milarepa had a delightful voice and the what became of Thopaga was in conformity with the name he received from his father ,as his songs were delightful to listen to .

⁷The ancestral tribe of Milarepa,Khyungpo is said to have been “the great clan of herdsman” while Josay being a name of an ancestor who was a yogi and is said to have acquired powers during his time and as transference of lineage was much prevalent during and before Milarepa's time ,the name and the source of origin were implicitly maintained through oral tradition (Lhalungpa,Lobsang P . 13)

⁸ In the Translators' Notes of *The Life of Milarepa* ,Lobsang P .Lhalungpa illustrates the phrase “Papa Mila!” as “‘Father, what a man! Father, what a man!’ In Tibetan, ‘mi’ means man and ‘la’ is a necessary reinforcing exclamation. Thus the expression,Father (papa), what a man!”(208).It is in these accounts that readers can also associate the name of Milarepa in another version as ,Mi meaning ‘man’ and repas as ‘cotton clad’, which suggest a cotton clad man.

how the oral tradition and oral transmission carries the power to eternalise situations that is retainable through generations ,in case of Milarepa’s lineage the evidence is much sustained in the form of the title that the family inherits along with the long sustained tale of the bravery of Josay. Thus while the oral tale recounts the significance of the title ‘Mila’ in Milarepa’s name , ‘Repas’,⁹ on the other hand implies to those ascetic who wore cotton robes and travelled as itinerant vagabonds in the valley and mountain region of Tibet .Thus the life story of Milarepa at once comes out as “a cultural symbol, a religious icon, a historical datum, linguistic source material, and— with Buddhism’s spread beyond the Himalayan borders—the source of great spiritual affinity and devotion” (Quintman 11).

Further, to discuss the origin of Jetsun Milarepa and to read his life story is to read a well framed bildungsroman narrative; his birth in Western Tibet and the unfortunate death of his father, Mila Dorje Senge that lead them to the life of servitude under their uncle and aunt, the revenge motive that brooded inside his mother, Nyangtsha Kargyen for whom he learned the art of black magic and as a result killed as many as twenty five people and destroyed the crops of the region .¹⁰

It was after the realization, the epiphanic moment in his life that this act of killing for revenge motive was a greater sin that he later goes in search of dharma, unable to overcome the pangs of the sin, he comes under the tutelage of Marpa

⁹ Repas in many translated biographies of Milarepa appears as followers of Milarepa, those who sang the songs that Milarepa delivered in his life. However in the introduction of the edited work of Peter Alan Roberts, we have a more influential analysis made on the position of repas as those who , “had few possessions and lived in caves and huts, dependent upon the limited patronage of villagers. They were dedicated to meditation practice and not scholarship. The term repa later fell into disuse, being replaced by ‘Naljorpa’ (rnal-’byor-pa), the Tibetan equivalent of ‘yogin’, to mean a non-monastic, non-householder practitioner. Ras means cotton, and pa is a substantiative”(Alan Roberts 2).

¹⁰ Mila Dorje Senge often finds the translated name as Vajra Lion and Nyangtsha Kargyen as White Jewel of Nyang ,for she came from a noble family called Nyang ,were Jetsun Milarepa’s biological parents .See Lhalungpa pp 14-15.

Lochwa,¹¹ the great translator of his time .Still Marpa was adamant to not to provide his teaching to Milarepa until he goes through various trials and tribulations which is chaptered by Lhalungpa as “Ordeals”.

It is thus after surpassing difficult tests of Marpa ,that tested his physical and mental strength albeit tested his dedication to acquire the teaching ,finally Marpa not only gives him the teachings that leads to ultimate realization, but we all see his inclusion in the lineage of Kagyu or “Lineage of the word”¹², a traditional form of dharma transmission that had its origin from Tilopa which then went into the hands of Naropa .Later Marpa likewise went to Naropa who was a renowned pundit from India (Nalanda) and from him Marpa brought the teachings of the Kagyu lineage and Milarepa carried the lineage further to his student Rechungpa .¹³ Thus the origin of Milarepa well emancipates the study of Tibetan culture of eleventh century that did not took knowledge based on class , nor was the lineage based on hereditary pattern ,as Milarepa acquires the knowledge of alphabets with the insistence of his mother just as he comes under the lineage of Kagyu coming under the tutelage of Marpa though he was never related to Marpa by blood or clan. Thus the record of the origin of Milarepa in his biography goes beyond hereditary and hierarchy strain and takes us to a more flexible mode of his origin. Still what is more important than his origin is the life that he spent amidst the mountainous region of Tibet ,his perception of nature and consciousness of ecology that comes to us through this spontaneous songs .

¹¹Marpa lochwa , is the teacher of Jetsun Milarepa and was one of the renowned translator of his time ,who is entrusted to have made travels to India and having brought esoteric doctrines from India is said to have translated the scripts from India into Tibetan script .The title lochwa or lotsava meaning translator .

¹² Kagyu or “Lineage of the word” is a traditional form of dharma transmission that had its origin from Tilopa which then went into the hands of Naropa ,and subsequently to Marpa, Milarepa and Rechungpa.

¹³Rechungpa is the student of Jetsun Milarepa ,who is entrusted to have taken the lineage of Kagyu further in his times .

Henry David Thoreau (1817-1862)

Having published some poems, essays and two books yet his life now stands as a name that goes beyond his time, one who ; celebrated nature as the cording of the symbiotic relation between human and non-humans, studied existent natural and non-natural aspects of his time , wherein comes along the story of the author and a philosopher; one of the renowned pillar of American literary canon, a natural historian in making , is the name Henry David Thoreau.

When one sculps the origin of Henry David Thoreau , the story behind Thoreau's name well informs Thoreau's individualistic cult. Formerly christened as David Henry Thoreau, which came up in accord to remembrance of the dead uncle in the family after which Thoreau was named David Henry, in his later life he altered the name and addressed himself as Henry David Thoreau. Among various speculation behind this alteration, the relative relation readers can make with his name is “‘Henry’ the name coming from “Common Germanic Haimariks, from haima-“home” and rik-‘ruler’”(Wikipedia Contributors. Henry given name). Thus Thoreau sets his life journey as a home ruler and later in Walden space he set this prefix much closer to Ecology, that derives its origin from Greek word ‘Oikos’ or house and ‘logos’ implying a study. It is also to be noted that he was born in maternal grandmother's farm which surely gives the readers the rustic sense of the initiation of his life in farm house much explored in the novels of Thomas Hardy.

The alteration in the name can also be seen as an assimilation of an affirmative sense of independence that marked his origin as an independent being. Thoreau knew the stratification and boundaries that came up with naming oneself as part of the collective term called society and that is well explored by Homi K. Bhabha in *The Location of Culture* (1994) who links name as the power to signify domination, a

process of “possession of a space through the power of naming” (Bhabha 331). Still the alternation of the name and at the same time not completely doing away with the prefix that society transposed on him well reflects a man in becoming, who took a middle way, neither the life of American materialism nor absolute renunciation of society but elected a path which trailed and avoided both the extremes –which the readers at various instances get from the metaphoric relation between his life and the Walden Pond. He thus writes in *Walden* (1854) :

When I had mapped the pond by the scale of ten rods to an inch, and put down the soundings, more than a hundred in all, I observed this remarkable coincidence. Having noticed that the number indicating the greatest depth was apparently in the centre of the map, I laid a rule on the map lengthwise, and then breadthwise, and found, to my surprise, that the line of greatest length intersected the line of greatest breadth exactly at the point of greatest depth.
(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 225)

Thus while the society of Thoreau saw this act of choosing a name for himself as a foolish enterprise, for it went beyond the norms of society and set a stage for individual liberty that was never worked on before, the liberty to call oneself what one wanted to, one can well trace how from the very beginning of his life Thoreau had set a journey paced beyond the tiny minds of Concord neighbours who harboured this act of Thoreau as a foolish one, could not and rather did not attempt to see a civil disobedience in rising, an evolution of an individual who was to take life in his own terms, whose peculiar works and journey in literary enterprise well reflects on the dauntless personality.

Thoreau's journey from Harvard in 1830's started his career as a writer, with a record of journal that later became an asset that helped him deliver his philosophy of

life and nature to readers in a considerate manner ,a source that helped him keep pace with all that his vision delivered him in perennial thoughts of solitude ,that he gathered in his everyday account which later became a source ,a genuine instance of record which never let him pass aside what he thought as one the most cherished relation of his life –the thread of creativity that connected and reconnected him with what we give a common name as Nature.

Thoreau, through his time conscious mindfulness in *Walden* (1854), the sense of living in the present moment showed to the readers, the way towards truth, towards future .He observes in the narrative lines ,“Read your fate ,see what is before you ,and walk on into futurity”(Thoreau 86).Thus Thoreau not only wrote with stark individualism of his flourishing individual self but portrayed in his work the evolution of American society and history as he is seen as a writer who is depicted as one , “embedded in the issues and controversies of mid-nineteenth-century America, a writer who cultivated his own garden yet who thought (and wrote) all the while about the intellectual movements and trends and social and political events of his era”(Cain 6).

The town concord to which Thoreau belonged to remained a living testimony to a strong relation between white settlers and Indians, as such the influence of Indians came to Thoreau’s lineage even before he was borne. The place of concord was enamored by community of farmers as such just as he learned pencil making under the tutelage of his father’s business, John Thoreau who had a factory, the farming techniques that he adopts in the chapters of *Walden* (1854) attributes to his childhood days . The cause for the individualized opinion however can be seen as begotten by Thoreau from his mother Cynthia Thoreau who remained a member of women’s anti-slavery society in Concord.

Attending school of Concord, named Concord Academy he started his education which later led him into Harvard college in 1883. There has been one instance where when Emerson asked Thoreau that his college supported and fortified various branches of study. To this the reply that he gave to Emerson sounds as a voice that was to reach a vista of perception towards a life in future and his search rather for the invisible yet important facade of life. He informs Emerson on his query, thus; “all of the branches and none of the roots” (qtd. in Cain 13).

Thus it is very much essential for us to analyze the perception he had in his life before he became a full-fledged nature writer, as to what did he mean by his emphasis on roots and what does it imply to us today and how the understanding of the lines had a different implication in his own time. Thoreau's search was for the roots, rather than the visible branches. So can this be taken as going back to the cultural existence or to primitive past, his inquisitiveness to know the root of his existence, the state where nature and humans were no different in approach as bifurcating self and other or is it the quest for rootedness of his own conscious self?

Contributions goes to writers like Cheryll Glotfelty and Harold Fromm whose work *The Ecocriticism Reader: Landmarks in Literary Ecology* (1996) is a major work that can be related with Thoreau's plight on roots rather than on mere branches. Cheryll Glotfelty and Harold Fromm suggest that the vastness and undecipherable roots and branches of environment and literary works is better left in its original form as there is an account of a person to have warned Glotfelty on the workings of system. He recounts in the book, “Systems are like wet rawhide,” he warned; “when they dry they strangle what they bind” (Glotfelty and Fromm xxii). At this point of Thoreau's life, the emphasis on roots that is hidden and invisible connects us too to that source where beyond the visible branches of our origin that structures us, differentiates human from

nature in binaries of self and other, the root, the core value or the essence remains the same. At such times it becomes evident that roots are something that is hidden and it marks the awareness that this knowledge of self and other, the experience of ecology within a body and outside has to be fastened hard with the non-visible aspects in this relationship formation between humans and non-humans that can be brought through conscious awareness.

1.8.1 Structuring Author's Work and their Society

In Henry David Thoreau's *Walden or Life in the Woods* (1854) adventure in nature and the constant search for the roots of wildness, is very much reflected. The roots, it seems was finally begotten in his Walden experience, the passage to roots that Thoreau seeks is reflected in his time spent journaling in Walden space which was later to come out as a phenomenal memoir as *Walden* (1854).

The year after Thoreau graduated from Harvard, whole scenario of the panic of 1837 emerged with economic instability for young graduate aspirants, which is said to have lasted till 1840's. This economic turbulence further waged invisible disorder in social life of people, such situations surely adhered in the young mind of Thoreau to have a closer affinity with nature, that came as a panacea to him, to replace the self-doubt and uncertainty of the age. Thoreau being born out of that time found shelter in silence and solitude of nature which he further built up in his later years as he records in his work *Walden* (1854), the relational affinity with nature. Thoreau's first entry of journal on oct 22, 1837 well affirms his newer view towards what can be seen as an affluent society, which at times is said to have been a result of inspiration from Emerson. In an account William E Cain under the title "A Brief Biography" lists all the works and writings that entered Thoreau's life and molded him inside out as a thinker and that was precursory to *Walden* (1854), he writes :

Thoreau was a relentless reader, and when gripped by a subject he showed the fervor of a true scholar in his quest for coverage and depth of information. He cherished the Greek and Roman classics ... the sacred writings of the Hindus; colonial and local histories and books and pamphlets on the North American Indian tribes; books about exploration and travel; and natural history studies and guidebooks. (Cain 19)

Thus it seems that Thoreau was a reader of a peculiar kind where his mind dipped and hungered for truth behind people's life, real people that were accounted in real life stories rather than in fictions and imaginary places . As such it is very much evident that whatever he set on his page was the account of his experience, ,unlike in works like "Yarrow Unvisited" ,where Wordsworth relies on imagination to give life to the unseen scenes of Yarrow ,the lake ,the swans and albeit the reflection ,Thoreau as a writer seems to have a better grip on reality ,a hold on reality that came up as writings in realism as *Walden* (1854). These instances were enough to prove that Thoreau was a man who set a mark different from what society held important. Just as his philosophy of life , his works too brings out sprouts of inventive outpoured ideas that were read and retained by generations.

Two years prior to his stay in Walden, the year 1843 marked Thoreau's movement to New York , it is at this instance when he encountered the robust hurry and frenzy life of New York that Thoreau felt a sense of place being disrupted and thus complains in his journal of sept 24, "Who can see these cities and say that there is any life in them? I walked through New York yesterday— and met with no real or living person"(qtd. in Cain 23). Thus a positional need for space with nature was very much reflected in Thoreau's life of which came as his stay in Walden from July 4,1845-september 6,1847.

In this relation one can see that if When Donald Worster takes Joachim Radkau's *The Age of Ecology* (2014) as the aftermath of the creation of the atomic bomb ,for Rachel Carson, the American marine biologist the beginning of the realized threat to nature is heralded with the threat caused by pesticides which is documented in confronting book to chemical industrialized growth titled *Silent Spring* (1962) .David R Foster in a similar note pictures Thoreau's arrival as ecological concernist as a result of a time of which he writes:

When Thoreau set up temporary residence in the cabin of his own making on Emerson's land at Walden Pond, the New England landscape was near its peak of deforestation and was being farmed and used as intensively as it has even been ... This was the landscape that Thoreau studied, documented, and reflected on during his daily walks. (Foster 12)

While his work *A Week on the Concord and Merrimack Rivers* (1849) seems to have been come up as an account of his travel of two weeks ,along concord and Merrimack rivers with his brother John in 1839.Thoreau's *Walden* (1854) in a similar manner is chaptered as an outcome of his experience of two years where if he could see pond in the first year ,he studied forth in subsequent year , ponds in the frozen winter state ,thus *Walden* (1854) accounts for more than words they are practical record of his life as well as the evolving nature in record.

Thoreau has structured *Walden* (1854) into well formed eighteen chapters, each chapter being a record of his experience in Walden where living in the same solitary place, taking habitation in a homespun cabin he weaves his experience into philosophical renderings. Each chapter has its own peculiar perception towards nature and life ,they are conscious ponderings of a man who in an attempt to record life amidst nature records personal evolution ,the one that seeks to see and partake in its

evolutionary change by symbiotic existence .The eighteen chapters are titled “Economy” , “Where I Lived, and What I Lived For” , “ Reading” , “Sounds”, “Solitude”, “Visitors”, “The Bean-Field” , “The Village”, “The Ponds”, “Baker Farm”, “Higher Laws” , “Brute Neighbors”, “House-Warming”, “ Inhabitants and Winter Visitors”, “Winter Animals” , “The Pond in Winter” , “Spring” and “Conclusion”.

Walden (1854) thus becomes a narrative of life that he framed through his stay and study of a place for a span of two years ,where in comes his dual vision ,his perception of binaries and dualities to revelation . In regard to the composition of *Walden* (1854), critics finds a closer use of memory by Thoreau in depiction of Walden experience where in his first encounter with the Pond is said to have been not of his stay of two years in Walden but “dates to 1822 or 1823 when he was a five- year old child”(Thorson 233) and as he affirms in the start of his narrative in chapter “Economy”:

When I wrote the following pages, or rather the bulk of them, I lived alone, in the woods, a mile from any neighbour, in a house which I had built myself, on the shore of Walden Pond, in Concord, Massachusetts, and earned my living by the labour of my hands only. I lived there two years and two months. At present I am a sojourner in civilized life again. (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 3)

Thus ,Thoreau structures his memoir by binding a great emphasis on memory in the lane of reminiscences and pictures Walden experience in a recuperated form ,that rituals his several visits to the place before journaling the account of his stay as *Walden* (1854).Robert M. Thorson in *Walden’s Shore* (2014) analyses much elaborately under the chapter title “Writing Walden”, how many of the passages more so the metaphors Thoreau alludes in *Walden* (1854) are not of his actual stay of two years but rather of

his prior visits of the place ,thus structuring *Walden* (1854) as a recollection of the whole Walden experience prior to 4th of July ,1854. Robert M. Thorson thus notes, “some of *Walden*’s most lyrical metaphors had been imagined, shared with lecture audiences, and published more than a decade before the lake was profaned by railroad construction. These idealized visual remembrances from 1841 may have been the ones Thoreau wrote about in 1854” (Thorson 234).

Thus writers often decipher a close relation of the origin of the work *Walden* (1854) with his Journals. In fact there are critics who even adhere to the fact that Thoreau never wrote a separate copy of Walden experience but he journaled and recorded his experience of Walden space as one account , not adhering to the two year time frame .Thus undoubtedly if it can be said that every written or oral tradition has a source ,for Thoreau indeed ,the tradition of nature writing was preserved in no other way but in the written account of his Journal that recorded both monumental and non monumental events of his life .The evolution of *Walden* (1854) and its formulation ,thus traces us back to his Journal which steps our understanding of the text as he steps his art of narration .He thus writes in his Journal ,“It is the height of art that on the first perusal plain common sense should appear— on the second severe truth— and on a third beauty— and having these warrants for its depth and reality, we may then enjoy the beauty forever more” (qtd. in Thorson 239).

The work of Lobsang P. Lhalungpa’s *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) likewise accounts for chapters that has serialized the life of Milarepa from first chapter that accounts for the time of Milarepa’s birth, the second chapter titled “Youth” looks at the transition and the circumstance that comes up in this transition from childhood to adulthood ,the third chapter “Misdeeds” likewise recounts the actions he took after being instigated by his mother to take vengeance against his uncle and aunt for robbing

them of their hereditary wealth for which he studies black magic. War through spells and black magic seems to be very much dominant part of the then Tibet, which one can find in the retort of Milarepa's uncle and aunt, "if you are many, make war on us. If you are few, cast spells." (Lhalungpa 20). It speaks of a time where black arts were not a feared negative knowledge but rather an esoteric knowledge which were used by prominent teachers as one of the branches of learnings for, they never misused it for material gain and as such only after listening to the wrong doing done to Milarepa's family and affirming the truth by sending a student to Milarepa's place that the teacher teaches him the complete knowledge of black magic.

It is after these retributed actions, by being a killer that Milarepa's search for dharma comes forth as an outcome of his realization of his ill deeds that led to not only death of thirty five humans but several death were recounted for, of animal, particularly livestock. Like an appropriate bildungsroman account, Lhalungpa succinctly chapters the work in chronological manner till we reach the ninth chapter which has the account of Milarepa's nirvana.¹⁴

In the structural beginning of *The Life of Milarepa* (1997), Rechungpa awakes in a land of Ugyen which is described as "a great city where houses were built and tiled with precious material."¹⁵ The inhabitants of this city were of enchanting beauty, dressed in silk and adorned with ornaments of bone and precious stones. They did not speak, but only smiled joyfully and exchanged glances" (Lhalungpa 9). It is in this dream that Rechungpa is cued that he should consider to ask Milarepa to narrate his life story. When he awakens from the dream, the impact of the dream had been great on conscious

¹⁴Nirvana, a state that is explored in terms of cessation of desire or as Lhalungpa writes in the Introduction of *The Life of Milarepa*, it is "the understanding of Samsara", where Samsara is the cycle of reiterated births and deaths (Lhalungpa xix).

¹⁵Ugyen or Urgen is a place that is believed to be an abode for deities, a land spiritual and sacrosanct.

self of Rechungpa and just as Sigmund Freud writes that dream does not say things rather it shows things, in a similar manner Rechungpa is cued to request for the life story of Milarepa for the sake of listeners and future sentient beings.

Just as Thoreau in *Walden* (1854) brings forth the motive behind writing the work in chapter “Where I Lived, and What I Lived For” as, “I do not propose to write an ode to dejection, but to brag as lustily as chanticleer in the morning, standing on his roost, if only to wake my neighbours up” (Thoreau 65). In case of Jetsun Milarepa, it was the absence of Milarepa that instigated writers to compile his biography where, “Milarepa’s death brought with it a biographic birth, and soon the yogin’s followers repeated and rewrote the life, copying stories or drawing upon new accounts” (Quintman 2). Just like Post-Modern fragmentation there stood now the attempt of his students and followers to make a grand narrative of the person, the celebration thus somehow occurred after fragmentation, which came to dismantle the myth Milarepa was, to creation of a more substantial history that would flow out to the readers for generations.

Thus, like a phoenix arising from its ashes, the written records like *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) is where Milarepa comes to us in flesh and blood as his orally transmitted songs reached the pinnacle with the biographical tunings, as his autobiographical oral narration turned to accounts fragmented yet mapped together as on complete life story. As such the analysis of the life of Milarepa is not alone a study of a perception of a person but to a macrocosmic level it is an individual’s independent story who, breaking the common threats of society-oriented boundaries walks past to live a life of solitude amidst nature, a conscious choice made by a free man on the snow-clad region of Tibet.

In dating the origin of Milarepa's biography, credit is often transferred to work of Tsangsmyon Heruka who was later identified by E. Gene Smith in the year 1969. Tsangsmyon Heruka,¹⁶ referred as "Mad Yogi of Tsang" is said to have been the real compiler of both the biography of Milarepa and his hundred thousand songs. Francis V. Tiso in a journal article titled "The Biographical Tradition of Milarepa: Orality, Literacy and Iconography", writes on the actual date of the composition of eleventh century yogi's biographer as one who "was in the lineage of Raschung pa, but compiled the biography in 1488 and completed the song collection in 1507, nearly 375 years after the death of Milarepa"(Tiso 10).

In the biographical tradition of Milarepa, the first address of Milarepa to western world likewise is said to have been made by Jacques Bacot with a book titled *Le Poete Tibetain Milarepa* (1925). The life story of Milarepa has now been translated and retranslated in many languages and in varied titles with works like *Liberation in One lifetime :Biographies and Teachings of Milarepa* (2010) by Francis V .Tiso, *The Yogi and the Madman* (2013), *Tibet's Great Yogi Milarepa* (1928) , *Vita di Milarepa*(1488). Likewise when one turns to the significance of the current translation made by Lhalungpa it hails its origin to this French version of Milarepa's biography where a resolve was made to add the final chapter ,which was not included in the French version of the biographical tradition, thus having in this translation of Lhalungpa ,the complete chapter that was fostered forth with the addition of the chapter "Nirvana". The importance of the current translation by Lhalungpa also lies in the fact that the translator Lobsang P. Lhalungpa ,he himself hailed from Lhasa thus had reached a point where

¹⁶Tsangsmyon Heruka , the word heruka is a title of reverence to Tsangsmyon which can be broken down into three parts , "he", "ru" and "ka" where "*he* signifies the intrinsic emptiness of all causes, *ru* stands for the intrinsic emptiness of all effects ,and *ka* signifies the emptiness that lies at the very nature of all things", Tsangsmyon or Tsangnyon on the other hand comes from the place of his origin ,as he originated from the place Tsang and "nyonpa" implies madman thus he was called the religious madman of Tsang . (Lhalungpa,206-207).

he was a connoisseur of Tibetan literature , especially Tibetan Buddhist Literature under which also comes the biography of the saint of Tibet, Milarepa .To add to this his knowledge of Tibetan script fostered the luminous Translator's note that marks adequate explanation of esoteric words to the western readers , thus making the biography more alluring and in the literary context more diverse in meaning .

Now moving on to the analysis of the society of 11th Century Tibet And 19th Century America, a great deal of information with regard to the author and his work can be brought foreword through the study of society of the time and more so with the response of the respective individuals to the then society. Massimo A. Rondolino in "Prolegomena to a Comparative Reading of 'The Major Life of St. Francis' and 'The Life of Milarepa.'" , writes:

Narrative parallels can be detected across traditions, and the question arises whether these apparent similarities in the creation of such religious life stories across cultures, space, and time reflect actually similar doctrinal and political agendas ...in other words, is the writing of spiritual lives a phenomenon that is contextual to a specific religious tradition, or is it rather a particular human response to given social and historical circumstances? (Rondolino 163)

Great emphasis is often laid on the response of an individual towards its society, for the contrast in perception of the individual against the collective society broadens the understanding of the age and the society of the time. Jetsun Milarepa and Henry David Thoreau followed individualism as a trial of their life far from society where in case of Thoreau, he spent years more than two years in Walden, Milarepa likewise decided to devote his remaining life to asceticism, thus the response of these individuals towards social bonds will be studied and brought in parallelism in the comparative study to foreground the research .

Self-Realization amidst economy of society - The society of Tibet however collective it might be, it still made space for those who turned to self-realization in life. We thus have a reference to the time of Milarepa where people had liberty either to choose monastic duties and in return get the teachings while others wanted to find enlightenment and know life outside the collective institutionalised arena by forsaking every possible bonds. *Drinking the Mountain Stream: Songs of Tibet's Beloved Saint, Milarepa* (1995) rightly exemplifies this, “In the Tibet of Milarepa's day as in India before that, there was social acknowledgment and even respect for the pursuit of self-realization” (Rinpoche and Cutillo 4).

As literary works are written in a particular time, the study of author's writings thus shed a great light to ideas shared by society of the time and the response of the reader or listener on receiving the practical writing does come as a formidable point in the analysis of historical events as Sofia Boesch Gajano writes how writing on life story of saints is “conscious instruction of historical memory of a given reality” (qtd. in Rondolino 165). The story of Milarepa seems to bring various assemblages of symbols with the culture laying a greater emphasis on symbolic significance, thus when Milarepa arrives at Ngokpa's place,¹⁷ his action is such that he has been reciting some verses which is symbolic of Milarepa's future as a great spontaneous singer. The verses that Ngokpa sang before the arrival of Milarepa has been translated as :

I am the Master of the Dharma.

I am the Assembly of the Hearers.

I am the Master of the Universe and the Object of Realization.

I am the Conditioned and the Unconditioned.

¹⁷Ngokpa is taken as one of the disciples of Marpa lochwa and being disciple of Marpa, the wife of Marpa decides to send Milarepa to Ngokpa's place.

I am the Innate Nature of Spontaneous Bliss. (Lhalungpa 61-62)

Thus this spontaneous bliss is to be experienced by Milarepa in near future amidst nature.

Still as a mendicant Milarepa had his own challenges in the socio-economic milieu of the time. His songs become a part of the barter system where when he demanded food from the villagers, he supplied them with the innate songs of spontaneous realization that carried both knowledge and wisdom of the time. As time passed Milarepa's songs grew into a tradition of its own, a subtle passage to reveal truth to common man, a message that is to be transferred orally and most importantly the songs became the active witnesser of the then time of Tibet, a message of its social milieu to common masses. The oral songs thus acted as an account of eleventh century Tibet, composed a history of the land of the snow, its demography to sociolinguistic evolution. It is also not surprising that Peta, the only sister and family left of Milarepa could find him when she listened to the words of the songs that were composed by Milarepa but were sung by the traders in the village when after her query on the composer of the song, she could find Milarepa.

Songs as a form of tax in Milarepa's account hints at the presence of the custom of tax in Tibet during his stay in places wherein he pays it through his songs, though not directed to forceable means like in Thoreau's own life experience that even led him to jail, an account of a society that usurps personal choices. The incident in Tibet is recounted as, "Mila ate it, and while he was preparing to leave, a monk who was there said, "Don't you know even one dedication or supplication? Can't you find even one overcoat? Where did you come from? Where are you going? If you know how, sing us a song" (Rinpoche and Cutillo 43). Milarepa in his songs thus depicts society through

his perception where he hollers that the greatest tax we should be able to pay to our human race is by cultivating independence of thought ,Milarepa thus sings his thoughts:

After leaving behind my homeland,
 I took up practice in desolate mountains.
 This mental ease and comfort of ear
 Free from talk of taxes, debts, and armies
 Was accomplished by myself, a beggar.
 Wonderful-this blissful state of affairs! (Rinpoche and Cutillo 46)

This sufficiency in economic terms is taken at times by Thoreau who emphasises that economic independence can be gained through self reliance ;a freedom devoted to higher laws of nature, to incorporate an individual's independence ,to choose to live in a manner one wants to thus he even lets out a holler against tax pay to government .

Institutionalisation of Society and Gender Perspective - While nature is often associated with women and culture with man ,what we see in Milarepa's biography is he takes neither of the thoughts into consideration ,while his sister Peta comes to him and asks him to cover up his private parts,¹⁸ she is ashamed of his parts while he never takes his parts as a part but whole body ,his sister even exclaims , “ ‘Look at him! My brother has nothing human left in him! Not only is he completely without shame, but he has also ruined the cloth that I wove with such labor.’” To this Milarepa makes a reply through his songs :

Maiden Peta, bound by false modesty.
 Listen for a moment to your brother's song.

¹⁸Peta or Peta Gonkyi is Milarepa's sister, where Gonkyi implies “Happy Protectress”. True to her name she protects Milarepa in his trails of yogi life by supplying food and essential commodities during his meditation.

You who feel ashamed through ignorance
 Blush at things which are not shameful.
 But I, a hermit, know what shame really is.
 Living normally in body, speech, and mind,
 How can discriminative shame arise?...
 Greed and hatred and evil deeds.
 Robbery, trickery, and fraud.
 The betrayal of friends,
 All these are the results of distorted perception
 And are truly shameful. But few abstain from them.(Lhalungpa 140)

Thus we seen in Milarepa no shame of his nakedness, just like the major protagonist in Margaret Atwood's *Surfacing* (1972) who finally accepts her true natural self through unveiling her worldly cloths, feels again one with nature as she says ,“I lean against a tree, I am a tree leaning”(Atwood 236).Thus Milarepa too is not ashamed of his genitals and he neither adopts masculine culture nor denounces femininity but sees his body in non-dual terms, not in parts but in wholeness. There are instances of a strong insistence on body shaming for when some ladies passes by Milarepa ,with pride they criticise him .We can trace in the criticism of these women the veil of cultural conditionings on women ,where women are quaint with chivalrousness where seeing a naked man was a crime that could pass not without criticism.

The duality however if it ever comes into Milarepa's biography occurs between a choice of institutionalization of religious vigour and free spirit of the mind .The story of Milarepa features this duality ,even Zessay speaks on dualism that the religious

practice of Milarepa is quite contrary to other religious practices of the time .¹⁹She asks him, “ ‘I have never seen a religious devotee like you. You look even worse than a beggar. What kind of Mahayana is this?’” and then affirms , “As you say, your way and theirs are quite opposite; one of them must be false. If they are both equally true, I would prefer their way to yours” (Lhalungpa 111-112).

Further, it is untrue to think that when Milarepa went against the institutionalised studies and chose to adopt his individualised practice, he was taken positively by all ,where rather than seeing his action as a mark of independence there are instances that when he flaunted the reiterated thoughts of his time and came up as a renouncer of worldly bonds there emerged critics who questioned him ,as for that matter Peta ,his sister herself representing the society questions his way of life just as Thoreau was questioned by Emerson where Thoreau’s choice to live in solitude is seen by Emerson as a mark of aloofness .Emerson thus is said to have advised Thoreau on his mode of solitary life as, “My dear Henry, A frog was made to live in a swamp, but a man was not made to live in a swamp. Yours ever, R.” (qtd. in Cafaro 106).Peta likewise questions the life choices of her brother. She interprets the doctrines of Milarepa as :

My elder brother’s religion provides him with nothing to eat and nothing to wear... Other monks have a lama named Bari Lotsawa. They have erected a throne for him sheltered under a canopy. They dress him in fine silk and offer him tea and beer. Then his monks take up trumpets and sound them to assemble a large crowd of people who offer him gifts beyond belief. (Lhalungpa 135)

¹⁹Zessay is the lady whom Milarepa was entrusted to marry as he came of the age, but taking the path of renouncer he does not marry her ,still Zessey and Milarepa’s sister Peta provide food and comfort during his yogic practice.

Again referring to duality in the life of Henry David Thoreau and his choice between institutionalization and personal independence, there is a record of how Thoreau referred to the analysis made by Asa Gray in *Manual of Botany* wherein he relates the growth of plant in relation to growth of man. Gray analyzed a plant's growth in two directions, the vertical lines in dissected upward and downward movement, of the roots away from the lights and of a movement of the stem sprouting from the ground towards sunlight, the thought which is well encapsulated in thought process of Thoreau as he writes how, "the mind develops from the first in two opposite directions — upwards to expand in the light & air yet [o]ne half of [its] development must still be root — in the embryonic state — in the womb of nature — more unborn than at first" (qtd. in Rossi 31).

Even in the analysis of Thoreau's life and the life of Milarepa, we can see a dual movement, one towards nature outside and the other is the internal nature that is in need of inherent development. In the context of duality it is also very much pertinent to understand Thoreau's take on nature and culture before one deals elaborately with his nature perception. Thoreau's understanding of nature is not always a result of forsaking culture but the more closer he gets to know nature, the better he knows the culture and vice-versa, as in a manner in which Milarepa gets to understand his inner nature more verily when he sings of the outer nature. Thus, Thoreau exerted an inevitable importance of nature in relative connectivity of mind and matter. For him, "Man ... needs not only to be spiritualized, but naturalized, on the soil of the earth" (Porte 168).

The society of Tibet likewise seems to have laid a greater emphasis on what can be taken as emphasis on practical knowledge, the teachers like Yungton Trogyal and Yonten Gyatso are well known teachers of the time that had their basis on practical knowledge and were much renowned in comparison to lochwa or translators of the

time.²⁰ In the day of Milarepa's arrival at Marpa's region, he enquires on Marpa Lochwa but fails to get any affirmative conformation on the teacher, where in such a passage of his enquiry we have a man reply to him, " There is certainly a man called Marpa. But there is no one called great Marpa the Translator." (Lhalungpa 44). Thus it becomes evident that the popularity of a teacher in the eleventh century Tibet was based much on practical action that preceded the popularity of a teacher ,where the position of magicians had been much higher than that of the translators. We thus see in the biography ,the eleventh century Tibet that had both knowledge of occult magic as well as true literary translator's presence .Thus just like Thoreau in terms of practicality in knowledge, the society of Tibet also leaned on practicality rather than on spiritualization in terms of knowledge and skill acquisition .

Resisting Society -Milarepa's name as a renouncer and as an spiritual leader came much later in his life .His life tested him ,people detested him and he himself realizing that the search for the supreme self is more important than belonging to society of common man ,casted society and humans and travelled to experience newer knowledge among non-humans .As time passed Milarepa became more agile and determined in his meditation ,there are accounts and events narrated of how when passer-by travelling the difficult terrain came across him ,they saw him in meditative mode and thus his life was orally transmitted so much so that Tibet's idioms and phases had his inevitable presence .There are accounts of common people making idiomatic expressions as ,“In the forest the baboons and monkeys are most agile. In the barnyard the cows and sheep are most stupid. In the mountains Milarepa is the most skillful in meditation” (Rinpoche and Cutillo ix).

²⁰Yungton Trogyal that meant “terrifying conqueror” and Yonten Gyatso or “ocean of virtues” were master in casting spells and incantations.

While in the case of Henry David Thoreau, the influence of what could be called a lending hand of a friend and a guide, Ralph Waldo Emerson posited his journey of nature writing. However the guidance he took was not a mere imitation of a form but it was a helping hand who tended Thoreau's vision beyond what could be termed as Harold Bloom's "Anxiety of influence" to some greater path that was a journey that the yogi of Walden was to make by himself, to greener pastures and wilderness, which Walt Whitman saw as a "dissent –his going his own absolute road let hell blaze all it chooses" (qtd. in Cain,4-5). What could be called his Concord society, saw him as an individual that went through the tribulation of being a social introvert who went beyond the herd, a traveller that had the peculiarity for he dared to travel beyond what society termed as normal and fostered a relation with nature with a dedication that people only proposed to have within the precinct of a saunter in a garden, where if his friends "found him cranky, opinionated, difficult; some went further, calling him complacent and conceited. The people in the town thought him strange—a Harvard-educated young man who sauntered in the woods and meandered from one odd job to the next"(Cain3).

There are instances that brings out a starch individualist in his character. One such instance that has been recorded is in the public school of Concord that tested his individual notion of knowledge impartment, which can be seen in wider mode of analysis where he resigned as a teacher when he was instated upon flogging the students which in those time was seen as a better mode of knowledge impartment. It was his belief in oneself, in one's cause that lead to establishment of a private school where rather than just subjects on syllabus, what was taught was the real life adventures that could prepare a child in a manner that led to her/his overall growth, where emphasis was rather on making "maps, survey a piece of property, collect Indian relics, and see the landscape with alertness and insight" (Cain 20).

Likewise, the account of Milarepa's resistance of society and the persistent attempt of making mountains as his home also comes up to surface in the biography of Milarepa. He recounts and realizes that the sins he committed had its origin in his family albiet in society, being close to what can be termed as a familial bond he committed crimes, through his close tie with his mother and his sister. Thus he adopted criminal tendencies in no other place but in the school of society which comes in great correlation with Transcendentalists cult which takes society as a corruptible mode ,that decodes and modifies the ideal individual self .Thus the regeneration comes his way with the closer affinity with nature ,it is this sense of completeness and pure innocence that Milarepa goes in search for and comes across the translator Marpa Lochwa who instructs to Milarepa just as Emerson inspired Thoreau through his works and sometimes his words on how nature and only a closer affinity with it can finally delink the bond with and influence of society ,which led Thoreau rethink his ways of life amidst society and walked his way to wilderness of America as Milarepa trailed his path in the snow clad mountains of Tibet.

CHAPTER-II

Emulating the Green: Perceiving and Transforming the Space of Ecology

2.1 Introduction

Since the birth of Ecocriticism, there emerged varied ways of perceiving the environment, the change that had its inception in the very basic and pertinent point of perception, the change in perception that further led to a newer viewpoint in the analysis of the relation between human and the natural world which now works with yet another tool of perception that aims to sculp forth newer sustainable relation between humans and non-humans through the mode of symbiosis, the new renderings that seems pertinent in these ordained times of ecological crisis.

In the essay, “Toward a Language of Life: Ecological Identity in the Work of Kazue Morisaki”, Masami Yuki marks a great emphasis on the power of the perceiver which is taken as an important factor to analyse how one’s relation with environment changes in the context of everyday communication where the essay carries the crux of the situation as, “Environmental crisis involves a crisis of imagination ... the fate of the environment is subject to how the human mind conceives”(Estok and Kim 18). Since its inception, ecocriticism in itself has expanded as a form that is making an emergence from concept to representative praxis. Eco-consciousness is one such concept in this evolving body of ecocriticism.

Eco-consciousness comes as a major manifesto of ecological awareness across continents and culture, thus what comes along with the study of the consciousness of ecology is what has been given a major breakthrough concept in consciousness by Brander Matthew in his book *American Character* (1901) as “Planetary Consciousness”, the term wherein the change in ecology cannot be circumscribed and recorded within a particular cultural context, rather it needs an amalgamation of

planetary movement towards an understanding of our ecosystem ,the global ecosystem. Thus ,Karen Thornber observes this conscious rendering of the perception of self and other in the context of global ecology in “Afterword: Ecocritical and Literary Futures” and writes :

While cultures and environmental problems are distinctive, they are not unique, and the need to globalize ecocriticism remains acute. Precisely because damaged environments are a global phenomenon, literary treatments of ecodegradation regularly transcend their particular cultures of production and can be understood as together forming intercultural thematic and conceptual networks. (242,243)

This is where the most potent weapon of comparative literature comes forth as ,which helps analyse the environment across continents ,where the comparative study of the eco-degeneration and change in environment can be brought to analysis through this concept of planetary consciousness ,more so this concept helps one to compare landscape of two distinct time and area ,of Tibet and of America , as one relating to 11th century and the other of 19th century , comes forth to record the change in perception over ages ,not just in one country and continent but to see the perceptual shift toward ecology in global context. Analysing the biography of Milarepa and Thoreau’s *Walden* (1854) inundates the conjunctive study of the ecology and the record of ecocriticism in a global context, thus the research further aims to frame an ecocritical discourse on common grounds of ecoconscious perception by analysing these individuals through wide ecocritical spatial criticism which examines:

Literary representation not only of the places themselves, but of the experience of place and of displacement, while exploring the interrelations between lived

experience and a more abstract or unrepresentable spatial network that subtly or directly shapes it. (Tally and Battista x)

2.2 Concepts of Nature in *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) and *Walden* (1854): A Comparative Study

The comparative study between life of Milarepa and Thoreau brings to surface yet another important mode of studying nature where in a comparative analysis between these individuals emerges a pertinent point where a study is entailed on the concepts of nature from Eastern and Western philosophical viewpoints .

In the prologue to *The Life of Milarepa* (1997), there lies the lines that has a metaphor of a shoot out of the seed where addressing Milarepa, Lhalungpa pays homage to him as, “From the beginning, in the celestial space of your Dharmakaya,²¹ unclouded by ignorance ... Having tasted the nectar of the Dharma which flowed from the mouth of his lama, he liberated himself in the mountain solitude from the bondage of defilement, and shoots of awakening sprang up within him”(Lhalungpa 1,2). Thus a connection is brought forward in the biography where the shoot of a plant ,the emerging natural process comes forward in a relative relation with the start of awakening in Milarepa’s life .Here, it is not without a motive that the prologue itself is the start of the beginning of a story so much so that a shoot is a beginning of a journey of a plant’s life. The metaphor of a shoot introduces Milarepa in the prologue that further signals his future life, where he will be living rest of his life emulating the green nature. It also aptly adorns his way which is a clarion call to transit his outer space into inner engineering, from form to content, from thesis to synthesis, from obligation to liberation.

²¹Dharmakaya is where one finds the amalgamation of higher consciousness and transcendental awareness that flows through each body, where “ Analytically speaking, Dharmakaya is essentially comprised of Transcendent Awareness and its inmost nature of emptiness”(Lhalungpa xxii).

In tradition of Tibet, the guru or the teacher is given the topmost position in the hierarchy of reverence in any spiritual journey. The non-visibility of the omnipotent's presence is given a suitable representation in the form of the teacher who "is their living representative. Thus in Tibet the lama is placed first in importance even to the buddhas, for it is through him that [one] eventually meet the buddhas" (Rinpoche and Cutillo 9), further to add to this the Nature that retains the power and energy for the living likewise is given importance through the dynamics of animism or supramundane .

While for Henry David Thoreau walking and sauntering was taken as one of the best way to know Nature, Milarepa likewise took the path of Vajrayana to understand nature ,²²that helped him expand his awareness ,both internal and external, knowing Nature through constant awakening of consciousness which in itself is brought to the individual in the two way process, one as adoption and another as abnegation. This adoption comes in the life of Milarepa and Thoreau through what can be taken as the process of emulating Nature ,where Nature is addressed as a source of peaceful solitary existence and a marked phase of constant evolution and growth which in a cyclical process never ends with death of a tree as there stand the dormant seed that is yet to take a journey again. Abnegation however of things that constrains individual through institutions, written canon and universalization of opinion and perception, thus emulating nature comes via its two-way process.

When it comes to Milarepa's perception towards nature there comes a state of mind that is beyond duality .This non-duality in perceiving nature is the ultimate dharmakaya which hails to the point where his senses has been trained to come up in

²² In *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) , Lobsang P.Lhalungpa describes in the translator's note the meaning of vajra as " 'Vajra' is diamond, especially in its aspect of unbreakable hardness or solidity. In its higher meaning, Vajra connotes the intrinsic nature of enlightenment - the indestructible and inseparable union of transcendent wisdom and boundless compassion, as well as the supreme bliss and the ultimate emptiness", while the "yana" implies vehicle, the path that leads to enlightenment (207).

a unified center of consciousness .Thus Lhalungpa writes on Milarepa ,“He perceived all things as the Dharmakaya, going beyond the deceptive duality of the mind”. The idea of Dharmakaya or “The body of all things” Lhalungpa writes on is the ultimate consciousness (Lhalungpa xxii, 4). It is a state that is to be achieved, where we have a unification of all things and senses, where we see not things as existing alone but rather what we acquire in this state is through the state of togetherness, oneness and boundless correlation, where there is neither part nor whole, there is just the state of existence .

Even in regards to sounds , Milarepa is portrayed as one who could interpret sounds “who understood the essential nonduality of sound and emptiness, and who interpreted the meaning of the prophetic signs, good and evil, revealed by the inner and outer sounds of nature.” (Lhalungpa 4-5).This to a great extent implies a mode, a method he had practiced and thus received a knowledge on workings of the sounds .The internal sounds here might imply the mechanics of the body, the external refers to the solitude that nature provides to the contemplative listeners like Thoreau and Milarepa. It extends to the echo of the caves to the sounds of birds and flights of eagles at prey , thus one can at this state perceive the invisible and intangible .

Here the Eastern perception is brought out as a mode of representation that is more about the study of depth in human’s relation with nature which however is to be molded in the frame of conscious perception rather than just delving on surface reality, where emulating nature implies internal change and not alone the external connection that West perceives nature for , in the mode of aesthetic beauty that we often see in the awe of John Keats “Ode to a Nightingale” or in William Wordsworth’s “Lines Written a Few Miles above Tintern Abbey”

Though there has been various instances in *Walden* (1854) where we see the influence of external environment to the workings of inner ecology of Thoreau so much

so that the same environment at times successfully fosters variety of perceptual change in his outlook, in contrast to Thoreau, Milarepa however takes the external environment and the emancipation of natural habitat as no different from inner engineering ,he often emphasizes on what can be called as prominence of inner perception that leads to the change of external nature as he is one, “who understood all external phenomena to be internal phenomena of the mental world, then discovered the mind itself as being lucid awareness, unborn and empty”(Lhalungpa 5).

Thus the Eastern perception towards nature indirectly lays a great emphasis on consciousness, where nature ‘ out there’ is the culminative result of nature ‘in here’. However, it would also be equivocal to term this phenomena as one way process alone, from internal to external influences for if relation with nature was about inner perception alone than the teacher of Milarepa would not instruct him to go to mountains, particularly for solitude. The translator Marpa well knowing the positive effects of nature on humans ,acknowledging eco-consciousness instructs Milarepa :

Take refuge in the solitude of the barren mountains, the snows, or the forests.

In the solitude of the mountains there is Gyalgyi Sri (Glorious Victory) of Lato, which has been blessed by the greatest saints of India. Go there to meditate ...

Meditate in every other favourable solitary place. (Lhalungpa 94)

Further, during the time of Milarepa, the perception towards nature was one about reverence where the rarity in any incident was correlated in significance with natural phenomenon and natural elements . In the biographical narration of Milarepa , when Lama Ngokpa receives the rosary of Naropa from Milarepa he compares its rarity with Udumbra which is an auspicious flower.²³ Thus the preciousness of the holy objects

²³There is an elaboration in the translator’s note on Udumbra by Lobsang P. Lhalungpa as , “According to Tibetan literature, a very rare lotus of fabulous color, immense size, and unmatched fragrance” (Lhalungpa 212).

were related with the pureness of flower borne out of nature ,one that equals in comparison .It also suggest as to how in Tibetan literature ,the non-human acquires a place not just of equality with humans but they surpasses this position. Nature is not only worshipped and paid reverence in Tibetan culture but its position and role is always uphold higher than whole humanity .Thus one can recall the significance paid to the bodhi tree whose generous shade on the greatest yogi of lifetime, Lord Buddha is accounted for generations .The Eastern perception of nature especially Tibet of eleventh century also laid great emphasis on senses, when failing to acquire the teachings from Marpa, Milarepa tries to kill himself, it is here that Lama Ngokpa lay great emphasis on senses and consoles Milarepa and says, “ Worthy Great Magician, not that! According to the most secret teachings of the Buddha, the faculties and the senses of each of us are innately divine. If you die before your time, you commit the sin of killing a god.” (Lhalungpa 70). Thus this great emphasis laid on senses implies how one’s existence and understanding of self and other needs a faculty of sense perception that can be used to generate consciousness, consciousness of oneself, of Nature and of oneself in Nature.

In the caves where Milarepa dwells there is a record of existence of lions and leopards where all these external aspects renders one conspicuous of the wilderness where solitude is frequented no less often .In non -western perception of nature ,the earth itself is seen as a witnesses of the awakened consciousness .Often there goes the story how buddha ,the enlightened one touched the land and took it as witnesses to his victory over evil .This personification given to the land comes up as a foreseer ,brings out the importance given to ecology from Tibetan perspective of nature , that in itself marks up the importance of the land not solely in value based on utilities but beyond the utilities’ as formulated by deep ecologist that often defer on nature’s role in value

relation to humans .In the East even the natural elements are given great importance, where natural elements like the sun and the moon are brought as representor of the higher consciousness.

In the mode of conferencing ideas, Thoreau's writing process and Milarepa's itinerant songs can be studied to devise a relative relation between nature writing and the landscape perception in their respective domains. Thoreau writing *Walden* (1854) within the precinct of Walden pond is what Aldo Leopold sees as an experiment with the animal life which comes under a "home range", within the precinct of Walden space and Milarepa's travels in a similar context can be related with this range where animals keep a safety distance, a precinct that confers safety to the inhabitator. Comparatively, Milarepa's home range in comparison to Thoreau's stay near Walden pond goes beyond the way of return. Aldo Leopold in his work *A Sand Country Almanac and Sketches Here and There* (1949), in the chapter "Homerange" writes on this familiarity with the land which makes up the homerange, thus if the rabbit's "homerange is at least a quarter mile in extent [and the] flock is half a mile across in winter" (Leopold).

Thoreau's field and his cabin has a home range and so does his culminative writing style. The home range of Thoreau is taken up to be bounded up by Walden space that he beholds and which comes as a fixed area of analysis , it is not any other place but it has a name ,a place of identification that he alludes to in his writing pattern,where his perception of nature is one that is not wild and unknown .His works like "Natural History of Massachusetts"(1842),"A Walk to Wachusett"(1843),"A Week on the Concord and Merrimack Rivers"(1849) "The Maine Woods"(1864), "Cape Cod"(1865) and for that case even *Walden; or, Life in the Woods* (1854) justifies this,which are some of the few works written on a place that is known and that finds a record in the historical map unlike Milarepa's place where all the songs that he creates

situates not one place alone rather it is the feeling of itinerancy that often makes it impossible to record this home range which is the eastern aesthetic that marks the unbroken line between life and writing, life that holds not in one place but flows like the pace of stream to an undecipherable destination, while Thoreau's perception of nature at times is framed on western lineage as he takes no unknown entity of nature in his premises .

Thoreau's thought on nature is well reflected in his essay *Walking* (1862) as he writes, "in Wildness is the preservation of the World" (Thoreau, *Walking* 75), which comes in nonconformity with the deep ecologist as we ought to see in these lines a reflection of nature's existence for humans. With the transition in age the word environment itself stands now synonymous of anthropocentric origin. As such the formation of new environmental conscience remains a dubious perception where nature is seen as a commodity of preservation, preservation however for the sole sake of human existence which marks for the advent of neo anthropocentric cult where humanity's preservation ensues environmental preservation, where people have set out to preserve Nature as is 'required' and not as an agreement of symbiotic existence.

In early 1960's another critic, Walter Harding took the essay *Walking* (1862) to foresee a cultural trend, a cast of the ethnicity in environmental landscape where it "becomes almost chauvinistic in boasting the superiority of the American landscape". Thus it is not without a crutch of culture that informs the landscape of Thoreau ,it has a paradoxical bifurcating situation where Thoreau is drawn to , thus the one task that lays before him is to foresee the landscape beyond the cultural prefix ,to see landscape outside the authority of human naming of the place as either American landscape or non-American landscape .This dilemma further signals his current situation where his cultural recognition of Americanness comes to him before he naturalises the place.

David Robinson enforces this dilemma as he makes a suggestion that Thoreau's perception of nature and the perception of wildness "is inextricably bound up with the historical tragedy of the American West and the continuing ecological tension, particularly acute in the West, between the desire to preserve the wild and the desire to make use of it." While another critic Robert D. Richardson anticipates this relation otherwise as, "not an affirmation of the westward march of civilization [but rather] what is wild within us" (qtd. in Schneider , "Climate does" 45).

Still the western influence on Thoreau can be seen well beyond the landscape he inhabits, it is also the literature of the time that framed his thinking process alongside the writing process. Most influenced by the book of his century *The Earth and the Man* (1850) of Arnold Henry Guyot (1807-1884) ,critics often marks the influence of the geographer of the swiss American origin on Thoreau's thought and his writings , particularly the influence of Guyot's work *The Earth and Man: Lectures on Comparative Physical Geography in Its Relation to The History Of Mankind* (1850) .In the work ,Arnold emphasise on how temperate climatic conditions gives one a better prospect of movement and survival .To this Thoreau might have seen a prospective relation between climate change and alteration in sense faculty of man .Thus he records in *Walden* (1854), his writing from winter to spring ,he records the same pond and configures this process from "Ponds" to "Ponds in winter". He writes in *Walden* (1854):

The life in us is like the water in the river. It may rise this year higher than man has ever known it, and flood the parched uplands; even this may be the eventful year, which will drown out all our muskrats. It was not always dry land where we dwell. I see far inland the banks which the stream anciently washed, before science began to record its freshets". (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 258 -259)

Thoreau ponders at this locational change and writes in his essay *Walking* (1862), “The eastern Tartars think that there is nothing west beyond Thibet. ‘The world ends there,’ say they; ‘beyond there is nothing but a shoreless sea.’ It is unmitigated East where they live” (Thoreau, *Wild Apples* 70). If this account is taken into consideration then Tibet and its harsh environment on the other side of the world, can be taken as unsuitable place that would hinder the possession of possible lofty faculties in regard to the rugged terrain of Tibet, especially the Tibet of Milarepa which is known for its ruggedness with its countless natural caves, but the variety of songs that Milarepa composes in the place itself counters the notion of advancement and regression, regeneration and degradation of place in a certain climatic condition.

Still, Thoreau both as a perceiver and as an artist tries to go beyond culture but his very pre-conceived notion of nature comes to forefront in how he adjusts the lens of vision in his way of foreseeing nature. The adjusting range comes up as the range of cultural and personal rendering that helps the looker view the nature. As such both Milarepa and Thoreau coming up from different time period and hailing from different cultural background adjusted it inevitably in their personal approach to nature. We see in Thoreau how though our preconceived notions on a subject or an object is influenced by our time, by our age and sometimes by the contemporary trends as we see Thoreau as “an artist having incorporated common nineteenth-century cultural conceptions of nature into his own experience of nature” (Smithson 99), he still marks a transition in nature perception in his writings by conceiving a different approach of a same phenomenon.

Thus, while the East brings forth the closer relation between man and nature as conscious awareness and use of sense faculty, the Western perception at times takes nature outward as the nature in wholeness, while the eastern perception often accounts

for the relation of nature “out there” and nature “in here”, where often the internal turmoil is reflected in external and vice-versa, the account that can be set as an example is the use of natural elements in *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) where the nature turns out to personify the vengeance on Milarepa’s uncle and aunt’s wrong doings with the play of natural elements of clouds, thunder and hail. Thus through this Milarepa also incurs the darker side of nature thus acknowledging the two dual role of nature where if nature could harvest and feed humans, it could also destroy humans by debarring them of the food, where with this knowledge of duality he spends his youth.

In analysing the perception of West towards ecology, Thoreau’s work can be analysed which has had a greater influence of the European concepts that reigned and weighted American vision till first half of nineteenth century. The European model of aesthetic view and notions seeped even into the American culture, which is well reflected in the writings of American writers, especially Thoreau’s contemporaries. Among the influences, the two primary shifts that made into American everyday life views were picturesque and sublime. Thus, nineteenth century was a time when writers like “Thoreau saw the American landscape through European theories and discussed local landscape aesthetics with European terminology”(Smithson 100). This philosophical interpretation of nature as such commanded alignment from the theories that moulded their individualised philosophy of nature.

Thoreau however had already embarked on his journey of learning Greek and Roman classics at Harvard, his love for literature was not bounded by genre or generational work readings, religion or stoicism. He read all books and chose his influences well for he chose the time tested philosophers that would not be belatedly kept in old books but he rather awed these rusty bindings, the storehouse of knowledge that could be recycled by newer generations, as William Gilpin (1724-1804), the

English artist and the writer who himself had marked a great influence on Thoreau, writes in *Observations on the River Wye* (1782), “Nature is always great in design; but unequal in composition”(qtd. in Smithson 100). The notion of Gilpin thus comes to mark nature as both sublime and picturesque , where if at one point it is a mystery for it is a greater design that not all can imitate and understand, the inequality in composition implies the picturesque irregularity.

Just so is Thoreau’s perception of nature where the inequality in composition is marked in his works and his perception towards nature which is metaphoric to the vision of differed views that never comes as a match with oneness of perceived object by all individuals where each perceiver’s perception can never equal the other perceiver’s perceiving power hence nature will always be defined unequally. Thoreau at times talks about the dissipation of perception as he takes a note of this on chapter “Solitude” of *Walden* (1854) as, “We are not wholly involved in Nature. I may be either the driftwood in the stream, or Indra in the sky looking down on it. I may be affected by a theatrical exhibition; on the other hand, I may not be affected by an actual event which appears to concern me much more” (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 104).

The genre of Milarepa’s songs and oral stories and Thoreau’s prose style also has a narrow lane of distinction and a subtle line that camps and aligns them with nature perception of picturesque and sublime. While Milarepa’s description of mountainous region ,the narrow path to the cave and the way down the village in biography of Milarepa all suggest the ruggedness and irregularities that comes close to picturesque,it however at the same time has sublimity in its story, sublime scene which features “ominous mountain, mysterious valley, crashing sea, or threatening thunderclouds. Terror, wonder, and awe are elicited by a sublime landscape”, all of which becomes a part of Milarepa’s story (Smithson 101).

The terror at days of rainfall that Milarepa causes in a village through his black magic brings nature in Tibet close to wonder in terror, wherein the process of terror later serves a mode of spiritual awakening as has been brought down by Isaiah Smithson as to how the sublimity of landscape is “for sensitive viewers, the result is spiritual insight, such as realization of the diminished role of humans within the natural world’s geologic past and present grandeur”, Thoreau’s *Walden* (1854) on the other hand is more picturesque than sublime for he portrays in his passage the “individualized natural forms, and ruins or some other vestiges suggesting past human habitation”. Another point in view of the landscape of the 11th century Tibet and 19th century America also comes in the terrain where in the mountainous region of Tibet, the human form almost diminishes while in the counterpart, *Walden* (1854) of Thoreau “human figures are more likely to appear at peace with their physical surroundings” (Smithson 101).

As such nature perception to a great extent sees a relation with the landscape that the writer or the viewer seeks to undertake. The peacefulness of the Walden pond is not a terror to Thoreau while the ridges of Tibet are. The very mode of path that translators like Marpa took to India are recounted with fatal journeys across Tibet, the deadly trials of acquiring knowledge, while Thoreau on the other hand had solace and peace of the stationary cabin space as he wrote *Walden* (1854), thus the manner of his depiction of nature comes closer to beauty and awe.

Again coming to the geographical landscape one can refer to Guyot’s depiction of the American landscape, when America was taken as possessor of Atlantic coastline, thus possessor of two powerful oceans as it exist in a middle ridge playing “a part as mediator between the two extremities of the world” (qtd. in Schneider 51). Here the middle position of America further can be seen in the life of Thoreau itself where

avoiding extreme asceticism and extreme social indulgence the spot of Walden becomes a path that provides to Thoreau a middle path , non-extreme life .Thus this middle path, the *medias res* can also be addressed in the narrative of *Walden* (1854) as the way of de-emphasising any extremity ,²⁴neither extreme work of enlightened being based on morality nor the life of a stoic anti-social individual that carries forth the dislike for society but what often we come across in *Walden* (1854) is a *sui generis* diverging into two poles with a similar velocity ,²⁵thus to a great extent the influence of the landscape can undoubtedly be seen in nature perception as well as genre formation of Henry David Thoreau and Jetsun Milarepa. With the two world between anthropocentrism to biocentrism ,Thoreau adopts a way of truce and hails a path that assimilates both of these attributes ,where both Western and Eastern perceptual notions on Nature is assimilated in his writing .Sometimes he uses his anthropocentric view point to bring better understanding of the hidden colors of nature while at times he writes about nature adjusting his eco-centric viewpoint ,thus bringing forth the assimilation of both androcentric contrast of perception with ecocentrism in edge.

However still in the comparative study of Thoreau's memoir *Walden* (1854) and Milarepa's biography, though various difference occurs in the nature perception , yet what one finds at the end the contrary positions of these individuals is rather a complementary assuage than contradictory outcome of nature understanding .William Blake brings forth the relationship of contraries impeccably in *The Marriage of Heaven and Hell* (1794) which is analogous to the relation of Thoreau and Milarepa as, "without contraries is no progression".

²⁴ *Medias res*, the Classical Latin word which connotes "in the middle of the things" has been used in the lines to suggest the non extreme path followed by Thoreau in *Walden* as his understanding of nature ,in the midst of nature is not engraved as the extremity of renouncer for we see him actively engaging in his everyday life in Walden space ,plodding fields and philosophy together.

²⁵*Sui generis*, a Latin phrase that implies uniqueness and one that has peculiarity of its own kind.

Thus in the comparative study of the perception of East and West what one comes to realise keeping Thoreau and Milarepa as microcosm of macrocosmic world of East and West is what Thoreau writes as “‘*Ex Oriente lux; ex Occidente frux*’, From the East light; from the West fruit” (qtd. in Schneider 52). This further recalls to us of Matthew Arnold’s “sweetness and light” where the communication between two unlike cultures, two cultural notions provides the advanced stage of knowledge as well as sustenance, sweetness as well as light. Here thus East and West both comes together, wherefore the relation between them works like the influence of *Bhagavad Gita* in Thoreau, which left a mark in his works like *Walden* (1854) where he writes, “In the morning I bathe my intellect in the stupendous and cosmogonical philosophy of the Bhagvat-Geeta, since whose composition years of the gods have elapsed, and in comparison with which our modern world and its literature seem puny and trivial” (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 232). Just as philosophy of East gave it all to Thoreau and just as a symbiotic relation with nature the transference of knowledge goes not unidirectional, Thoreau left the East what it had received –the influence that went on for ages. The influence on Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi being one of the major asset that still recoils the strategy of independence under what Gandhiji took and saw in works of Thoreau, the panacea to national freedom movement through adoption of civil disobedience movement, which came up as an inspiration from the essay “Civil Disobedience” (1849).

2.3 Consciousness of Ecology Through ‘Self’ and the ‘Other’

In his lecture, “Lecture on American Scenery” Thomas Cole (1801-1848) emphasis on the power of contemplation and connects it with the epiphanic realization of the relation between landscape and godliness, the “associations that he hoped would lead

Americans to identify their emerging nation with their landscape, and to contemplate freedom, goodness, and God” (qtd. in Smithson 102).

It is the vision of the viewers like Cole that sees landscape as one of the essential thing that connects goodness with godliness, this connection was often fostered by Henry David Thoreau himself in his writings where his views became profoundly ecological and ethical when his thoughts started to pen down the philosophy of his life. Landscape as such can also be seen as a part of spiritual elevation which is a process that (inside to outside channel and outer to inner flows) connects ecology within a body and ecology outside .It is the goodness that penetrates the skin to the sole soul and it is further this vision ,this experience that helps the viewer to change a perception towards the ecology viewed. Still Thoreau’s love for nature at times is seen rather as an aesthetic turn just as his perception towards vegetarianism, Thoreau’s non-eating of meat as a decision comes not as a sense of compassion neither ethical nor ecological but comes as a result of an aversion of what he sees. Milarepa on the other hand sought a greater understanding of human and non-human relation where if Thoreau , “expresses his sense of loss only in artistic terms; the absence of [the] animals diminishes the number of artistic symbols available to him in the Concord woods, but it does not jeopardize the very existence of the woods”(Schneider 6), for Milarepa it is the compassion based on empathy ,where the boundary between self and other dissolves and dissipates as he sings and see the other as one’s own parents, the pain and suffering that is similar to both self and to others :

How foolish and sad it is to indulge in killing,

When by good luck and Karma one has a human form.

How sad it is to do an act

That in the end will hurt oneself.

How sad it is to build a sinful wall

Of meat made of one's dying parents' flesh.

How sad it is to see meat

Eaten and blood flowing.

How sad it is to know confusions

And delusions fill the minds of men. (Chang 566.vol 2)

In this self and other relation ,there often arises the basic pedestal in questioning the relation between man and nature as to what can be termed as a natural human or is humanity a part of nature itself ? , if yes, then can any human action be termed natural. Laura Dassow Walls in her essay, “Believing in Nature: Wilderness and Wildness in Thoreauvian Science” questions the very existence of the trend of nature writing in scientific temper, she speculates in her thoughts as to whether, “humanity [is] a part of nature, intervening and participating in an ecological system? Or is it exempt from nature, which is pure only in the absence of human will, design, and desire?”, she further takes these questions as “related to the construction of modern science, occurring also during Thoreau’s lifetime” . Emphasizing on the Bacon’s perception of science in her discussion of Thoreau in her essay, she writes as to how “the goal of Baconian science was to show how humanity could acquire the power of God and apply such power to human purpose, to command nature” (Walls 17,19).

Thoreau however in *Walden* (1854) goes beyond the Baconian canon that set knowledge as a power to a trope where his lines on *Walden* (1854) reiterates the difference in his viewpoint from Bacon as he directs his views as to how to know nature may never mean to know by dissection but by intersectional understanding where keeping ornithology as a metaphor he wields his changed perception, his experience of years in lines as :

I carried a gun my excuse was that I was studying ornithology, and sought only new or rare birds. But I confess that I am now inclined to think that there is a finer way of studying ornithology than this. It requires so much closer attention to the habits of the birds, that, if for that reason only, I have been willing to omit the gun. (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 164)

While Thoreau's mentor Emerson ,ends "Nature"(1836) with the powerful position of man over nature, as he writes "The Kingdom of man over nature, which cometh not with observation -a dominion such as now is beyond his dream of God"(Atkinson 42), for Thoreau as well as for Milarepa the synthesis is not man over nature but man along with nature ,the study of nature in the study of man and vice versa ,thus this relation emancipates the relation of togetherness beyond the bounds of self and other relation .

In the understanding of self and other, the analysis of nature and culture can surface in relatable terms. At some instances Thoreau seeks a balance between wilderness and culture. The remedy he seeks is in a way of natural proportion, "which the night bears to the day, the winter to the summer ,thought to experience". The ethics which frames ethnicity of America to Thoreau is that of a plougher that helps the land grow,takes the role of a preserver on whose hands lay the cultivation of culture .Thoreau quotes, " It is said to be the task of the American 'to work the virgin soil'and that "agriculture here already assumes proportions unknown everywhere else"(Thoreau, "Walking" 63, 79) .When Wendell Erdman Berry ,the American poet ,novelist and culture critic sees agriculture as a phenomenon where "nature and culture are married"(qtd. in Olson 61) Milarepa and Thoreau too assimilates this opinion in their life as one can see how when Milarepa thinks of the fields ,he thinks of his culture ,he gives up the field as it connects him to the very basis of past existent life of a common farmer in possession of the land , a commodity .Likewise in the review of Robert B.

Ekvall on “The message of Milarepa by Humphry Clarke”, he writes on how Tibetan culture emphasizes on two things of whose importance and influence are ingrained in their life .He writes on Milarepa and Tibet ,“nature and religion -lie deep in the Tibetan’s spirit and are constantly reflected in his [Milarepa’s] attitudes and reactions. He lives with nature in tender intimacy ,knowing its wildest moods yet charmed and comforted by its splendour ”(Ekvall 360).

This consciousness of culture as well as its changing relation with nature is often reflected in Thoreau’s work *Walden* (1854) where we see merging together of the past and present in his conscious perception where just as T.S Eliot marks tradition as a molding rod that takes all formations of ‘what is’ , ‘what was’ and ‘what will be’ into a proclivity of possible coupling ,Thoreau often see and writes on nature on what he imagines , he often accounts what could he have missed in the position of coming later to his ancestors ,he records every moment of nature transformation in cultural circumference as he blatantly writes in his journal , “I take infinite pains to know all the phenomena of the spring . . . thinking that I have here the entire poem, and then, to my chagrin, I hear that it is but an imperfect copy that I possess and have read, that my ancestors have torn out many of the first leaves and grandest passages”(qtd. in Schneider 6).

In *Walden* (1854) Thoreau even talks of relation with animals in terms of symbolic representation, where every human form contains an element of animal liturgy. He thus writes in *Walden* (1854), “We are conscious of an animal in us, which awakens in proportion as our higher nature slumbers. It is reptile and sensual, and perhaps cannot be wholly expelled; like the worms which, even in life and health, occupy our bodies. Possibly we may withdraw from it, but never change its nature”. (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 170). Thus, consciousness is presented as an

evolving worm in our body, in our self-realization which is constantly present in our being, living and inevitably changing. This assimilating relation of self with animals is also brought to near reality in *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) where when Milarepa is made by Marpa to work hard and build stone building many times, in the process he incurs a soar on his back which according to the wife of Marpa was never seen in a man's back ever. She reveals her thought that only in the backs of animals; horses and donkeys has she seen a brutal bruises. She thus says to Marpa :

Lama Rimpoche, the work Great Magician is doing has skinned and rubbed all his limbs raw. On his back are three sores streaming with blood and pus. I have heard of, and even seen, horses and donkeys with sores on their backs, but I have never yet seen, nor heard of, such sores on the backs of men... Because he is truly worthy of compassion, give this child instruction. (Lhalungpa 54)

The narrative somehow takes us to the sense of empathic level where all living beings are seen to possess commonality in terms of pain. Thus we see here no difference between Milarepa, a horse and a donkey, all have incurred pain due to the weight impounded on them. Thus bringing forth all in one position .

The aspect of self and other can be studied with the metaphor and analogy of plant's growth that is brought out symbolically in the narrative of Milarepa's biography and Thoreau's *Walden* (1854) .The proper evolution of body and mind seems to be the objective of any natural, human or vegetation growth .A study of Asa Gray's *Manual of the Botany of the Northern United States* (1848) truly accounts how Thoreau could have related an inevitable corelative functioning in the life of a plant and a human being. Gray's emphasis on first the growth of the plant and the second emphasis on fruitification comprises of moral and intellectual growth to fruitification wherefore,

“There is no doubt a perfect analogy between the life of the human being and that of the vegetable—both of the body & the mind.”(qtd. in Rossi 30).

It implies that the first of the task in human growth should signify the growth of stabilization, familiarization and consciousness of the place, intertwined commitment with the place .After the first process ,the dynamics of work transcends towards contribution .This relation with the place preludes both in and after songs of Milarepa which recounts for first a culmination of thought process in himself which is fostered by a relation with the habituated land which then flowered as fruition in the form of spontaneous songs that comes up as a result of conscious familiarity with the place. Thoreau’s sense of relation with nature came in a similar manner with first pronouncing the adjacent sense of belonging to a place ,the ‘ other’ that is brought to ‘self’, the rootedness that later flowers in his lines of *Walden* (1854). Thus, *Walden* (1854) at once becomes a result of transition taking place in perception of a place as other to self ,a fruition that emerge as a name and a magnificent work as *Walden or Life in the Woods* (1854) .

In this context ,a study of reference of Lhalungpa on Milarepa can be studied to delve forth on nature emulation where he writes that Milarepa “sowed seeds of awakening in the consciousness of sentient beings and brought these seeds to full blossom”(Lhalungpa 200),thus the seeds became the embryogenesis of the authentic spontaneous songs which coming out of Milarepa also indicates a sort of a cult which nears Thoreau and the transcendentalist that gives emphasis on self-culture ,self-expansion, individual rather than collective. Just as the understanding of a place goes via the lane of singular deviated thought processes, Transcendentalists took true self as something that is not influenced and tainted by society and its rules of normality. To this, one can formulate a principal where we see the peculiarity of each individual

perception is the uncorrupted sense of being as Thoreau resolves in *Walden* (1854) to grow seeds of virtue as he affirms to grow:

Not plant beans and corn with so much industry another summer, but such seeds, if the seed is not lost, as sincerity, truth, simplicity, faith, innocence, and the like, and see if they will not grow in this soil, even with less toil and manurance, and sustain me, for surely it has not been exhausted for these crops”(Thoreau , *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 127).

Isaiah Smithson however in “Thoreau ,Thomson ,Cole and Asher Durand :Composing the American Landscape”, brings out two binary position that Thoreau takes forth in his interpretation of higher laws where on one hand one sees the reconcilable togetherness of human and non-human life ,the other marks a divide non agglutinable. Here Thoreau’s thinking works in dual symmetry as he pens down his thoughts in his journal as, “There is something worth living for when we are resisted—threatened. . . . What would the days—what would our life be worth if some nights were not dark as pitch . . . How else could the light in the mind shine!”(qtd. in Smithson 109). The dualities of vision comes well in the chapter “Ponds” where Thoreau says that Concord has two colors of water, which in the analysis of the passage is one which incurs the perceptual position that changes by what and how one sees . *Walden* (1854) has lines of “The Ponds” as , “ All our Concord waters have two colors at least; one when viewed at a distance, and another, more proper, close at hand”(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 137).

Some of Thoreau’s encounter with the wild thus marks a passage of his thought process that goes not without a thin line of awareness of self and the other .This encounter is elaborately brought forth in chapter “Higher Laws” as : “I caught a glimpse of a woodchuck stealing across my path, and felt a strange thrill of savage delight, and

was strongly tempted to seize and devour him raw; not that I was hungry then, except for that wildness which he represented ”(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 163). In this instant encounter with the wild nature in the form of woodchuck, Thoreau admits that he wants to “devour him raw”, it is the want to devour the wildness, he wants to engulf the part of nature. Thus, here comes forth the sense of engulfing the sole self with the nature which is seen as being excluded thus the constant want to be one with nature.

For him to substantiate himself in the free forming history of woodchuck shows the difficulty in nature emulation. Thoreau once and again have felt the dearth of a capacity that makes him one with nature. It is more often a tempted attempt that often fails in its appraisals. At times the zeal to be one with nature becomes a fight for supremacy and a fight of civilization to be the oldest, earliest, an animal supremacy over nature over human’s supreme relation with nature. Thoreau indirectly is tempted to have a supremacy of authentic archaism. Thus, Thoreau at times see the similarity between the yankee man and Woodchuck as he writes how authentically the man had been made that “no introduction would serve to introduce him, more than if you introduced a woodchuck to your neighbor” (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 113). For a matter of fact or a matter of speculation, Nature need not have an introduction, for mortals can never crop a portion of nature and assign it to be its wholeness. Still the ongoing research of man on nature, on this evolving subject lays bare on how our intellect can confront but never confirm a shape that introduces nature. This fixity comes as perceptual fallibility.

At an instance in *Walden* (1854) in chapter “Visitors” the comment made by the “Paphlagonian man” sounds foolish as it makes the reader laugh at the thought that he could hunt, “pigeons, woodchucks, rabbits, partridges” and “could get all [he]

should want for a week in one day” (Thoreau , *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 112). At one point this description of Thoreau sets one in the camp of self and other binary contrast ,while at other time just like Bertolt Brecht “alienation effect”, it makes one avert this way of over consumptive thought but lets one think about one’s own consumerist lineage ,the record needs also the account of the fact that nineteenth century being the dawn of capitalism in America.

Thus in the consciousness of the ecology as self and other, ecology outside and within, the journey of both Milarepa and Thoreau starts with ascendance to a region where they adjust themselves with the ecology of the new place, at this state the viewer inhales and assimilates what can be seen as the first stage of the change where there is inhalation of “subtler and pure atmosphere of those elevated places”. The second is the process of being one with nature in acquiescence when one dismantles oneself with the thought process where they adhere to the position where his consciousness connects him with no other law but to the image of the counter relational position of oneness. The author thus marks a shift in genre writing or simply in the formulation of the lines where with the ascending oneness with the mountain and valley of the new place, we have a change in formulated self and other that comes through conscious rendering. This change in perspective and building up of a broader undercut that the author persona goes through, enlarges the place further where the experience of the sounds and of solitude in the valley differs. In “A Walk to Wachusett” (1843), Thoreau confirms about his own psychodynamics with the changed place, he writes: “It was a place where gods might wander, so solemn and solitary, and removed from all contagion with the plain” (Thoreau, *Wild Apples* 33, 35).

This sense of conscious presence that one goes through when one refines the ecology of the body by the sight perception with the ecology outside shares us the dual

position of the influence of the ecology, which takes one a step further to renewal and later to reformation of oneself .

2.4 Shifting Perceptions and Conscious Actions of Jetsun Milarepa and Henry David Thoreau

In the introduction of *Thoreau's sense of place* (2000) we are acquainted with the study of how Thoreau sensed his place and sentenced the story out of the place. Richard J. Schneider thus elaborately writes on how Thoreau, “chronicles the special qualities of Walden pond in *Walden* (1854) ,makes it obvious that for him place does make a crucial difference in how one perceives one’s experience in nature”(Schneider 1).Further in adjacent to this , it is also the viewer’s relation with any object that becomes a precursor of subjective thoughts. This sense of place is what compels Thoreau to find a place which could relate his emotion and his words with the vista of the view that later imprinted his works and that goes on a way of giving distinctiveness to his work, where writing about nature, he is writing about his own self.

At one instance in a journal ,Thoreau emphasizes the fact that further the object, vastly it seems but it also hinders the details that is not visible to one’s power of sight, where standing before a far sighted land one can view the magnanimity ,but one might lose all the seeable things in the process as he writes in his journal , “By focusing his sight on a distant mountain, he finds that he cannot see the ‘farmhouses, the lonely mills, wooded vales, wild rocky pastures’” (qtd. in Schneider 2). While for Milarepa, his itineracy lead him to a path of multiple visions ,if he viewed the mountains as an object that has wholeness in existence ,he also travelled further and saw minute details of the same mountain by living in it, studying it and involving himself in it.

There are various instances where mountain provides both solitude and a newer perception to Milarepa. Even when he moves out of his village to learn black magic,

his teacher instructs him to go to mountains, he is thus instructed by his teacher ,“ My friend is a loyal friend and true to his word. I shall teach you all sorts of magic. For this purpose, construct a cell on the ridge of this mountain which will put you beyond human reach”. As recorded in the biography he at times sings also on relation between mountain and Marpa:

The northern land of the world is Tibet
 Where the Doctrine of Buddha will spread.
 This snow-clad mountain
 Is the old Translator Marpa
 And the Kagyu teaching. (Lhalungpa 27, 84)

The shift in perception towards a place also renders a conscious growth on the part of the viewer, Thoreau thus writes in chapter “Higher Laws” of *Walden* (1854) in the context of perceptual change , “He goes thither at first as a hunter and fisher, until at last, if he has the seeds of a better life in him, he distinguishes his proper objects, as a poet or naturalist it may be, and leaves the gun and fish-pole behind”(Thoreau ,*Walden and Civil Disobedience* 165).It reminds one that a change in perception at times also implies the growth and maturity of a person as one leaves gun and fish-pole and finds better way of encountering Nature .S/he would rather delve into what marks a thoughtful communication, a communication that seeks not to keep to experiments along but to live a philosophy of life and to live along to know along .

Thoreau and Milarepa brings forth the relation of change in nature to change in oneself to justify a change in the perception of a viewer where all the changes in nature may not be possibly documented as humans themselves are in the mode of change where “Human agency, even catastrophic human agency, is swallowed up by the balancing power of nature. The conclusion is built into the premise: humanity, which

commands nature by obedience to its laws, can hardly step outside of nature's grand, cyclic, self-correcting, and continually regenerative economy."(Schneider 20). Thus Marpa in the evolutionary process of nature ,by putting emphasis on the natural phenomenon as hailstorms makes Milarepa aware of his past perception ,thus seeks to bring newer perception of the same incident in the biography of Milarepa .At one instance Marpa enquires if Milarepa can cause hailstorms in two regions of "Yadrok Taklung and Ling",²⁶for the people of that region harmed Marpa's students as they travelled across the region .To this Milarepa hesitates and complies later after much consolation from Marpa .Later as Milarepa carries out the task ,Marpa says, " Now restore the harvest in the land of Yadrok and heal the mountaineers; after that I will teach you. But never come back if you cannot do this." (Lhalungpa 48).It is at this state that readers along with Milarepa is made aware of the fact that Marpa tried to make Milarepa realize that to do the ill deeds is easy but to bring back the life of those dead is difficult, thus atonement and penance too are difficult and the same task becomes an immeasurable pain with the change in perception .

Thus when Marpa asks Milarepa to restore the harvest what his great grand motive is, is to change the perception of Milarepa by taking him back to the deeds that he had carried out with the revenge motive that lead to death of animal and livestock . Marpa, thus lays emphasis on individual realization of value of life not just of humans but of crops and animals as well. Thus, conscious raising is based on the philosophy of present moment but it becomes a way of release of past emotional state to current state of existence.

²⁶The inhabitants of Yadrok Taklung and Ling looted people and disciples of Marpa who were to come from U and Tsang, thus Marpa lochwa wants hailstones in these two regions so that the inhabitants can fear Marpa and not do ill things in future.

Conspicuously at time when Thoreau writes on the change in landscape and its impact on him at other times his thoughts renders nature as unchangeable even with all human encroachment, he seeks to see at these points a position where though Walden pond had many acquaintances it remains unchanged. He thus writes, “the woodchoppers [who] have laid bare first this shore and then that, and the Irish have built their sties by it, and the railroad has infringed on its border, and the ice-men have skimmed it once, it is itself unchanged, the same water which my youthful eyes fell on; all the change is in me” (*Walden and Civil Disobedience* 150).

As such Thoreau blatantly writes on how the change is not much in landscape as in himself, the change is in his perception towards nature, towards Walden landscape. This discussion of perception goes well into the formulation of his lines. It seems that Thoreau in *Walden* (1854) brings forth poetic lines when he is in rapport with philosophy of life ,a sense that could not be explained to common man in explicitness of prose lines ,thus at times with the change in perception we see change in literary genre .It seems that just as Milarepa when he comes close enough with Walden so much so that he can feel its presence ,he enquires his own inquisitives of a different Walden that is before him ,he is obliged to ask , “I can almost say, Walden, is it you?” He thus again expresses his awe in verse:

It is no dream of mine,
 To ornament a line;
 I cannot come nearer to God and Heaven
 Than I live to Walden even.
 I am its stony shore,
 And the breeze that passes o'er;
 In the hollow of my hand

Are its water and its sand,

And its deepest resort

Lies high in my thought. (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 150)

2.5 Ecology and the Mode of Transformative Emulation

Richard J. Schneider in “Climate Does Thus React on Man” Wildness and Geographic Determinism in Thoreau’s ‘Walking’ analyses Guyot who comes to scientific conclusion that in regard to the growth of plants and animals “the degree of perfection of the types is proportional to the intensity of heat, and of the other agents stimulating the display of material life... In man, the degree of perfection of the types is in proportion to the degree of intellectual and moral improvement” (qtd. Schneider 53). Thus transformation in nature and man may vary but the process of transformation and the influence set by external factors are inevitably present in the natural cycle. Thus Thoreau records in his essays like “Walking”(1862), his saunter in natural environment where he sees the influence of climate on development of man .He thus writes,

I believe that climate does thus react on man,—as there is something in the mountain air that feeds the spirit and inspires. Will not man grow to greater perfection intellectually as well as physically under these influences?...thoughts will be clearer, fresher, and more ethereal, as our sky,—our understanding more comprehensive and broader, like our plains,—our intellect generally on a grander scale, like our thunder and lightning, our rivers and mountains and forests,—and our hearts shall even correspond in breadth and depth and grandeur to our inland seas. (Thoreau , *Wild Apples* 73)

Further, the presence of landscape have been brought by Thoreau to have had varied influences which Thoreau impeccably illustrates in his works .Thus even in *Walden* (1854) we find the emphasis of place in correlation with inner engineering of man.

However it is often felt that when Thoreau talks about the influence of nature on man he talks about the western landscape wherein Thoreau is said to have given the whole credit to western landscape as he writes in “Walking” , “The west of which I speak is but another name for wild”(Thoreau ,*Wild Apples* 75) .Here Schneider comes in defence of Thoreau’s prejudiced perception towards nature and justifies that people have mistaken Thoreau’s words for when he talks of wild ,it is not solely about a region but about a “state of mind”(Schneider 55) of an individual, thus the wild can rather be taken as a healthy state of mind beyond physical wilderness.

Jetsun Milarepa likewise in his biography seeks to emulate the composure of mountains, the dauntless patience on practice which no other being but living with nature would teach him. Thoreau also does not fail to talk in the passages of *Walden* (1854) about human nature and of what happens when it comes in contact with natural environment .Thoreau writes on account of how an engineer who works in a flourished centre of business in Boston encounters the peacefulness of Walden space ,his nature will not permit him to forget the sight for constantly he would delve in binary juxtaposition of the sights of two different places ,one that suggest frenziness of city life while the other that Thoreau takes as better sight for men. He thus writes that just as the water of Walden has retained the pureness of Ganges as it now stands amidst the forest like a hermit ,he somehow hints to the readers that solitary life can fill one’s life with purity and one emulates what one gets into the influence of .He gives the analogy of Flint’s pond here that would easily shed its impureness once it comes in contact with Walden Pond . The lines goes as , “If by living thus reserved and austere, like a hermit in the woods, so long, it has acquired such wonderful purity, who would not regret that the comparatively impure waters of Flint's Pond should be mingled with it, or itself

should ever go to waste its sweetness in the ocean wave?" (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 151).

Thus, Thoreau conspicuously brings forth to readers the notion of the influence of humans on nature and vice-versa, of nature on perception of man being evident. At such circumstance the internal nature comes together with the external form to merge and merit each other. In one instance Thoreau brings out the value of congealed Walden and White pond and philosophises the economy of nature and economy of man where he compares the pond with one of the most valuable diamond, Koh-i-noor and elaborately implies how the knowledge that nature impart is beyond value added by man's perception of economy as the pond teaches one with its reflection the transparency that humans ought to emulate, thus this impact of ecology can be seen in Thoreau's change from initial chapters as an economic man (one that calculated the value of seeds and records mode of sustainability) in the chapter "Economy" to one who values the solace and solitude of nature as incalculable commodity in his later chapters. He thus write:

White Pond and Walden are great crystals on the surface of the earth, Lakes of Light... How much more beautiful than our lives, how much more transparent than our characters, are they! We never learned meanness of them. How much fairer than the pool before the farmers door, in which his ducks swim! Hither the clean wild ducks come. Nature has no human inhabitant who appreciates her. The birds with their plumage and their notes are in harmony with the flowers, but what youth or maiden conspires with the wild luxuriant beauty of Nature? (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 155)

However, emulating nature for Thoreau came not without a price, it provided at first a healthy agitation, the restless picture of nature that he tried to capture and often failed

to deliver in human language ,yet succeeded in keeping an account of his frenzy mindset till he consoled it into a fit pattern of transference in his words and sentences of *Walden* (1854). Thus, the process of nature emulation has in it the dormant wild vigour that becomes a catalyst in the process of nature emulation as Thoreau writes in “Walking”, “all good things are wild and free”(Walking 82).Herein comes this diversion towards goodness that speaks of the relation of inside- outside nature dichotomy. Thoreau thus writes in “Higher Laws”, “ We are conscious of an animal in us, which awakens in proportion as our higher nature slumbers”. (Thoreau,*Walden and Civil Disobedience* 170)

In the analysis of human emulation of nature, Thoreau however saw natural world as a copy or rather a representation of divinity. For him, “The morning wind forever blows, the poem of creation is uninterrupted; but few are the ears that hear it. Olympus is but the outside of the earth everywhere”(Thoreau,*Walden and Civil Disobedience* 66),thus emulating nature and having its unprecedented influence also lies in the perfect sight of observation ,the observation that a writer frames after the visual touch of nature,becomes more about a literal composition and thus in this process becomes an art form which can be seen as twice removed from reality where in James A .Papa Jr. paraphrasing Peter Fritzell’s point of view in *Nature Writing and America* (1990) writes, “to write about nature is not the same things as to observe nature”(Schneider 77).

Thoreau thus looks through his mind’s eye and seeks to deliver a vision where nature is seen as a constant traveller not transfixed by any age ,he writes, “ The water laves the shore as it did a thousand years ago”, he personifies nature and sees the lake as a part of landscape where in the influence of landscape on his aesthetic culminated taste surfaces at once with anthropocentric yet a personal account of his perception .He

writes, “A lake is the landscape's most beautiful and expressive feature. It is earth's eye; looking into which the beholder measures the depth of his own nature. The fluviate trees next the shore are the slender eyelashes which fringe it, and the wooded hills and cliffs around are its overhanging brows ”(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 145).

Thoreau likewise takes Walden pond as a mirror that reflects what moves above and a mirror that is in the process of enaction ,active enough to repair oneself .He sets out the dauntless image of Walden as he strikes a symbolism of its purity and its strength that “no stone can crack”, it is with the help of nature that it repairs (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 146).The pond however also reflects his inner feelings and it is the conscious self that helps him adjust the lens of perception in alignment to his shift in feelings just as Milarepa himself has the color green that becomes symbolic of his transformative beginning that marks him near to nature . It is with the heightened eco-consciousness that Milarepa viewed nature and it’s abstruse energy to transform human consciousness so much as to emulate the very colour green .It is this concordance with nature that is brought out in the lines of Thoreau and songs of Milarepa. Anything that looks nonhuman is always a source of fear, for we never accept the natural as human and vice versa. In one instance in *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) some hunters views him as a ghost and runs away as his skin turned the colour of nettles he consumed. Milarepa consoles the hunters and sings of his humanness: “‘It is me, I am a man’ They recognized him as a human only when they see the gaps in his teeth”(Lhalungpa 121).

Thoreau likewise says in *Walden* (1854) “we may live the life of a plant or an animal , without an animal life”. This greenness of the body of Milarepa also acts as a symbol of transformative emulation within him in the context of his relation with nature, comes into existence where the body becomes an important asset of reflection

or rather the hallmark of the influence of nature on man .In the Tibetan canon the importance of body comes forth as an important element ,as higher consciousness attunes with “ blissful joy in [the]body”(Lhalungpa 3).Here it might imply that any state of mental awareness is depicted indirectly in the body where the body becomes a map that can read the continents that brings to sight the invisible pattern in the mind.In the case of Milarepa the impact of ecology as such inevitably tends to have a visible effect on the body ,the green color metamorphosing in Milarepa’s skin with the intake of nettles reflects how the body had been moulded by the nature that encumbers it .

In the biographical narrative, when a lady pays reverence to Milarepa and illustrating the green colour of Milarepa wonders, “With such a radiant glow shining through the green reed like colour of your body, unafflicted by imbalances of the four elements of three viral principles, you are certainly a realized practitioner of the difficult Dharma.” It is here that Milarepa is described physically in relation to the attributes that he possesses, his “bare feet unscarred by rough gravel and thorns ... high throat indicate that you must embody a treasury of vajra song ” (Rinpoche and Cutillo 122).

We can further see a constant reversal and a cyclic relation with nature, where simply in the prologue it is made clear how energy of bliss flows through his body “down to his very toes, and the ascending bliss reaching up to the crown of his head, brought him to the ultimate bliss of fruition.”(Lhalungpa 3).Just as in nature the ultimate fruition is the end as William Shakespeare writes in *King Lear*, “ripeness is all”(Act 5 Scene 2), in a similar relativeness, the ultimate knowledge acquired by Milarepa could be related in no other terms but in nature emulation. The ponds of Walden likewise comes as a close metaphor of Thoreau .Just as the pond is described as “deep green”, the “perennial spring in the midst of pine and oak woods, without any visible inlet or outlet except by the clouds and evaporation”(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience*

137), in a similar way Thoreau's encumbered Walden space opens its gates one for inlet of some visitors and outlet of some visitors. Milarepa's stagnancy too enumerates the arrival of huntsman, his sister Peta and in later years his aunt while his outstretched visit to the village for food brings to surface the process of outlet .

To a great extent , the landscape and in it the inclusion of ponds in the narrative of *Walden* (1854) had made Thoreau somehow emulate nature and transform his own way of life, though the greenness of the pond suggest stagnancy it also has been relished with the natural process with the arrival of the rain and the merger of evaporating process and such is the case with Thoreau's prose genre in *Walden*(1854) where we have inclusive intertextuality at one point while his work also becomes an array of inspiration to other works that have titles and passages dedicated to and written from direct inspiration of *Walden* (1854) . Thoreau likewise brings nature imagery in the narrative and writes on body and satiation . He writes , "He who distinguishes the true savour of his food can never be a glutton; he who does not cannot be otherwise"(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 169). Thus it is not the task of the nettle plant but a basic taste that satisfies the hunger that Milarepa adopts to. Like nature, the narrative of Thoreau and Milarepa reflects life of minimality and simplicity that can be taken as one of the major outcome of emulating and being one with nature.

CHAPTER-III

Delineating Timescapes: Mindful Perception of Nature in Milarepa and Thoreau

3.1 Introduction

Christophe Bouton and Philippe Huneman, the editors of *Time of Nature and the Nature of Time: Philosophical Perspectives of Time in Natural Sciences* (2017) in the introductory pages of their work records the approach towards time in two perspectives, the one that entails Aristotle's genesis on time's concept as a movement and another of Immanuel Kant's notion of time in relation to consciousness that has had its origin prior to what can be named as intuition (2). Apart from Kant and Aristotle there emerged various philosophers and ardent researchers who aspired to unravel the concept of time ranging from Issac Newton, Albert Einstein, Gottfried Wilhelm Leibniz to twentieth century time analyser as Hans Reichenbach, Lawrence Sklar and Huw Price.

Apart from these personalities the concept of time has also allured literary writers like Marcel Proust and T.S. Eliot whose works like *In search of Lost Time* (1913-1927) translated as *Remembrance of Things Past* (1922-1931) and T.S. Eliot's essay "Tradition and the Individual Talent" (1919) explores time in varied perceptions bringing newer dimensions to the study of temporal time.

Still the study of Barbara Adam on time has been a major breakthrough where her works like *Time and Social Theory* (1990) and her much acclaimed work *Timescapes of Modernity: The Environment and Invisible Hazards* (1998), relate the influence of time in two prospective modes of visibility and the other being the non-visible effects of time on social and environmental considerations. The clock or the mechanical time implies linearity at one hand and on the other it facilitates repetition, thus the effect of humans on environment is better understood in apocalyptic terms wherein time is brought out as irreversible factor thus one's perception towards nature

becomes more sustainable in the process. Barbara Adam bringing forth this awareness of the timescape beyond the landscape awareness aims to record time beyond what Adams writes as “industrial time [which] is centrally implicated in the construction of environmental degradation and hazards”, resolves to “ explore the timescapes associated with that way of life [that] entails concern with approaches to time and the multiple intersections of the times of culture and the socio-physical environment”(Adam 8-9).

Thus in the study of timescape what comes as pertinent point is to bring forth the relation between man and nature in the field of non-visible dimension in approach to environment which can further be explored in the Thoreau’s perspective in the Walden space and in Milarepa’s relation with the ecology of the then Tibet .

3.2 A Study of Natural and Non-Natural Time

Analysis of time has been a major factor in the study of *Walden* (1854) .Thoreau has kindred forth in his memoir an assuage of the variety of metaphors to evaluate time. Living close to nature he found a better way to study it in Walden space where he was an active witnesser that witnessed the evolution in nature and recorded its passage and came near to awe as he looked at the evolving nature of Walden space and factorized the time and its passage in non-universal, non mechanized time ,which he seek to incorporate in his journals and later in his lines of *Walden* (1854).His search was for a more meticulous passage of time not in the constrains of the second hand but rather a change on the natural tint of leaves ,the change in color that set forth the passage of natural time .Thus it is much pertinent to analyze what adds to the naturalness of time and how its record differs from mechanical time and when we speak of growth in natural time how does it differs in the prospective tunings from mechanical time ?

At the very outset ,the words in the narrative of *Walden* (1854) comes to the readers in binary passages .Even in the process of inlet and outlet of water form in Walden pond , time has been made a medium that ranges beyond spatio-temporal .The process of evaporating water that marks its collect from various sources, region and in varied time period pours down to Walden in undecipherable million tunes of natural time .This instance brings forth time as analyzed by Bergson that annihilates as duration or duree where measuring the moment is incomplete measurement where the only possible way of taking hold of it is through imagination and with the help of intuition.

Tibet and the society of Tibet laid great emphasis on nature and natural time. As agriculture became an important occupation ,the grown of plants ,the harvest of the plants became an important component of recording the passage of time ,thus it can undoubtedly be said that the inhabitants of eleventh century Tibet recorded their activities and linked their actions with nature .It is quite evident that in the biography of Milarepa we are known about the birth of Milarepa not in terms of dates and months but in terms of seasons, the star positions, where the birth of Milarepa is recorded as, “ under the star Victorious of the eighth constellation, on the twenty-fifth day of the moon, that my mother gave birth to me. She sent a message to my father. The letter said: ‘Here at the time of harvest, I have given birth to a son. Come quickly to name him and celebrate his name day’” (Lhalungpa 15).

Unlike these kind of record that marks a passage of time based on components like sun, moon and the seasons it is undoubtedly clear to the readers that mechanical time was set paced in nineteenth century America thus Thoreau at the very outset in *Walden* (1854) uses mechanised time to record his departure to Walden .He thus writes in chapter , “where I lived and what I lived for”, “When first I took up my abode in the woods, that is, began to spend my nights as well as days there, which, by accident, was

on Independence Day, or the Fourth of July, 1845". Still keeping these lines into account, it would be equivocal to affirm that Thoreau, even at the midst of Walden was in the influence solely of the non-natural time. The titles of his chapters makes it quite evident that from a distant account one can acknowledge how Thoreau puts forth the influence of natural time in his title chapters that varies from "Winter Animals" to "Spring", "The Ponds" to "The Pond in Winter". Here the natural time like the setting of the sun or rising of the stars never moves quickly as the second hand of the watch but the natural time itself can be felt in a more subtle way where the passing of time is more felt than seen. The symbiotic relation of Thoreau with nature likewise might not have an organicity as Milarepa depicts with the maggots but it does have a way of connection, the resting bird at the arm of the yankee who "peck at the potato in his fingers" (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 65, 113) brings forth the time spend by humans along the natural momentum of sustenance and symbiosis.

The agricultural landscape of Concord is recorded to have had almost two hundred farms that was an ecosystem based on cereals and grasses but what accorded a change was the wave of English hay plantation in 1840's and hence Concord took a drastic change in its agricultural prospect with the emergence of railroads in 1844. Thus the society that Thoreau saw was made of mechanized fixity while his notion of time was considerably based on natural time, one that was not conferred upon as obligation but as slow paced tuned momentum that cauled each individual's life differently.

In *Walden* (1854), the natural power of pine and rocks are brought in as metaphor to the physical strength of the yankee. Thoreau however foresees the yankee as one where "the intellectual and what is called spiritual man in him were slumbering as in an infant" where the yankee is perceived as one who is not educated to "the degree of consciousness". Thus the study of Thoreau's perception of the man, of time and of

the place again links him to how he connects the ultimate source of relative relation with consciousness. However, what still needs to be analysed of consciousness is how he records the “duration of consciousness”, does he frame it along the mechanical time or records the evolution of consciousness in the natural passage? Thoreau’s perception of the yankee not inhabiting any consciousness seems fallible in analysis as when we record the protagonist yankee as readers, keeping away the perception that Thoreau delivers of him, we rather see that the way the yankee has internalised nature is the part of his innate consciousness in working which Thoreau still is persistent to acquire through his learnings. The life of the yankee further assimilates the life of un-hasteful pace which depicts a pastoral solace. The life of yankee follows the natural time of work and rest. It is a time not bounded by clock and calendar but by the natural pace of daylight, which further can be brought in relation to Barbara Adams analysis of time and timescape as an entity where the experience of each individual renders variation in experience. Thoreau himself affirms of the difference in time experience in the chapter “Economy” as:

For myself I found that the occupation of a day-labourer was the most independent of any, especially as it required only thirty or forty days in a year to support one. The labourer’s day ends with the going down of the sun, and he is then free to devote himself to his chosen pursuit, independent of his labor; but his employer, who speculates from month to month, has no respite from one end of the year to the other. (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 113, 54)

Comparatively, in an account of *The Life of Milarepa* (1997), where Marpa’s wife asks about Milarepa and about his dharma practice with Ngokpa to a messenger of Ngokpa, as a reply the messenger situates two instances of seclusion in a place. The conversation as informed to Milarepa by Ngokpa went as, “Marpa’s wife asked what you were

doing'. I told her you were in strict seclusion. She asked me what else you were doing besides that. I replied that you were living in a deserted place" (Lhalungpa 65). Thus this instance of seclusion and living in a desolate place becomes two different phenomena to the messenger as well as to Marpa's wife. Here it might imply internal and external solitariness, the seclusion in the retreat where a wall has been built up is for oneself, to create an environment of solitude, the second factor is to live in a deserted place which implies far from human habitation. Thus though these two instances may be taken as one but as can be made out from the reply of Marpa's wife, they signify two different factors, one of the seclusion that is based on non-natural time, the chronological build up of time while the other one that is based on deserted place accounts not the chronological time but a natural unrecorded nature time. Thus in Milarepa's seclusion we see both forms in conformity.

The amalgamation of natural and non-natural events, recorded and un-recorded events in the life of Milarepa directs the readers to the understanding of a common phenomenon as synthesis, where the mind works not in contrary positions, as Milarepa understood "all external phenomena to be internal phenomena of the mental world, then discovered the mind itself as being lucid awareness, unborn and empty" (Lhalungpa 5). Further to add to this, there are various instances in the biography of Milarepa where he is instructed to go to mountains, a place that not only protects one from the chronological non-natural time but it bases to advance one's own nonlinear concept of time which may not be universal. The natural time also becomes a mode that leads to the advancement in learning and in development of consciousness, thus when Marpa instructs Milarepa to go to the mountains, it also implies to break away from the recorded chronological time and to build his own natural time which originates after building up of one's relation with nature. Even when Milarepa goes to

Yonten Gyatso to learn black magic ,he is entrusted instructions as , “construct a cell on the ridge of this mountain which will put you beyond human reach”(Lhalungpa 27).

Thus we see that any magic or any meditation on conscious thinking needs a solitary place that can build up one’s momentum not based on non-natural realized time .One of the point of solitariness itself aims at building up an authentic understanding of time subjectively, thus the choices of mountain ridges are taken as apposite place where the importance of natural surrounding has been highly related in the communion between man and the higher self that encapsulates awareness. Time spend in nature also sustains what Lhalungpa has emphasised as “contemplative power”, one that controls the “ adverse forces of the four elements of nature, harnessing them for spiritual benefit”(Lhalungpa 4).It is this harness of the psychophysical forces that comes to Milarepa with his time conscious contemplative power, for to harness the external energy is not an end in itself but it is a continuous yet momentous process, especially when our subject of concern is an itinerant vagabond who travels and advances forth to different environment ,where transcendentalism is what Milarepa aims at by framing a relation with a natural time .

There are various instances in the biography of Milarepa where we see how when esoterisms and puzzles enamour the daily activities of people ,messages and messengers are not put up a faith on and the receiver of the message has to decode the truth by oneself, whether it means to record the hidden treasure in the cloth of the monk or the hidden code that Marpa’s wife sends to Milarepa ,it puts forth the receiver in active conscious thinking to decoded the coding that well applies in perception towards nature as well. Just as the codes of messages in the Tibet, nature keeps things hidden and it is in the perceiver to decode philosophy that the nature imparts .Just as in the

biography Milarepa decodes the dice sent by Marpa's wife in a similar way Milarepa in solitude of nature decodes hidden wisdom of nature .

Thoreau in a similar manner approaches his relation with time in superfluous words in *Walden* (1854) . In the narrative he often goes back to the time when a greater influence was made by natural time on him ,in supple words he enunciates the best use of time as one where one is not known of one's destination until one reaches the spot, there is no measurement done by mechanical time ,where all place comes as placeness and where idleness amidst nature is seen as the fruitful use of time .All of a sudden in such circumstance when he is encumbered in the influence of natural time, he writes of his perception of time that comes back again to him in reminiscence ,

I have spent many an hour, when I was younger, floating over its surface as the zephyr willed, having paddled my boat to the middle, and lying on my back across the seats, in a summer forenoon, dreaming awake, until I was aroused by the boat touching the sand, and I arose to see what shore my fates had impelled me to; days when idleness was the most attractive and productive industry. Many a forenoon have I stolen away, preferring to spend thus the most valued part of the day; for I was rich, if not in money, in sunny hours and summer days, and spent them lavishly; nor do I regret that I did not waste more of them in the workshop or the teacher's desk. (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 149)

Undoubtedly, the reminiscence of his childhood flows like a stream and shows us the then landscape of his time where we see how his gradual peaceful account is hindered with a loss that has now come down to his present narration .When he comes to the present situation what we see is a change in perception towards the same landscape and a question ,a strong opinion that he makes to today's generation as he writes, "But since I left those shores the woodchoppers have still further laid them waste, and now for

many a year there will be no more rambling through the aisles of the wood, with occasional vistas through which you see the water. My Muse may be excused if she is silent henceforth. How can you expect the birds to sing when their groves are cut down?" (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 149).

Alike to Thoreau's perception transit in the narrative from natural to non-natural time and vice versa, the unambiguous point that society of Tibet laid great emphasis is reflected by Lhalungpa where there are records of citizens having one's own field and livestock. At one instance when Milarepa is asked to shower hailstorms in one of the region of Yehpo and Yemo,²⁷ for the inhabitants of the place stole the provisions of Milarepa's teacher, Milarepa comes across an old lady who having looked at the size of the clouds cries out, "when my crops are struck by hail, what will I have to eat?" (Lhalungpa 63), at this instance we can see a change in perception of Milarepa where after the revenge motive, he sees empathy for the lady, thus protects her crops. At another instance the death of birds and rats deeply moves Milarepa, in comparison to the death of thirty five people wherein now comes to him a newer perception in the passage of time. He now seeks to take his magic over nature not for his own purpose, for fulfilment of his revenge motive but now knows well as to how going beyond the natural time, by trying to have dominion over natural elements he has caused the death of uncountable animals. He collects the body of dead rats and birds wherefore it now reflects his realization of his utter inability to awaken them.

It is very clear from the narrative that rather than the non-natural time that sets twelve hours in repetitive circumference, natural time is like a stream that flows and

²⁷Just as inhabitants of Yadrok Taklung and Ling looted people and disciples of Marpa, in a similar context during the time of Milarepa, the evil people of Yehpo and Yemo stole provisions of the disciples of lama Ngokpa thus instructions to Milarepa is to set showers of hailstones in the region.

never comes back as Heraclitus emphasises on how one cannot step on the same stream twice.

3.3 Transcending Time and Ethnicity through Timescapes

When one moves to the social appraisal during the 11th and 12th century Tibet, the state of philosophical advancement in comparison to 11th century America, it surprises us. At the time when Milarepa was meditating in the solitude of Tibet's Himalayas, at that very age England experienced what can be called an epoch making conquest – the Norman conquest. This as such is an important pedestal that sets Thoreau's and Milarepa's existence in comparative aura, for a writer can inevitably never remain aloof of what went with the society of the time where its influence can be seen in the case of Milarepa as some hours of visit to the villages that stood beneath the Himalayas or the constant communication of visitors in Walden's precinct in terms of Thoreau's experience with the notions and vogue of the time, or more apparently the newspapers that arrived at Thoreau's place as a messenger that heralded the changing picture of the society when he had walled in himself in Walden.

In Milarepa's biography it comes out from the mouth of Milarepa's sister Peta, on how the people who represented what could be called society of the time treated Milarepa as insane and mad. There are accounts when Peta says to Milarepa to change his way of dharma, she reiterates, "My elder brother's religion provides him with nothing to eat and nothing to wear ... Other monks have a lama named Bari Lotsawa. They have erected a throne for him sheltered under a canopy. They dress him in fine silk and offer him tea and beer", to this Milarepa answers, "Do not speak like that. My nakedness and my unconventional behaviour embarrass you. But I am content with this body of mine which enabled me to encounter religion. So, I have nothing to be ashamed of. Since I was born naked, I have no cause for shame" (Lhalungpa 135).

Milarepa puts forth an analytical transcendental wisdom that he elaborates as, “that transcendent gnosis involves realization of the nonduality of subject and object. The mind is incapable of truly seeing itself: its nature can be realized only through the elimination of preconceived misperceptions of the mind and its objects ”(Rinpoche and Cutillo 91). Milarepa’s mobile life in the mountains of Tibet comes at first with his immobile stay in meditation .He writes, “I meditated day and night in this way, without moving, until the butter in the lamp was exhausted ”(Lhalungpa 76).In Milarepa we see a process from natural immobility to mobility .In a similar way we see Thoreau’s pond is thaw frozen and it again renders its natural state in *Walden* (1854) narration, thus bringing forth the cyclical pattern. Thus what we see is that, the passage of both these individuals is the cyclical process from mobility to immobility and immobility to mobility.

There is one instance where Milarepa have had spent more than eleven months in a cave ,he fears to come out of the environment he has created .It is however with the support of Marpa’s wife that taking courage he breaks the wall. The conversation between Marpa’s wife and Marpa succinctly brings forth this dilemma that centres on Milarepa’s communion with society after long months of isolation that is both filled with doubt and hesitation , the conversation takes place as :

Are you coming, my son? I replied that I dared not break down the wall. The mother said, ‘There is nothing wrong. Such an auspicious event as this meeting with the lama can only have a good result... Knowing that the mother spoke the truth, I tore down the wall and came out. (Lhalungpa 75)

In the study of Nature it is undoubtedly precise to think that every individual perceives and takes nature in their own terms of exploitation, while some perceives natural world as a mode of economy and in the process makes way for its utility in manners like

deforestation, overcultivation , where nature stands to them as a centre of profit ,while there are those who seek to exploit nature too but their exploitation is not physical destruction for they take nature as their source of art and yet there are very few who live with nature and helps it grow ,seeks to write about it and at the same time contribute toward its preservation .Writers like Gary Snyder ,Rachael Carson Aldo Leopold are such names for whom nature is a source of art but their aim has always been to make people conscious of exploitation that has been carried out against nature. Thus what matters most is how we perceive nature ,understand nature and relate nature “out there” with conscious actions.Still what different we see in Milarepa and Thoreau’s perception towards nature that differs from our contemporary nature writers is the contemplative meditative analysis of nature that we find in their mode of life .

Again when we study perception of Thoreau towards nature, we see that he successfully works to transcend ethnicity and time bound nature where he brings a genre flexible enough to transpose the time of past and present in togetherness. This transcendental adherence can also be seen in his focus on individual form in a greater relation with ecology .Thoreau brings the advantage to the genre of descriptive writing where , “while a single landscape painting cannot simulate the visual changes that occur as one turns one’s head, or walks in different directions, or returns to a scene in different seasons, a prose description can readily accommodate these spatial and temporal shifts”(Smithson 98).This sense of spatiotemporally of genre gives the narrative a power to have a full-fledged connection with time consciousness or consciousness in action while the prose work of Thoreau transposes beyond space and time to form a work of art .

Just as a story ,as an oral folklore ,Thoreau in *Walden*(1854) encounters an old man who recounts the natural liveliness of the ponds in Walden when the pond of

Walden was “ alive with ducks and other water-fowl, and that there were many eagles about it).Again connective to this the old man is seen talking to an old man who was a potter and who believed that there was “an iron chest at the bottom”(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 148).Thus the encounter with the old man and his recounted account somehow suggest that the change in landscape ,the evolution in landscape had made him remember the past and he took best heed to describe it in oral tale .In connective with the two old inhabitants of Walden ponds ,the second old man that makes its existence in the narration suggest the past portion of the Walden history ,while the present is being narrated by old man whose account of the difference in fauna inhabitants in the pond ecosystem calls for the reminiscence of past in the present account and likewise we see a future foreteller in the image of Thoreau that narrates to us the current situation .Thus Thoreau appropriately transcends time through assimilation of oral encounters in narration of present moment where we find a connective relation in correlated stream of conscious as one walks through the modern times .

Though Thoreau spend a secluded walled in existence in Walden ,still his existence cannot altogether be said to have not been uninfluenced by his time and contemporaries .Isaiah Smithson writes elaborately in this context how picturesque imagery well seeps into Thoreau’s writings. Isaiah writes, “Thoreau’s writing, like the writing of most nineteenth-century travel and nature writers, includes picturesque images and strategies” (Schneider 105).Thus when we trace the evolution of Thoreau’s style and writing pattern ,the influence of Gilpin inevitably occurs as his works ranging from Journals to letters ,including *Walden*(1854) which has a reference made to Gilpin and to Gilpin’s works like *Remarks on forest Scenery* (1834).Thoreau writes in *Walden* (1854) thus :

Gilpin, in his account of the forest borderers of England, says that ‘the encroachments of trespassers, and the houses and fences thus raised on the borders of the forest, were considered as great nuisances by the old forest law, and were severely punished under the name of *purprestures*, as tending *ad terroremferarum - ad nocumentumforestae*,’ etc., to the frightening of the game and the detriment of the forest. (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 193)

However, along with the influence of the writers of his time ,the transcendental influence also surfaces in him where while writers of nineteenth century had aesthetic view of European landscape ,not constraining his art to social and nationalistic leanings, Thoreau as a writer successfully brings down the restrictions of nation and religion on his work and rather suggest emphasis on uniqueness of European landscape rather than emphasising his discussion of European landscape in nationalistic fervour .This could have been possible by transcending ethnicity through timescapes as has been accounted by Isaiah Smithson:

Although Thoreau’s depictions of wild landscapes are firmly grounded in American places such as Concord or Mount Katahdin, the emphasis is not on the “Americanness” of these places, but on their wildness. For Thoreau, wildness is exhibited in selected landscapes, personalities, and works of art from all places and eras; exists in opposition to mere civility; can connect humans with their nonhuman neighbours; and entails freedom that goes beyond nationalism.(Smithson 106)

Likewise, if one takes Jetsun Milarepa as belonging to one sect of school ,it breaks its very foundation on which Milarepa had set its existence .He is seen as the embodied prototype of what a saint should be and thus writing and reading his life story comes at par any jurisdiction.

In the analysis of nature beyond ethnicity ,when one tries to sculp Thoreau's perception on history ,one gets to the position of knowing that Thoreau in his narrative takes history to a greater level of prehistory or prior to history ,to the existence of Adam and Eve and affirms on the greatness and antiqueness of the Walden pond as he goes on to assume on the word perhaps, how "that spring morning when Adam and Eve were driven out of Eden Walden Pond was already in existence, and even then breaking up in a gentle spring rain accompanied with mist and a southerly wind, and covered with myriads of ducks and geese, which had not heard of the fall, when still such pure lakes sufficed them"(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 140).Truly as Thoreau writes ,the pondscape to a great extent is a source of inspiration to Thoreau to the extent that no two chapters have been dedicated to a single subject in *Walden* (1854),but to the ponds that titles "The Ponds" and "The Pond in Winter". Thus for him the landscape of America is accountable only to the extent of its peculiar physical renderings on how the "the mountains are higher, the rivers longer, the forests bigger, the plains broader" (Thoreau , "Walking" 72).

This emphasis on the peculiarity of the landscape also ties Milarepa and Thoreau beyond spatiotemporal existence and within the tradition of timescape cult .If his perception differed with the community of his age ,bringing up the binary contradictions ,it is not a work without evidence to suggest that his perception may have been near Milarepa's perception ,if only one negate the time and space of Tibet and America and think of their coalesce in terms of their perception toward nature .

In *Walking* (1862) Thoreau emphasises on the word "sans terre" that implies the absence of a home or a land which in a positive light implies to what this dissertation aims to formulate ,a study of nature perspective beyond land and continent ,nature that exist beyond spatiotemporal that neither opposes a particular culture nor assimilates it

but there is existence of a sole notion that is succinctly implied by Thoreau as , “ having no particular home, but equally at home everywhere” (*Wild Apples* 59-60).

The study of ecocriticism that emphasises on *Oikos* or study of home implies that adjust in a broader perspective to not one home but a home in everyplace. If sauntering in Walden is a work of two actions at the same time ,covering a distance and perceiving the moment at the same time ,Thoreau can be taken up to be in position of Milarepa in his perception and thought process as it is not always the place that defines the space where if Thoreau “walk out into a nature such as the old prophets and poets, Menu, Moses, Homer, Chaucer, walked in. [one] may name it America, but it is not America”(Thoreau ,*Wild Apples* 66).Thus this sense of looking at nature beyond time and space ,taking all the former inhabitants and future inhabitants along with the present contemporaries comes close to what T.S Eliot marks in “Tradition and the Individual Talent”(1919) as “the historical sense involves a perception ,not only of the pastness of the past ,but of its presence”(Eliot 37).

We can also view the transcendence of space and time which is made possible by the uncommon perception of Thoreau. When men comes to Thoreau and seeks to know about his perception of loneliness in a place like Walden, Thoreau is seen as an ardent philosopher who answers the queries of his visitors ,in the process that appropriates our inquisitiveness on how a man of reasonable learning could spend a lonesome time alone and aloof from society ,what Thoreau answers is in relation to space and distance .The account in *Walden* (1854) that goes as :

This whole earth which we inhabit is but a point in space. How far apart, think you, dwell the two most distant inhabitants of yonder star, the breadth of whose disk cannot be appreciated by our instruments? Why should I feel lonely? is not our planet in the Milky Way? This which you put seems to me not to be the

most important question. What sort of space is that which separates a man from his fellows and makes him solitary? (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 103)

This very nature of question brings Thoreau and Milarepa together again in common plane of spatial existence. Where Thoreau marks to say that “no exertion of the legs can bring two minds much nearer to one another” (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 103), it is a point where a transposition is brought out where the distance between them is surpassed not by legs but by thought and thinking process. It is this thought of like mindedness that has the power to transgress beyond centuries and continents and seek a place where both Milarepa and Thoreau can be brought out in adjunctive togetherness. Marpa himself takes body as a mark of “flesh and blood” but it is the person’s utility of the body that makes a difference. Thus the way one takes to body formulation, such is the nature of Nature which Marpa thus expresses to Milarepa:

Please listen to me out of the unchanging state of your mind... I have understood that this material body, made of flesh and blood along with mental consciousness, is gathered together by the twelve chains of cause and effect - one of which is volition - originating from ignorance. This body is the blessed vessel for those fortunate beings who wish for freedom, but it also leads sinners into the lower realms. (Lhalungpa 77)

Thus what comes forth in this analysis of time conscious approach is the situation of binaries a choice that Marpa marks to make one understand on the approach of choice, “choice between enormous profit and loss, relating to eternal happiness or misery on the border between good and evil”(Lhalungpa xix). Thoreau also emphasis on this choice based on change that the society is phasing through, *Walden* (1854) being a result of his constant attempt to herald people to reconnect to that part of nature in one’s

life. Thinking about his Walden experiences, it is undoubtedly true that he took the experiences not only as a record in his journals that was written for the sole recorded account of his life, as a source of aesthetic beauty for oneself but he undertook a major task in compiling his experiences, it is almost that the readers feel that the best way he acknowledged nature was by communicating his perception of nature to people such that it would broaden the horizon of his satiation of two years amidst nature as:

It is never too late to give up our prejudices. No way of thinking or doing, however ancient, can be trusted without proof... Here is life, an experiment to a great extent untried by me; but it does not avail me that they have tried it. If I have any experience which I think valuable, I am sure to reflect that this my Mentors said nothing about. (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 7,8)

It in itself is a greater construction that we as a reader feel the sense of actually inhabiting the place. Thus the readers experience in itself goes beyond the time construct and to a great extent the publication of such a private account marks *Walden* (1854) as a heroic account of a Greek hero who having closely studied nature brings out his own research of the world as how the a voyager brings news of the new found land to his countrymen.

3.4 Enactivism and Doctrine of the Hour in *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) and *Walden* (1854)

The mindful consciousness that embarks to emancipate the mind's eye can be analyzed to see how the narrative of Thoreau and the life lived by Milarepa as a conscious effort to be in the present moment can be related to the conscious sight that is very much time conscious in record, for it is not something that is sung of the past but of the moment. Enactivism is the term that comes close to this description of time consciousness in action which emphasizes on how "experience of the world is a result of mutual

interactions between the sensorimotor capacities of the organism and the environment”(Wikipedia Contributors .Enactivism).Milarepa’s stories and especially his songs puts forth a time conscious timeline wherein it is not the second thought that comes as one passages the feelings and sight before one takes it to printed version but rather it is a spontaneous vision ,the immediate that is the source of his spontaneous songs.

In oral records of Milarepa ,what one finds is variability ,every time he is exposed to a new scene of relative truth ,encounters a new personality in his way of ascetism ,what flows forth out of this spontaneity is variability whether in the narration of the story or in his oral songs .Surprisingly Milarepa’s songs have been compiled into hundred thousand songs still the peculiarity of the songs is attributed to variety that is very much the hallmark of every oral songs that were formed before this newer codification of written words made emergence ,that though helped one to record but it was a record with repetition ,as memorizing became more shallow, that attributed the use of memory without creativity .Thus a transition from oral to written tradition is a record of repetition, of verses and phrases which very much makes up the modern literary canon where plagiarism is not an uncommon incident .

In the analysis of consciousness, the term enactivism can be studied as has been delivered by Evan Thompson in *Mind in Life* (2007) that studies how “cognition arises through a dynamic interaction between an acting organism and its environment” (Thompson) .This interaction also surfaces in the tradition of the lineage of Milarepa. If one goes to view the compiled biography of saints it is not true to say that in the context of Tibet it is only Milarepa’s life that came into existence but the lives lived prior to him ,the life records of saints like Marpa,the teacher of Milarepa, the Indian pundit Naropa and Tilopa has also been brought forth where the study of the life of

realization of these saints, their conscious power and spiritual awakening were narrated as *namthar*, thus to a great extent the position of consciousness and their relation with other beings were set as a standard of record where realization and consciousness both signified formulated action coming close to *Vimoksha*, which is a Sanskrit term which emphasizes on the mode or the process of awakening and attaining enlightened action by renouncing attachment and enjoyment .

Just as some intertextual discussion Thoreau puts up in *Walden* (1854), in a similar way the songs of Milarepa comes up in alignment with the narration .It is however to be remembered that though in one read it seems that it has found a sequential draft that flows with plot yet in careful considered reality, one realizes that each song has affinity to current situation which connects with the whole rather than being part of a whole narration . The influence of the place is well reflected in this enactmentism where due to the interaction of Milarepa with the surrounding environ ,either in the case of recitation or composition of spontaneous songs we have a relation between the participant-perceiver and the place .In this sense the chronology in Milarepa is set in pace but each song being an outcome of time conscious, dwells in present circumstance. In his songs we see the emergence of stillness of the mind where focus is pioneered to the point of concentration at current moment ,which finds its existence in Sanskrit word *samatha*, “so called because by one-pointed concentration the activity of the mind is stilled”(Rinpoche and Cutillo 12).

This legacy of consciousness in action is also reflected in Emerson, in his words that marks his perception as a wheel that never stops rolling ,unlike the myth of Sisyphus and its ongoing action ,enactmentism is not seen in negative light as was done by existentialist but it fostered a presence of a cult where being alive meant living ,just

as Emerson aptly writes, “God is, not was ; that He speaketh ,not spake” (Atkinson 80).

To analyze Thoreau’s emphasis on present moment, needs however a wider study of his concept of time and to know his concept of time is to examine how he followed his days. Thoreau was a person for whom the days of weeks were what according to his perception made a moment .As the influence of Emerson goes well into making of Thoreau, “Nature”(1836) was a work that Thoreau revered and there has been instances of the echo of “Nature” (1836) in his college essays that sums his final years at Harvard. The influence of time conscious living is reflected much in Thoreau,the mode of time that is moment wise, which calls for celebration of what time bestows upon the conscious inhabitation calls for a mode of living with nature which is put forth in deliberate lines of Emerson as , “Not the sun or the summer alone, but every hour and season yields its tribute of delight; for every hour and change corresponds to and authorizes a different state of the mind from breathless noon to grimed midnight” (Atkinson 6).

In *The Life of Milarepa* (1997), much is said about consciousness and more so of the matter that hinders the consciousness .Marpa provides one of the crux that hinder conscious thinking ,that drives people away from present time conscious i.e. constant wishing that comes from ignorance .Thus satiation and living fully amidst nature eradicates this hunger of more and many that never cease in account of the fast pace mechanical time .Thoreau himself emphasises in his journals the gold digging trend of his time that is based not on natural time as sowing a seed, growth and fruition which Thoreau brings to practicality in the field of Walden but the gold digging becomes a competition based on volition ,the present digging that connects one not to present but in every moment it drives one to future ,a moment when one would have excavated a

gold ,the never ending volition that centres its thought not on present situation but forever takes one to the future and thus eludes one of time conscious thinking .

There are various instance in *Walden* (1854) where Thoreau's time conscious views can be calculated through .There are instances where Thoreau continuously speaks about his present situation ,in time conscious narration he counts every bead of time that is neither of past or future but of now, of "just now" and of "today" as he illustrates in chapter ,"Brute Neighbours", "Was that a farmer's noon horn which sounded from beyond the woods just now?", "Hark! I hear a rustling of the leaves...Eh, Mr. Poet, is it you? How do you like the world today? Poet: See those clouds; how they hang! That's the greatest thing I have seen today" (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 173). Here the conversation between the hermit and the poet in the wild drives the reader to a clear assumption of how their conversation starts and end with today , it never speaks of how one had been but of how well one is doing today .

This adherence to the current moment is the law of nature which comes in the metaphoric actions of wild beings as Thoreau writes, "The wildest animals do not repose, but seek their prey now".(Thoreau,*Walden and Civil Disobedience* 100).The chapter "Solitude" is where Thoreau pictures and portrays the ever adjunct "now", the inherited presence of now ,as such *Walden* (1854) almost at most passages thunders the wide proclaiming current presentment. Thoreau thus claims how meticulously he could speculate the nature in time conscious now .

At times however we see the present moment dissipate .In the essay , "Water-Signs:Place and Metaphor in Dillard and Thoreau" James A. Papa, Jr writes about Dillard ,we can view how Dillard sees consciousness and its moment of dissipation .She implicates that "the fullness of what I see shatters" where the continuity of action or what we call the present part "is constantly being ripped apart and washed

downstream”. Thoreau might have experienced a similar vision where half of his account evokes his fancy and imagination, the philosophy that places the empty image into a magnificence manifesto. Like the half drawn image, he is compelled to complete the nature and its momentous evolution, the task he carries out commendably in *Walden* (1854) by the use of imagination. Milarepa for this matter looks and sings forth the spontaneous song before the wing of the bird changes to a different posture which is very much possible as he tends his songs with the colour of spontaneity or of which Dillard writes, “fish flashes, then dissolves in the water before eyes like so much salt,” (qtd. in Schneider 73).

Milarepa thus sings in spontaneity:

I dreamed that to the North a great pillar was raised.

At the top of this pillar soared a vulture,

Its pointed wings were spread.

Its nest perched on a crag.

This vulture had a fledgling

And the sky was full of little birds.

The vulture gazed upward

And impelled itself through space. (Lhalungpa 83)

Just as Robert Frost writes in “The Figure a Poem Makes” on how poetry is “momentary stay against confusion”, here if reality and the current situation is a flowing water it seems that literary art as poetry and prose are as the lurched stones thrown in the stream, it stills the part of the stream for a fraction of time and thus there is a moment for one to capture reality, yet if one fails to see the stillness in the moment when the stone touches the stream, the poetry will flow along the stream of time never to be found again.

The study of time consciousness in *Walden* (1854) further encapsulates the thought of self and other. While Thoreau takes and sees Nature as an entity which one appropriates and prefigures in the span of natural time, he also talks about the familiarisation of space just as one weaves a linen cloth, which one familiarises in the span of weaving it out. This familiarisation is what nature has given to the perceiver and where the woods, the ponds and the very Walden space is “appropriated and fenced in some way, and reclaimed from Nature”. Not facing much visitors Thoreau seizes to see Nature and himself as one entity and all other visitor as trespassers. When he sees no human visitors he is accustomed by thought as though the place is “is as much Asia or Africa as New England” and elaborates the circumference of the sense of belonging to “own sun and moon and stars, and a little world all to myself” (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 101).

Thoreau seeing a place as world is a marked evidence of what one can call the absence of boundaries, the cultural stimuli that emancipates this prefixes to our existent condition of viability. The extent to which he views the natural artefacts of the sun and the moon belonging solely to himself, where he can claim an existence of a space that can be named consciousness of present moment as well as unconscious adherence to a position where he neither moves nor is non-stagnant in a place. Thus this process of familiarization comes in Thoreau when he feels that “no place could ever be strange to me again” (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 102).

In the adventure that he has near the pond where he does fishing at night, Thoreau tries to bring the fishes at the edge of the pond by lightening a fire and in course of his haunt of the place, he believes to have made a home in this uncommon place. He thus writes, “But now I had made my home by the shore”. At an instance the presence of consciousness comes to forefront as in the wait for the fishes the

environment overpowers him and he goes to the state of vastness .Eco-consciousness as such is aptly brought up with the dramatic action of , “ this faint jerk, which came to interrupt your dreams and link you to Nature again”. He thus writes , “ it seemed as if I might next cast my line upward into the air, as well as downward into this element, which was scarcely more dense. Thus I caught two fishes as it were with one hook”(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 137).The “two fishes” as such that Thoreau allude to in his lines of “The Ponds” is the fish in the pond and the other is the present consciousness that Thoreau caught in the rod of presentism .

Thus the transcendence in time and ethnicity is well brought forward in *Walden* (1854) where the communication between the old man and Thoreau can be taken as metaphoric conversation of two individuals beyond age and place fixity which can be seen in a similar light of the comparative study of Thoreau and Milarepa and the outcome of this conversation positions very closely the assumed relation between Milarepa and Thoreau. The conversation in the narrative goes as ,“ not many words passed between us, for he had grown deaf in his later years, but he occasionally hummed a psalm, which harmonized well enough with my philosophy. Our intercourse was thus altogether one of unbroken harmony, far more pleasing to remember than if it had been carried on by speech”(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 135-136).Here the two people, the old man and Thoreau are at two ends of the boat which gives us the picture of two beings who are in physical account separated by age and the space between ,just as Milarepa and Thoreau are separated by ages ,yet as when Thoreau admits that the hymn of the old man created harmony and communication more pleasing than speech,it decodes the very construct of understanding ,the other beyond the self ,the togetherness that is not constrained either by age or distance in space but just like the hymn of the old man ,it is the song of nature that binds both Milarepa and Thoreau. Somewhere we

find the invisible connection that brings them together in the same boat of non visible eco- space .

3.5 Studying Non -Visible Effects of Nature on Milarepa and Thoreau

If eco-consciousness is taken in terms of awakening to the present moment ,Thoreau's philosophy in *Walden* (1854) makes a clear gesture to readers on how it can surpass time and place where he further lays a greater emphasis on non- visible aspects of life as he notes in chapter "Solitude":

Any prospect of awakening or coming to life to a dead man makes indifferent all times and places. The place where that may occur is always the same, and indescribably pleasant to all our senses... 'How vast and profound is the influence of the subtile powers of Heaven and of Earth!' 'We seek to perceive them, and we do not see them; we seek to hear them, and we do not hear them; identified with the substance of things, they cannot be separated from them. (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 103,104)

The powers of "Heaven and Earth" according to Thoreau is what we try to give abstraction to, there always lies the attempt to make any non-visible entity to exert visibility so that it can better be dissected .However according to Thoreau and according to timescape theory of Barbara Adams we often indulge on our analysis of visible things while things that are non-visible are more potent and impactful .In this regard Barbara Adams notes on how radioactivity and as portrayed by *Silent Spring* (1962),the impact of DDT and so to call the influence of nature on the slow redress of solitude and the build-up of invisible consciousness on a being all points to the importance of invisible over visible things .

Concepts too like quest for knowledge are for findings not yet visible ,findings on invisibility is probably what has framed consciousness of human and in a broader

sense this symbiotic relation between man and natural environment .Nature in itself and its emerging evolution ,the impact of ecology on the slow evolution of human kind, all culminate to the fact of indispensable importance of invisible elements .Though, in the account of *Walden* (1854) we cannot see the metamorphic change as is depicted in the narrative of Milarepa's emulating the greenness of nature in the physical scale , yet the invisible effect of nature on Thoreau is quite brought out in his lines of his memoir. He writes, “ We seek to perceive them, and we do not see them; we seek to hear them, and we do not hear them”(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 104)

In the study of the non-visible effect of nature on Milarepa's life and Thoreau's stay in Walden one can view their life as an art ,an account of some unimaginable and unaccountable notes of nature that surfaces in their writings .The purpose of art as has been accorded by Asher Durand comes close to the concept where art is always there to elevate a part of nature that might never have been visible to naked eyes .Durand writes on how art is , “impressing the mind through the visible forms of material beauty, with a deep sense of the invisible and immaterial” (qtd.in Smithson 103).

As a writer of nineteenth century America, Thoreau is not only the representator of nature writing in America but in his writing as in the writers of all ages some influences of the century is indelibly marked in his works along with exposition of his personal theories on life. In this analysis if at times Thoreau comes close to writing pattern of his century at other times his writing expresses the transition, the obvious instances of going beyond the boundary of age and century. In the nonvisible study of nature, in a comparative analysis of Milarepa and Thoreau what one see is how rather than tangible close natural objects of Thoreau's interest, Milarepa goes beyond the confines of a categorised renditions of natural objects and places the play of light on realistic nature.

In the subsequent lines of *Walden* (1854), Thoreau emphasizes on how even looking at a landscape from different viewpoint can bring forth the transformation where the transformation of the Walden Pond is traced by Thoreau as, “Walden is blue at one time and green at another, even from the same point of view. Lying between the earth and the heavens, it partakes of the color of both.” Here thinking and perceiving are taken as two different truths where for the thinkers the truth as has been laid bare is within the circumference of what is seen without an effort of analysis where , “some think it is bottomless”, while a perceiver expects nothing that is said or documented but adventures to dwell deep, above and beyond what has already been said and beneath the surface which is yet to be deciphered .It is in this process that Thoreau writes how a perceiver will attempt to see the things in spite of admonitions .Thoreau thus writes:

Some think it is bottomless. It is nowhere muddy, and a casual observer would say that there were no weeds at all in it; and of noticeable plants, except in the little meadows recently overflowed, which do not properly belong to it, a closer scrutiny does not detect a flag nor a bulrush, nor even a lily, yellow or white. (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 137,139).

In this account of the biography of Milarepa and the years spent by Thoreau on Walden space ,the emergence of yogi and the perspective of the yogi also needs to be analyzed.²⁸Thoreau addressed as “Yogi of Walden” and Milarepa as “Yogi of the East”, needs a broader analysis in the context of visible and non-visible aspects of nature ,as to how they differ from common man and what and how did they seek to view nature for what was invisible to people ,in this context the study of solitude and its invisible effects on man and the choice of a yogi to live in for solitude can be delved further .In

²⁸The word Yogi here is used in the context of Yoga, where *yui* ,the root of yoga is the alignment to God or in simple terms literally means to unite .

Walden (1854) Thoreau laid a great emphasis on solitude which he builds as a contrast to aloneness and aloofness. He subtly brings out how thinking makes one less aloof, when solitude is not brought out as loneliness but rather it is seen as a fruitful company that one often encounters amidst nature, while its presence can seldom be found in the populated overcrowded human habitation. Thoreau recounts there can be no greater companion than solitude if one undertakes a task just as how, “The farmer can work alone in the field or the woods all day, hoeing or chopping, and not feel lonesome, because he is employed; but when he comes home at night he cannot sit down in a room alone, at the mercy of his thought” (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 105).

Thus Thoreau puts up various instances of the importance of solitude with examples as to how solitude dissipates and works through loneliness, sees it at some point as an entity like consciousness that transcends time and space. In the words of Thoreau, “Solitude is not measured by the miles of space that intervene between a man and his fellows.” Where he further writes, how he, “never found the companion that was so companionable as solitude”. Thoreau puts forth in *Walden* (1854) his own experience in Cambridge in autobiographical note with a reference being made to a student whose mark of diligence is marked by his aloofness from the crowd, who is “solitary as a dervish in the desert” even in “the crowded hives of Cambridge College” (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 105). At point it signifies how Thoreau in his student life and Milarepa as student under the tutelage of Marpa, never saw themselves as alone being in vast immensity of Walden space or amidst Tibet’s mountains.

Solitude in society of Tibet also comes in symbolic terms like the significance attached to the beer analogy. The significance of beer is hailed out in the society of Tibet not only as an important beverage but as in chapter “Initiations and Instructions” in *The Life of Milarepa* (1997), Marpa reveals to Milarepa the significance of drinking

the beer which is offered to Milarepa in his task of ploughing the field. In the society of Tibet, things not only had physical connotation but carried a symbolic significance wherefore if the beer worked primarily for quenching the thirst and keeping the body warm it also carried symbolic significance, as Marpa says to Milarepa:

This beer and the work that you had finished signified that, in penetrating to the heart of the Doctrine, you will grasp the entire teaching. The copper pot you gave with the four handles signified the coming of my four great disciples... The empty pot symbolized the meagerness of your food during the time of your meditation in solitude. (Lhalungpa 74)

While even in our modern society we seldom reserve some days of solitude to ponder on the teachings reviewed in a day, primarily in society of Tibet mere receiving the doctrine was not taken the end of the learning process, the teaching was to be mastered by the disciple himself, thus Rechungpa asks to Milarepa, ““Master, after hearing the Doctrine, did you immediately go into solitude or did you remain with the lama?””(Lhalungpa 75). The question of Rechungpa clarifies to great extent how solitude was indelible mark of standard which whetted the scholarly mind further, thus the significance of solitude among the mountains was an important step of knowledge seeking. Having known this tradition and having followed the same, Rechungpa’s question validate the situation of Milarepa .

Thoreau in *Walden* (1854) is seen by people, presumably by his visitors as a lonesome person, as he lives aloof from society cum culture cum near nature. He thus writes in this context, “The sun is alone, except in thick weather, when there sometimes appear to be two, but one is a mock sun. God is alone - but the devil... I am no more lonely than the Mill Brook, or a weathercock, or the north star, or the south wind, or an April shower, or a January thaw, or the first spider in a new house”. Here living in

solitude brings one closer to nature, where having lived in solitude without a companionship is a mode that brings him closer to nature ,to be a part of Nature where nature is a part of that emotional build up where the clouds tear down and the leaves fall to deliver a grieving over a lost friend ,thus finally amidst solitude of Walden that can be taken as one instance of non -visible effect of nature on man where he seeks to put forth an affirmative question as :

The indescribable innocence and beneficence of Nature - of sun and wind and rain, of summer and winter - such health, such cheer, they afford forever! and such sympathy have they ever with our race, that all Nature would be affected, and the sun's brightness fade, and the winds would sigh humanely, and the clouds rain tears, and the woods shed their leaves and put-on mourning in midsummer, if any man should ever for a just cause grieve. Shall I not have intelligence with the earth? Am I not partly leaves and vegetable mould myself?
(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 107,106)

In the prologue to *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) likewise a reference is made to the final awakening of Milarepa which is said to have been made amidst mountains, in encumbered solitude of nature where “shoots of awakening sprang up within him” (Lhalungpa 2). Thus if in Thoreau's account in *Walden* (1854) we see human attributes in nature predominate in the passages, in the account of Milarepa we find rather Milarepa's change as metaphor with the natural form and activity as emergence of enlightenment comes forth as shoots in the forest, slow ,steady yet the organic emergence that inspires its direction in upward movement .

The greater impact made by solitude on Milarepa can be recorded in the emergence of his first song where in the biography his spontaneous songs comes after

he encounters solitude in Tiger Nak Cave .²⁹The significance also lies in the fact that when after eleven month in solitude, he is asked about his realization ,Milarepa speaks not in direct words but rather sings a song ,thus it can be deciphered that solitude greatly makes a change even in the manner of his communication of thoughts .He thus sings, “Song of the Sevenfold Devotions”:

O Master, who, to the eyes of impure seekers,
Appears in diverse forms,
And, to the assembly of pure Bodhisattvas,
Manifests as Sambhogakaya Buddha, I salute you...
I repent of all my sins, one by one.
I delight in the virtuous deeds of others.
I implore you to turn the Wheel of the Law far and wide.(Lhalungpa 76)

In the preface to *The Life of Milarepa* (1997), Jetsun Milarepa is addressed as the master of the sounds. It is also alluring to note that one who is master of the sound inevitably is the master of solitude. Once mastering sound, he masters emptiness too. “He was the master of sound, who understood the essential nonduality of sound and emptiness, and who interpreted the meaning of the prophetic signs, good and evil, revealed by the inner and outer sounds of nature”(Lhalungpa 5).Still what comes home to the readers is how Milarepa tries to give concreteness to the concept of solitude ,Milarepa thus takes solitude to have had its origin in mountains, for him solitude of mountains is of a specific kind of which he makes a reference as “mountain solitude” just as Thoreau emphasises on solitude to have chaired in a single chair, Thoreau thus marks a magnanimous chapter on how solitude entered his very skin to the point of his physical dimension being sculpted as a solitaire .In the chapter “visitors” this transition can be

²⁹Tiger Nak cave is one of the caves where Milarepa meditated.

felt in a more translucent manner as he finds solace and a sense of non-isolation by being more with himself than with the company of the three visitors. The laying of the chairs implicitly objectifies the subject, his inner turbulence emerging as he writes, “I had three chairs in my house; one for solitude, two for friendship, three for society”(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 108).

This solitary existence further connects Thoreau with what can be taken as yogi's existence. Thoreau writes in the start of the chapter “Visitors”, “I am naturally no hermit, but might possibly sit out the sturdiest frequenter of the bar-room, if my business called me thither”(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 108). Here the lines clearly implies that Thoreau takes hermit to be a natural process, the silence and composure that goes into framing a hermit existence. The word Hermit or eremite as defined in *Britannica: Ready Reference Encyclopedia* is “individual who shuns society to live in solitude, often for religious reasons.” (volume 5 p. 24). The word hermit thus implies a lone being in the posture of composure amidst the forest radiating peace which in itself comes via the lane of binary between hermit life and the modern frenzied life. Thus the landscape at a great part frames the existence and composure of the hermit.

However in Thoreau and Milarepa what we see is the modern settler of this concretised definition, we see a flexible orientation in the makeup of these modern yogi. Thoreau in this context refers to a woodchopper who had a great interest in Homer. His name Thoreau admits not to give as he calls him “Homeric or Paphlagonian man”, wherein looking at his physical dexterity Thoreau thinks that he could have dug “fifty post in a day”. Thoreau feels and we can see him connecting with the other side of the world, he had left that made him remark: “Vice and disease, which cast such a sombre moral hue over the world, seemed to have hardly any existence for him”(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 112). Though the man lives in the same plot of land as

Thoreau ,yet he is not aware of the vices that exist in a world beyond ,thus he is in a state of hermitage himself ,while in Thoreau we see the changed alteration where just as in the William Blake’s “Songs of Innocence and Songs of Experience”, Thoreau has moved from innocence to experience and thus gets a better grip of reality while now living a more aware life he is the modern yogi of the time .

What we see in the modern yogi is the ability to be unhasteful even when one is surrounded by hasteful society, thus when Thoreau sees the Yankee man and when we analyse the mode in which Thoreau has interest in him we can see how the Yankee man has internalised all that nature would mean to Thoreau in later years where his two years in Walden has been an everyday trial in this passage of nature emulation .Thoreau thus remarks in *Walden* (1854) how the Yankee had caught his attention because , “he was so quiet and solitary and so happy withal; a well of good humour and contentment which overflowed at his eyes... with a laugh of inexpressible satisfaction”. Thus at a point Thoreau’s liking of nature goes via -negativa, which however is directed towards himself ,he lacks the “inexpressible satisfaction”, the callousness to anytime “suspend his work”, for now he wants to follow the natural time rather than the clock ridden time and thus emphasise on the “exuberance of animal spirits”(Thoreau,*Walden and Civil Disobedience* 112-113).

Milarepa’s life likewise lays a greater emphasis in the independent movement as one of the hallmarks of a yogi where the independence is set forth in this break up from social norms . Milarepa thus sings:

My religious name is DorjeGyentsen,

But I'm known as yogi Milarepa.

I go wherever I feel like going.

This is my answer to your questions. (Rinpoche and Cutillo 48)

Milarepa thus brings out the true implication of being a yogi where he asserts one of the characteristics of a yogi being independence both mental and physical, as he speaks on the dialectics of mind and body in his lines, the relation between consciousness, conscience and coexistence as:

If the two are indivisibly one,

Why would a corpse be left behind

At the time of death when consciousness leaves?

And if they are totally separate

Why would the mind experience pain

When harm happens to the body? (Rinpoche and Cutillo 50)

Milarepa further hints on the fearless mind as a yogic mind. Milarepa in a conversation with a yogi reiterates that a real yogi is one who is free from all bindings and hence liberated from all form of fear which further includes breaking free from the non-visible fear syndrome. As nature itself fears none , neither imitates anyone for the sake of acceptance Milarepa speaks out his thought thus ,“If a yogi is afraid to stay in mountain retreats, he hasn't even tasted the scent of yoga. You must identify the goal, which is the natural state, by learning and thinking”. The robe of thin cotton linen of Milarepa also reflects his inner self ,it not only depicts his callous attitude towards worldly attachment it also reflects the contentment he feels in the present situation ,one who seeks not to live for future but is content if the current weather is apposite to his garment. He thus sings :

I rely on the constant wealth of contentment...

In winter I sleep in mountain retreats,

Cotton robe burning like a fire

Summer I sleep in torrid valleys,

Cotton robe cool as a breeze.

Springtime I rest on the gravel of canyons,

Cotton robe soft as wool.

In autumn I go out begging alms,

Cotton robe light as a feather.

Are you really happy, yogi?

Is there another as happy as me? (Rinpoche and Cutillo 69, 139)

Yoginess also is the cult of giving away “attachment or indolence” (Lhalungpa 3). If one analyses the cult with regard to Thoreau’s two years in Walden and his experience in having a solitary livelihood, he too forsakes both attachment and indolence where detachment comes in the form of non-expectancy and thus without any indolence he tills the field and without attachment of consequences of his everyday ordeal, he sows the seed in present.

While yogis are often to a great extent seen as non-productive group of people who goes to mountains for salvation, does nothing productive that lends to the economy of society. However if this is to be thought so then the songs of the Milarepa and the memoir of Thoreau would not have reached the heights of reverence that implies that the yogis apart from having a spiritual journey partakes to know nature and through it they bring a better version of the world. Evan Wentz foresees that the “the highest aim of every sincere yogi, be he Hindu, Buddhist, Jain, Taoist, Sufi, or Gnostic Christian, is first to fit himself to become a World-Teacher and then to return to human society and carry out his Vow.” (Wentz 19) where emphasis has been laid on realization of truth before one precedes to the task of teaching. As such everything seems to be connected with self and other, where there is no self without other, no realization without external

force ,nor the conformation and the affirmation unless one have tested what one has realized .

There are instances of the dominant communication made in early Buddhist stories where an encounter of truth has had a mode of communication with non-human elements like land and animals .Lord Buddha himself is said to have made an encountered monologue with the land that he inhabited where he makes the land the witnesses of the knowledge he had attained in his meditative practice ,all yogic forms in a similar way comes the way round to emphasise of the assimilation of the other in the self ,that remains incomplete without analysing and discussing the process of gradual change in Milarepa's perception towards nature as he marks to position the prism of conscious realization .

The renunciation of family and one's land by yogis comes close to what may be related as a reach for commonplaceness, not family that decipher its root by blood relation but families of the planet conscious citizen that goes beyond one culture to higher culture that relates humans with hon –humans too. Truly Thoreau himself is a yogi in modern sense who, in a secular line of expression goes beyond class, culture and redirects his exposition and the awareness amidst nature ,as he learns and delivers his progressive thought as :

Nature and human life are as various as our several constitutions. Who shall say what prospect life offers to another? Could a greater miracle take place than for us to look through each other's eyes for an instant? We should live in all the ages of the world in an hour; ay, in all the worlds of the ages. History, Poetry, Mythology! -- I know of no reading of another's experience so startling and informing as this would be. (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 9)

This is a form of yogic experience that Milarepa takes along just as Thoreau in *Walden* (1854) where he makes an exposition of experience as one that goes beyond self and takes even the 'other' in a wide range of togetherness, here is the emergence of "perfect seeing" of which Milarepa says :

It is necessary to observe one's vows as carefully as one guards one's eyes. Even in failure, remedies must be employed. By not seeking one's own liberation on the path of the Lesser Vehicle, one develops Bodhichitta (enlightened mind), which seeks to work toward the liberation of all sentient beings. It is my understanding that the development of an enlightened attitude leads one to rededicate, for the good of all.(Lhalungpa 77)

CHAPTER-IV

Singing Landscapes: A Study of Oral Songs of Milarepa and Eco-Prose of Thoreau

4.1 Introduction

Language is often taken as a mode of representing nature, it is also truly pervasive in the sense that each individual's perception towards nature differs and so does one's representative tool. Nature writing as such has never been put forth in a confining relation with genre, as genre has evolved to be an important asset that has emerged from language. In the representation of nature the only thing that remains accomplishable is how best to represent ideas. While some notions find and fit their way through prose narrative mode others that follow terse poetic lines come up to their own esoterisms. Thoreau however uses prose to a greater extent to explicate his ideas of nature, to explore the landscape in personal thought rendering relation with the ecology of the Walden space.

While Thoreau marks use of prose in most of his nature writing, Milarepa hails to partake in a philosophical rendering of songs of realization. Thoreau's choice of prose in *Walden* (1854) emphasizes on the expression of subjective opinion rather than a culmination of what he feels at a surface level. He seeks to not hide his perception of nature on brevity but partakes to explore and express nature in decipherable phrases, one that is within the reach of common man. At times Thoreau is seen at loss in his nature analyses that the ideas that occurs to him and what he wants to express to his readers is made possible only with an elaborated explanation and forms like essays and prose seems to adhere to this motive.

Thoreau seldom uses the poetic lines which can be brought forth in relation with the landscape that he inhabited. Analyzing two contrasting landscape that Milarepa

and Thoreau lived in, it seems that Milarepa as an itinerant traveler touched each places, walked different lanes thus fostering his life in mobile transition of spaces. Such travel and every day voyage he took in Tibet could have served him well to have its record in any other way but by the terseness of his songs. Here his use of songs can also be related with the flexibility of the form where his songs cum poetic lines has its own peculiarity. It has the spontaneity that also makes up his life where his songs has the color and form of the very landscape that he inhabited. Walking and pondering, seeing and sighting, humming and humanizing he calls out his songs spontaneously. While for Thoreau who desired to “speak somewhere *without* bounds” can be seen as assimilating a rather fluent and non-confined genre of prose in *Walden* (1854) where he could express “like a man in a waking moment, to men in their waking moments” (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 252).

In *Sense of Place and Sense of Planet: The Environmental Imagination of the Global* (2008), Ursula K Heise brings out two prospective on the local and the global. The oral songs and the tradition of Tibet comes up as a study of local understanding of environment while Thoreau’s sense of place somehow dissolves and emancipates a horizon as global perspective in formation. The local and the global has been put forth in adjunctive columns where the local narrative ties one to “local sense of place, identity[one that valorizes]rural traditional stories, culture” where the aspect towards nature is “direct experience with nature”. While the global is “indoor-centered experience” (Allen 51-52). This indoor experience can be formulated in the context of Thoreau’s experience of nature in his cabin and in the Walden space where the experience of Thoreau becomes one of enclosure as the title itself suggest at the walled-in indoor environment .

In analysis of this local and global perspective it is pertinent to record the study and evolution of landscape through the perspective of Ecocriticism .It is in the late twentieth century that a vast amount of literature flowed with ecocritical perspectives that made its walk beyond the relation between humans and non-humans to a state of place and perspective relative .The emergence of works like Wendell Berry's *The Unsettling of America* (1977) and Gary Snyder's *The Practice of the Wild* (1990) and *A Place in Space* (1995) are some of the works that turned the major focus of Eco critics to place and its relation with humans and non-human inhabitants. Thoreau's *Walden* (1854) and his essays like *Walking* (1862) emphasizes a significant role of place and space ,which now is taken as a major area of research that is often read to arrive at psychological, sociological understanding of Thoreau and his place ,more so in the better understanding of wilderness.

While the landscape of Tibet finds a meticulous description in the oral songs of Milarepa that further marks a point of analysis where the landscape can be seen to have had a greater influence on Milarepa's songs ,the pattern of oral stories ,the seated position of Milarepa addressing the crowd in the horizon speaks for the choice of songs as a genre ,the various visitors to the rugged landscape of Tibet ,to the caves where Milarepa unfolded his spontaneous songs all relates him to a greater acknowledgement of the land and the influence of the landscape on the yogi of Tibet .Thoreau likewise in *Walden* (1854) constantly makes a shift from mind's eye to an eye of metaphor which shows how justly it can be said that the same landscape have varied alteration of lines that comes out of the author's thought process. Genre and the use of genre as such shifts with the shift in perception where a narrow boundary can be set between the change that can be recorded in the transition from mind's eye to eye of metaphors.

In *Observations on the Western Parts of England* (1854), Gilpin emphasise on the picturesque as one where nature “would look well in a picture” (Schneider 103), while Durand emphasises on the form of art that had exactness in its look with nature. Thoreau’s writing to some extent tries to depict nature only if it looks well in his writings. Just as the concept of Gilpin, his depiction of nature in his writing should look well in form while Milarepa took his songs as well as his physical body as a form of art that would look like a nature. The greenness of the body, the stationary stillness and the growing locks suggest the growth of the roots that like the nature’s esoterisms sets Milarepa in archaism. It is at this juncture that Milarepa builds up nature beyond the bounds of stratification, his songs flows like river with all its naturality, nature that penetrates his songs, his thinking process and later, much to the nature of his lineage of Kagyu that is taken as lineage of a stream.

4.2 Mode of Primary Works of Jetsun Milarepa And Henry David Thoreau in the context of oral and written tradition

Lawrence Buell, in the foreword to a major work *Thoreau’s Sense of Place: Essays in American Environmental Writing* (2000) emphasizes on how a personality can set up a mark on nature writing tradition, can successfully create a tradition of its own among all existing contemporary traditions. He writes:

Thoreau was a giant in the “nature writing” tradition (among other traditions), it is hard to identify a first-rate successor who has felt for him the same worshipful admiration that, say, Dante felt for Virgil and Pope for Milton. To feel “close” to Thoreau is probably bound to mean, for a thinking person, experiencing both a sense of rejection and the will to be nobody’s disciple. (Buell x)

This magnanimous contribution of Thoreau that he toiled by his diversifying works ranging from journals, essays to memoirs, that his works has provided becomes a source of active metabolic verb in the noun that has still been the major nectarous flower that has drawn and continues to draw critics and scholars for discussion. Further it has also been an appropriate site of comparative study. *Walden* (1854) as a work has set its own mark by meticulous detailing of a person's life, collective events of twenty six months and two days. No other person but Thoreau could have chaptered his life events that intrepidly to seep it into the confessional lines of an evolving author. There is a reflection of a life from the point of economy to a point of a position where the study of nature further finds connectivity with sociology to psychology, economy to environment, reading to rendering.

John Miles Foley makes a phenomenal question of the time when interpretation of oral literary were quite difficult as compared to today's time in digital renderings. He writes:

How do we interpret works of literature whose roots lie in oral tradition? What difference does a work's oral aspect make to its criticism, explanation, and study? Not long ago questions of this sort would have been effectively unanswerable, and not long before that they could not have been posed, much less answered. (Foley 1)

Foley contributes this easy passage in today's time to the usefulness of the electronic means, a "secondary orality" that not only helps one to grasp the range of oral history but makes a tangible affirmative value of oral tradition by giving a recognition to it, the importance of this pre-literate history to trace the evolution of the civilization. He records the existence of oral history from England to American rural south and to further add to this line of influential oral tradition is the inclusion of the literary

evolution of Tibet ,which had a strong basis on oral songs and stories where when tradition meets placeness , orality meets history .

The first record of the emerging oral research is said to have been made by Milman Parry which was a result of an enquiry set by the man's inquisitive query on how Homer made a collection of his poems possible at a time when written tradition was not much prevalent .Foley writes in this context:

Parry theorized that the Iliad and Odyssey were the collective creations of many generations of bards working not individually but within a poetic tradition. This tradition, as Parry described it, developed its own diction, a specialized poetic language consisting of substitutable "formulas" that enabled a poet to make his verses extemporaneously without having to depend on rote memorization. (Foley 3)

Thus extempore became an important tool to record oral songs and stories, it was a weapon that could be used by the owner at his own innateness .This also becomes analogous to Milarepa's formulation of songs as it is said to have had a greater basis on Doha tradition of India but as the structure of such songs came to Milarepa he wielded it and composed spontaneous long songs sometimes having the peculiarity of a narrative of his whole life ,these were no just the repeated lines of the doha tradition but Milarepa added his own tasteful insights and changes to his tradition of songs of realization where the formulative rhythms were wielded and made suitable to be used according to his need .Thus when he sang to Marpa Lochwa ,his teacher ,it had the rhythmic pattern of reverence, while a song sang to hunter had rhythm of simpler notes while to traders it was the insights put forward in simple sophistication and so does his note floods with emotional bond as he sings to his sister Peter the story of bereftness

and his reunion , thus “oral singers are often pushed towards variation, by their own ingenuity, by their particular audiences or by the wider social situation.” (Goody 87)

At times in oral tradition what becomes more important is authenticity of the source, it is rather more the author himself than the work ,for the genuineness of the author’s existence adds to the value of the work .Thus old English corpus is often seen in dubious appraisals where the question remains on the authentic source of the life of the author. This can also be said of Tibetan literary canon where the search for the author becomes indelibly important .Here what can be seen as a tool of preserving old teller of the tale is the tradition of biographical narration that was very much extant in the then Tibet in the form or *namthar* which meant encrypting the lives of holy human beings .

It is also to be pointed out that just as Milarepa’s songs were a part of who he was ,when one compares the original date of formation of Milarepa’s hundred thousand songs and author’s biography, what comes out is the life story precedes the songs of Milarepa.This clearly puts up the mark in the importance of the author in the Tibetan literary canon .When one again compares the oral tradition of Milarepa with the life of translator of Marpa one can decode the significance put up in the importance of orality where if Milarepa was much known for his oral songs ,Marpa lochwa on the other hand though a great translator was seldom known by people ,this recounts and clarifies on how orality flourished even after the written canon were brought to life. In the biography of Milarepa there is an account of Milarepa’s search for Marpa in the region of “the southern province of Lhobrak”.³⁰ In the way Milarepa encounters a man and

³⁰Lhobrak or Lhodrak Chukhyer is Marpa Lotsawa’s birthplace, the region that stand in the southern part of Tibet .

asks for Marpa Lochwa where “lochwa” in simple terms is the title of translator thus the conversation that takes place afterward is very much alluring and significant to record the significance of oral to written tradition ,that pictures the literary line of Tibetan canon where very few people knew the significance of the translator ,they had better known Marpa as a lama where the popularity of Marpa’s work as a translator had still not reached heights of recognition.The conversation in the biography records:

I began asking all passers-by where great Marpa the Translator lived. But no one knew him. As I reached the pass from where one could see the monastery of Drowo Lung, I put the same question to a man who was passing. He replied, ‘There is certainly a man called Marpa. But there is no one called great Marpa the Translator. ‘Then where is Drowo Lung?’

He pointed it out and I asked him again, ‘Who lives in Drowo Lung?’

‘The man called Marpa lives there.’

‘And he has no other name?’

‘Some call him Lama Marpa’. (Lhalungpa 44-45)

It is undoubtedly true that like this oral conversation where the introduction becomes very much a part of proceedings in a similar way there was a start of the oral stories and songs with the introduction of the teller .In a conversation with Gary Snyder ,she emphasises on the context of a difference between oral conversation and an essay of the lecture made ,she says : “ I've noticed doing transcripts of my own talks and condensing them so that they turn into essays that they take up less space...the sentences in oral presentation are much longer and more complex, and you don't close sentences off nearly so rapidly; you keep making new clauses”(Johns and Snyder 109).

There is one instance where a person from Tiger tribe comes up to Milarepa and asks for dharma, to this Milarepa again gives an elaborated note of his lineage before his suggestions to the person. He sings in “Admonishment To Repa Dorje Wonshu” :

My Lineage is the Lineage of Dorje-Chang,
 My great-grandfather was the noble Tilopa,
 My grandfather was the great PanditaNaropa,
 My father is Marpa the Translator,
 I am the Yogi Milarepa.

These, with the fountainhead of profound Instructions,

Make the six mainstays of my background. (Chang 1:362)

Thus the canon of reference to a person and his life was very much evident in Tibet as has been recounted in many oral songs on Milarepa and by Milarepa. Thus when the existence of Homer is questioned in the West by the canon of current writers just as John Miles Foley : “we do not know who “Homer” was or even whether such a monumental figure actually lived and was responsible for the Iliad and Odyssey the ancients have attributed to him”(qtd. in Foley 7),it becomes very much clear in the Tibetan canon who Milarepa was ,as we know sufficiently from his biography and more so from his songs that he never fades in anonymity for the evidence of his origin ,his birthplace, his lineage and at times his whole life is narrated through oral songs .Thus Tibetan oral songs in its formation itself was conspicuously clear and thus marks an authentic collection in itself .Thus when absence of authorship is emphasised in other literary oral tradition, the author and the originator is very much alive in the Tibetan literary canon.

Likewise in the written tradition of Thoreau , the analysis of the development of writing as a form can be traced to the two way process of coder and decoder ,one

that forms a code orally or written and the other that measures the meaning after listening to verbal code or decoding the written script ,words that help give a form to the meaning .When one goes to the start of the written tradition one becomes aware of the graphic arts that took the lead ,where researchers sees the old stone age as the start of this written tradition .Thus communication was served through writing even before a proper oral tone is said to have been developed .The sign language in itself is another form of visual communication that evolved in the passage of time.Jack Goody even makes a reference to his work of findings on Dakota Indians who , “recorded the passage of time by counting winters, each sign representing an event of the year that had passed” (Goody 13).

Thoreau likewise in the narrative recounts the passage of time not in the note of mechanical time frame but in what can be seen as a natural time, the written tradition of Thoreau thus sets him as a developer of a writing that hails the individual down to the current moment. Thus Thoreau emphasise on how to know nature is to read it meticulously but more so to record its change in writings that has the capacity to record the change in the moment. Thus he writes in *Walden* (1854) , “ So many autumn, ay, and winter days, spent outside the town, trying to hear what was in the wind, to hear and carry it express!” (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 14).

Here when one refers to the early writing system of America, there is a record of “widespread use of pictograms in North America.[Likewise] in South America the Inca of immediately precolonial times employed an elaborate administrative system of record keeping, based on knots” (Goody 18-19),while the central America is said to have had a system which is elaborately described by Marcus as “ complex and elaborate iconography, with a variety of abstract symbols artistically expressed in stone sculpture,

ceramics, and roller-stamps which may have been used for decorating textiles or human bodies”(qtd.in Goody 19).

Jack Goody emphasising on the origin of the written tradition questions elaborately on “How did it change the world of man?” (Goody 54). Among the changes that writing brought to the world, he talks about the easy trade system for merchants, emergence of law on the written mode but among these all, what predominantly comes is the record of history, the past in making. Again, the recollection of folklores, songs, stories of the past in the scripture form, thus coming a way round we see the end of the line making up a circle where oral and written meets again.

There thus is evidence of the existence of written scripts in the eleventh century Tibet but still the popularity of oral transmission was much prevalent as evident of how Milarepa narrates his life story at a very old age not out of any journal or written record as Thoreau does in *Walden* (1854) but out of the oral memory ,the emerging oral songs in Milarepa’s life becomes much more predominant as he leaves the human habitation and walks towards solitary mountainous region .Here when one recounts the state of Milarepa, it becomes evident that in a place where he could not even store a day’s food,storing scriptures and writing materials would not have been possible .Thus ,the best oral songs he delivers is recounted of the time when he goes to retreat in various caves .Thus in Tibetan literary canon it is very much clear that even when there was a clear demarcation set between oral and written tradition ,the oral method was not forsaken rather they were very much incorporated ,adopted and sought by a greater portion of society.

Jack Goody marks a thin threaded relation between oral and written tradition where he assumes that oral and written comes together in conjunctive ‘and’ and not as a choice of juxtaposition ‘or’, as even in the written form, the oral nature often is

reflected in the so-called literary canons which well-marked by dialogues and monologues is prevalent in the written narrative. Thoreau's *Walden* (1854) marks a great adherence to the importance of orality as one notes the change in Walden space through generational perspective. More so is this reflected in the chapter titles of *Walden* (1854) as it makes a transit from "Sounds" to "Solitude", "Visitors" to "Inhabitants and Winter Visitors" "The Ponds" to "The Pond in Winter" and finally from "Winter Animals" to "Spring".

Thus Jack Goody aptly prefaces his work, *The interface between the written and the oral* (1987) with this relation between oral and written tradition as, "For while writing may replace oral interaction in certain contexts, it does not diminish the basically oral-aural nature of linguistic acts. Strictly speaking, therefore, it is a mistake to divide 'cultures' into the oral and the written: it is rather the oral and the oral plus the written, printed, etc "(xii). True is the analogy in the comparative study of the work of Milarepa and Thoreau, where rather than division, what the narrative marks is assimilating points of both written and oral tradition

4.3 A Discussion of Genres and Landscape

In *The Life of Milarepa* (1997), Lobsang P. Lhalungpa, in the first chapter "Birth" takes us not directly to the birth of Jetsun Milarepa but rather to a place ,a cave called "Dopapuhk (Stomach Like Cave)" where Milarepa is referred to as " a Heruka supreme among all yogins"(Lhalungpa 9). Here we see the assemblage of his acolytes which consist of dakinis,³¹, men, women as well as Gods in various forms. This assemblage in a place thus creates the stage for oral narration. The conglomeration of people have been there for a reason, they are there to solely listen to the life story of Milarepa, whom

³¹Dakinis -Lobsang P.Lhalungpa in his translator's note of *The Life of Milarepa* provides an elaborated study on dakinis ,which in simple terms can be broken down as a Sanskrit word *diyate* which means "to fly" which in Tibetan Buddhism is taken as a spiritual guide . (Lhalungpa 206).

they addresses as “master”. Here it is subtly to be analysed that all his disciples, whether they be his followers, common man, dakinis or bodhisattvas we all see them without any hierarchical position, seated in in a single landscape, where we have the genre of songs that passes through copious horizon, thus the oral songs just like the landscape too flows in a manner of a wide space before the deliverer.

The narrative in the biography follows two events at this juncture as we see that Milarepa is ready to deliver a lecture while on the other hand a meta narrative is brought out in the form of Rechungpa’s meditative mood .It is from here that we are taken to the dream narrative where we see another place in the dream of Rechungpa ,who is one of the student of Milarepa. In the dream Rechungpa finds himself in a place which is described as a place, a city where “the inhabitants of this city were of enchanting beauty, dressed in silk and adorned with ornaments of bone and precious stones. They did not speak, but only smiled joyfully and exchanged glances.” Thus in the oral transmission we have the genre of dream narrative. Just as dream narrative works of writers like Geoffrey Chaucer and poets like Coleridge, in the dream of Rechungpa he is being led to another dimension of place within a place, “a mansion made of precious stones and filled with a myriad of treasures to delight the senses” (Lhalungpa 9).

The significance of the place of Rechungpa’s dream is much important in the sense that only after entering the dream landscape and encountering various people of the dream land that Rechungpa is cued to ask for the life story of Milarepa .It is in this landscape Rechungpa views people and learns how life stories of many great saints had been delivered by Lord Buddha ,thus when he wakes up ,he real realizes that a life story of Milarepa needs to be told and thus the dream landscape instigates the formation of genre of life stories .In the biography there are various instances when Rechungpa is encouraged by the people of the dream land as the situation is recorded as :

When he had finished, the Buddha said, ‘Tomorrow I shall tell the story of Milarepa, a story still more wonderful than the ones I have just told. Let everyone come to hear it.’ Then some of the disciples said, ‘If there are works more wonderful than the ones we have just heard, their miraculousness exceeds all bounds.’ ...The first ones then said, ‘Well, if we do not ask for such a wonderful teaching for the good of sentient beings, we shall be unworthy disciples. We must try to get it with wholehearted effort and courage. (Lhalungpa 10)

Here the preservation of knowledge goes via the lane of tales .It is the tales that preserved the reality of the past .This has further been the culture ,rather a generic tradition of Kagyu lineage passed on through generations .In the biography the words as “just heard”, “everyone come to hear” all suggest the tradition of Kagyu lineage where when the listeners speaks forth , “ ‘The story of Milarepa will be told tomorrow, let us go and listen.’”(Lhalungpa 11), it further suggest how the telling and the listening completes this oral transmission .

The genre of oral transmission invites in the process, the two directional communication as only when one broaches the topic there is start of oral story ,this happens in several songs of Milarepa and most predominantly with the realization of Rechungpa that the most important thing is to ask for the teaching from Milarepa .He thus ponders, “Bharima and the others, indicated that I should ask the Master for his story. And so I shall ask”(Lhalungpa 11).Just as a great teacher ,when Rechungpa asks for his life story ,Jetsun tests the ardent vigour and determination of his followers and denies them saying that nothing much will they get from his story ,humorously he replies to Rechungpa , “In my youth I committed black deeds. In maturity I practiced

innocence... To say more than this would only cause weeping and laughter. What good would it do to tell you? I am an old man. Leave me in peace” (Lhalungpa 12).

It is thus here that we see a greater relation between a landscape and a genre, where in the landscape that positions all the disciples in single horizontal stand, Milarepa too can be seen as an earthly being, very much alive as he connects in his biography, the universal emotion of sorrow and happiness, thus the genre he takes into account is not a description of the making of just an spiritual monk but the life of the son of the business man, who having been wronged by his uncle and aunt seeks to fulfil the motive of his mother's revenge. Thus the genre is very much non fictional and true account of a life of an earthly man who has had his story carved out of the same universal emotion. Thus he is to begin a genre of reality that common man can well relate with.

With the land and the landscape, is build up the oral tales that passes down through generations and so is the case in Milarepa's account as we are acquainted with the tale of Milarepa's ancestors where just as a dice game in the epic *Mahabharata*, there is an account of ancestor of Milarepa called Mila Vajra Lion who lost his land in the game of dice. Milarepa thus elaborates the story as :

Mila Vajra Lion was a very clever dice player and was able to win much by it. Now in this region there was a man from a powerful family, a cheat, who was also clever with dice ...Both having agreed to the stakes, they wagered irrevocably their fields, their houses, and their entire fortunes. They bound themselves by a written contract and played. The cheat won and took possession by placing his family in charge of the fields, the house, and all the goods. (Lhalungpa 14)

Even the songs of Milarepa finds closer affinity with the landscape of Tibet where his song “The Six Vajra Song”, brings us very close to the land of Tibet, sights of the landscape. In the biography of Milarepa there is reference to Naropa who bring out the relation , the symbolic as well as metaphoric relation between landscape and genre as one can view the genre of doha songs that made its origin in Kagyu lineage from Naropa, the Indian pundit into the narrative where we see that the doha songs even had the power to bring change in the landscape. Naropa , paying reverence to the future yogi joined his hands and is said to have prayed to Milarepa from India. There it is believed that the branches of the pines bowed to the direction where Naropa paid reverence to Milarepa where we still have the presence of a region which acts as a witness to this auspicious event where even today the titled tress of Indian region that have waved its branched to the direction of Tibet can be witnessed. Thus, we get the natural trees having an active involvement with humans and having active movement of their own where they have the liberty to change form. This speaks of a time in the region of Tibet which can be explained in no other way but by animism and proper relation and assimilation of two , one of human, the other being the environ.

In this state of reverence Naropa sings four lines of songs for Milarepa, which also predicts that the lineage of songs will further be adopted and carried to the vista of future advancing by Milarepa’s students. The incident is recorded as, “he closed his eyes and bowed his head three times. And in India the mountains and the trees inclined three times toward Tibet. To this day, the tree tops and the mountains of Puhlla Hari bend toward Tibet ”(Lhalungpa 81).

When Albert writes that, “Singers are usually in rural areas, frequently, but not exclusively, in mountainous regions, often among herders. The singer’s world must change for the merger to take place, or else the singer himself must change worlds”

(Lord, 21-22), this becomes very much true in context of Milarepa where at first instances of Milarepa's literacy as he reads through the books of black magic, tutors himself before a teacher to learn alphabets and later there are instances where when in the biography Milarepa tries to keep the book of black magic in Marpa's sacred place, Marpa thunders, "Take that filthy book away; it would defile my sacred objects and my shrine" (Lhalungpa 46).

Just as Thoreau structures *Walden* (1854) into two important plots, one emphasising the first year in Walden and the other that marks some change in his perception towards landscape, the bibliographical account of Milarepa can also be divided into two parts of his life, the first that concerns his worldly career and his revenge by black magic and tied to this is the thread that conjoins with the second part of his life, where the actions he carried out in his youth haunt him and find a constant echo in his subsequent life. What becomes much more important is that though Thoreau spends his second year in the same cabin still there is a change in perception towards the land, the same landscape he inhabited can be recorded with his altered perception. In a similar manner though Milarepa is commanded by his teachers to use the same hailstorms on beings he realizes his faults and the bad deeds in his later life.

In the biography of Milarepa, there is an account where when Milarepa comes back to his teacher's place he collects the manure of animals in his way back, and buries them in the field. This sight not only evokes in the teacher's eyes the persistence that Milarepa had, and a devotion towards his teacher but one can even see the concern for the land, for its fertility. Thus a connection can be seen that is cherishable as well as quite organic when compared to today's manner of address to a teacher or address to a land.

Thoreau likewise as a prolific prolocutor of the 19th century nature writing marked his way of writings from essays, poems and memoirs to genre that touched topic of the hour through prose predominantly through his essays. Thoreau in his personal narrative *Walden* (1854) makes way for iconoclast as he embarks on what he believes is an experiment with life in conversation with nature. Apart from a form of nature writing, a set of hallmarks that portrays Thoreau from realist to environmentalist, and as the father of American nature writing there is a wide emergent follower that he has plausibly created, a tradition of his own and a tradition of followers whom Edward Abbey addresses as “sons and daughters of Thoreau” (qtd. in Papa 70).

In this genre of nature writing, the very position of Thoreau as a father, metaphorically the source of germination frames him in cultural point, a figure one who accedes for the advancement of nature writing. Milarepa too takes students and acolyte where the guru sisya metaphor acculturates his existence. Genre in such terms comes as germination in ecocentric terms. It is a sprout that grows into a strong entity, powerful enough to set its seed into the womb of nature, into the lineage of existent genres, a new generic coinage that precedes to live beyond the death of the originator. Still metaphorically just as a seed carries the utility value of germination but it is still the land that gives the kinetic energy to the seed, so is the advent of genre of nature writing where clearly Thoreau's stay in Walden landscape and Milarepa's stay in mountains of Tibet fostered their memoir and songs.

Richard J. Schneider in *Thoreau's sense of Place* (2000) elaborately brings to the fact that Thoreau's writing and writing as form is a re-presentation where Thoreau's “writing encompasses virtually all of the approaches to understanding nature taken by American landscape painters of the nineteenth century” (qtd. in Smithson 95). Thoreau's writing method inevitably reflects the American landscape painters as

Asher Brown (1796—1886), Durand and Thomas Cole (1801-1848), shows Thoreau's ardent enterprise with capturing the landscape whether it was through detailed watching of exhibited paintings of Cole, of Durand or through reading the lines of landscape theorist like Edmund Burke and John Ruskin (Schneider 93). It is this eye of a painter that he objectively detailed every form available to experiment on nature that Lawrence Buell has succinctly described him in *Environmental Imagination* (1995) as a person "obsessed with how land is seen aesthetically: as landscape, as scenery" (qtd. in Smithson 94). However in this comparative study between the method of painters and Thoreau's study of landscape what is to be recorded is that Cole and Durand were transformers rather than replica imitators of the landscape. The environment and the landscape they saw came as a different picture out of their mind. It is at this juncture we can view Thoreau's writing in a similar characteristic where by the time the external landscape reaches the print of his thought it transforms.

Just as the theory of Mimesis, imitation of any idea in actual is imitation of an ideal where the artist imitates the idea but in the process of composition it becomes twice removed from reality. Thoreau's writing suggest a halt in his perception of nature and in that momentum there is a major shift in the composition of landscape. While in the sense of Thoreau the environment he writes of comes up as what Cole writes in his letter of 1826 that "the finest pictures which have been produced . . . have been compositions (not actual) rather than actual view (qtd. in Smithson 94). Milarepa on the other hand is also a composer but his composition reflects the very landscape that he see before himself. There are not much alteration in his songs, the very exact nature of landscape and of being is what his songs depicts :

I pray to my Guru, the Holy One.

Listen, my patrons, and I will tell you

the merits of this place.

In the goodly quiet of this Sky Castle of Junpan

High above, dark clouds gather;

Deep blue and far below flows the River Tsang.

At my back the Red Rock of Heaven rises;

At my feet, wild flowers bloom, vibrant

and profuse;

At my cave's edge [wild] beasts roam, roar,

and grunt;

In the sky vultures and eagles circle freely,

While from heaven drifts the drizzling rain

Bees hum and buzz with their chanting;

Mares and foals gambol and gallop wildly;

The brook chatters past pebbles and rocks;

Through the trees monkeys leap and swing;

And larks carol in sweet song.

The timely sounds I hear are all my fellows.

The merits of this place are inconceivable

I now relate them to you in this song. (Chang volume 1, 68-69)

After Milarepa who is also addressed as Mila became a renowned yogi, his followers were also called repas ,who sang songs and transferred the words of Milarepa through oral transmission in various regions of Tibet .Thus Milarepa is a name that not only brings the past lineage to life but also calls out his present stature of adhering a single robe in the land of snow . When in *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) , Marpa and Milarepa meets in the field ,the field is given a significant name as “Tuhngken (Field of

Opportunity)"(46), likewise when Milarepa completes the plough in the field ,in the eyes of Marpa it symbolises the accomplishment of his future task. Thus for both Jetsun Milarepa and Henry David Thoreau ,the relation of ploughing the field have been immense .It connects us to yet another part of nature .Thus whether it is start of Thoreau's understanding of nature or Milarepa first step in dharma we see a connectivity through the land, the landscape or the fieldscape .

4.4 Representing Nature through the language of Doha Songs and Memoir Writing

In *Drinking the Mountain Stream: Songs of Tibet's Beloved Saint* (1995), we have a reference of the great Indian master Pahadampa sangye who is accounted to have said to Milarepa that his lineage "is like a river stream-it will flow a long way"³² (Rinpoche and Cutillo 3). True to these words just as a passage of a stream wets every stone in its way ,the songs of Milarepa seeped into the marrows of listeners. While the abstract flow of the stream implies flexibility and non-rigidness in its form, the orally transmitted words and songs of Milarepa makes transition and transformation in form and composition, whose way of oral songs can never be ascertained, for it can never be trapped or hold in a place, only the essence of songs remains intact as it flows. As such true to a stream analogy every place Milarepa travels to has its own songs, its own form, its own literary taste and underlaid consciousness. It is in itself an astonishing phenomena that the oral songs of 11th century still could make a way, flowing a long way into our printed pages in a passage of time in translated colours.

In the lineage of Tibetan religious history of yogic cult ,while Tilopa ,Naropa and Marpa are found seated in lotus, the symbol of spiritual awakening ,it is solely

³²Pahadampa sangye is identified as a teacher ,whose peculiarity lies in the way of teachings through his non verbal gesture , born in the land of Bebala ,in modern day area of Andhra Pradesh ,he is accounted to have travelled to Tibet on various occasions .

Milarepa who we find in the portraiture of *thanka*³³ paintings as one who is “sitting in a cave on an antelope-skin such as yogis place under them when practising Yoga” (Wentz xvii). Peculiarly however, in almost all the paintings done on Milarepa, he can be heard pouring forth spontaneous thought in the form of songs where he is positioned in yogi’s attire with right hand on his right ear which symbolise his intent listening mode as well as the technique where the listening process includes not just the listeners, the outside individuals but rather we see that he listens to his own voice, engages to listen intently to his own words that symbolise the double consciousness, where he himself is the conveyer and listener. Like John Keats, “Ode on a Grecian urn” (1820), the portraiture of Milarepa’s songs in the paintings and in his accounts remains immortal, unheard yet melodious, like the piper’s song in the poem on which Keats writes his immortal lines as, “ Heard melodies are sweet, but those unheard/ Are Sweeter ”.

Here it is also interesting to point out how unlike other yogi’s of the Buddhist lineage who are seen in the lotus bloom, Milarepa is brought out very much alive, a human yogi seated in a cave. The songs as such forms an indelible part of Milarepa’s humane feelings, his whole existence revolves and resolves in this peculiar identity of a singer cum spontaneous poet, who overflows with perennial songs in principality of feelings. The songs of Milarepa further makes a connective origin with the Indian literature as, “the “songs” of Milarepa are really instructional and initiatic anecdotes that link Tibetan literary style with the Indian tantric *dohās* and *caryāgītis* known to Tilopa, Nāropa and Marpa the translator” (Tiso 12).

³³Thanka is a “Tibetan Buddhist painting on cotton, silk applique, usually depicting a Buddhist deity, scene, or mandala” (“Thangka”, *Wikipedia, The Free Encyclopedia*).

Francis V. Tiso comes very close to describe the nature in which the epic songs and folk ballads are delivered to greater audience in relation to the work *The Epic of Gesar* (1979) where we find the process of oral transmission in the form of song narrative. R A Stein writes elaborately on the nature and mode of transmission:

The oral versions [of Gesar] are spread by professional singers or bards (*sgrungmkhan*) who wander all over the country. Some may know the whole or a great many chapters of the epic, others only some of them. If invited for recitation, they can recite and sing for days and weeks. They are said to be inspired when singing, or even in a kind of rapture or trance (*sgrungbab*). In any case their attitude at that moment has largely a religious tint. (qtd. in Tiso 14)

Thus the singers or Repas of Tibet that followed and sang the songs of Milarepa were in themselves singer and composer, they kept the essence while adding some more to their understanding, some more of the contemporary nature perspectives where:

Singer of tales is at once the tradition and an individual creator. His manner of composition... makes no conscious effort to break the traditional phrases and incidents ... His art consists not so much in learning through repetition of the time worn formulas as in the ability to compose and recompose the phrases for the idea of the moment on the pattern established by the basic formulas. (qtd. in Tiso 15)

In this evolution of doha songs or the songs of realization of Milarepa, reference can be particularly made to Ojibway where songs were remembered through what came up as Cuna graphics, where a symbol was allotted for words. Contrary to the allotment of the symbols, songs of Milarepa was build on mnemonic to record the tone of Milarepa. To record the works that were either based on biographical account or collection of

orally transmitted songs ,a sound analysis of the emergence of the history of Tibetan scriptural existence is very much pertinent ,and its later evolution from orality to written words. Surprisingly in this evolutionary historical account ,one can adjudicate the role played by India in formation of Tibetan script .India was not only a nation close to Tibet but during ancient period it was also one of the great source of learning ,a centre of education that had under its greater name ,great scholars and learned pundits .Thus the first account in the history of Tibetan scriptural documentation records the arrival of Thonmi Sambhoda to India which was then evidently a rich country both in language and culture .³⁴

Thus, the script of Tibet is said to have been formulated by Sambhota after his arrival in Tibet from India. During his visit to India his main purpose was to coin a script that would render the oral tradition of region into documentation apart from translating books brought from India into Tibetan script. Under the tutelage of Indian pandita Devavit Simha, Sambhota took the great task of creating a history of transcribing words. This however took place under the reign of King Songtsen Gampo where the unwavering attempt of Sambhota gave power of ink to the testimonies of oral tales of his lands that he succeeded on his return from India, an introduction of an alphabetical order that Tibet could call its own.

As such in the reconstruction of the history of the Tibetan script, India is that inevitable name without which the historical process of the formation of one of the oldest esoteric language would have not taken a leap of completion. The contribution of India however ends not here but there are various accounts of the travel of great translators of Tibet among which Marpa is another name that travelled for about four

³⁴Thonmi sambhoda is accounted to have been a man behind the origin of Tibetan Script who is said to have been sent to India to learn Indian alphabets during the reign of Songtsen Gampo who was the then king of Tibet .

times to India for literary purposes. Jack Goody refers to the composition of vedas and writes that its meaning has a “metrical section, known as mantra, and a prose section, composed of explanatory material, called brahmana” (Goody 110). Undoubtedly still many of Buddhist texts though is written in Tibetan script, it hails a closer resemblance to Sanskrit words and thus one can speculate well that when Marpa brought esoteric knowledge from India, it were all written in Sanskrit and Marpa himself being a great translator translated thus the knowledge of Sanskrit verses. To add to this Marpa must have also learned songs from pundit Naropa which as a lineage he later transferred to Milarepa. Here it can undoubtedly be speculated that the doha songs that Naropa sang in Brahmin sutras was transfigured in the style by Marpa which later flowered as spontaneous songs of Milarepa. Thus songs of Milarepa in particular is said to have a link with doha tradition of India.

Milarepa's likeness for songs is quite evident from his childhood as we see him in the *The Life of Milrepa* (1997), on how having drunk in his teacher's presence he narrates the story to the listeners as:

While studying at Mithogekha, one day I accompanied my tutor to the lower valley of Tsa, where he was invited to preside at a wedding feast. Drinking much beer, not only what I poured for him but also what all the others poured for him, my tutor became drunk. He sent me ahead with the presents he had received. I also was drunk. Hearing the singers, I too had a desire to sing, and having a good voice, I sang as I went along. (Lhalungpa 22)

Even at an unfortunate event and circumstance Milarepa sang, for which his mother beats him, interrogates him, “Since we are the most unfortunate people on earth, is it proper to sing?” (Lhalungpa 23). In his later life what we see is that Milarepa sings in all occasion, whether in sad circumstance or in merry mood, in sharing his opinion of

others and in making opinion of self ,of change in nature and change in himself like a doha songs .Thus this interrogation that was made by his mother was taken much further in his later life where he brings out the appropriateness of songs where like any other literary form he takes it primarily for self expression .Thus while he sings songs of sadness,he also sings song of his happiness as “ Song of the Five Happinesses”:

I prostrate myself at the feet of Marpa the Compassionate...

At the summit of the Fortress of the Middle Way,

I, the cotton-clad Tibetan hermit,

Have renounced food and clothing in this life

To become a perfect Buddha.

I am happy with the hard cushion beneath me,

I am happy with the cotton cloth which covers me,

I am happy with the cord of meditation which ties my knees,

I am happy with this phantom body, neither starved nor satiated,

I am happy with my mind which has gained insight into reality.

I am not unhappy; I am happy. (Lhalungpa 122)

Marpa at times brings forth how bringing the doha songs and learning them was a hard trial for Marpa, as he narrates the difficult situation of bringing scriptures from India, he surpassed tribulations still no one came to greet him. He thus says, “From three collections of sacred books in India I extracted the essence of the four Tantras. When I brought back the teaching, no one came to greet me, not even a little bird” (Lhalungpa 67).

Just as in recitation of vedas ,versification was taken as a part of scholarly excellence, thus much emphasis is given to the oral retention of vedas than its preservation in the written form ,Milarepa thus transmits his life story in all the

biographical account in oral version where we find the presence of the listeners thus hinting on what could be seen as a greater belief in power of orality than in written records. The doha singers of India further find a great presence in the structural songs of the *repas* of Tibetan singers that later sang the life stories and songs of Milarepa in their itinerant travels. It was the tradition of the singer of the tales that never came to grow old and was irreplaceable even when written tradition flourished after the formation of Tibetan script by Thonmi Sambhota. It is also for this reason that in the biography there are various instances where Marpa emphasises on his journey as a translator and the difficulty he surmounted to acquire the knowledge which he brought back to Tibet from India. His conversation with Milarepa at various instances proves that need for recognition of written accounts. Thus, when Milarepa asks for initial knowledge to Marpa and requests him for initiation, he says, “For the few hailstones you have sent, am I to give you a teaching which I have brought back from India with such great difficulty? You want my teaching” (Lhalungpa 48).

The record of oral songs or doha lines and its transmission by *repas* should also be considered in regard to the mode of transference, whether it was dictated account or non dictated record of Milarepa. One can ascertain that the dictated accounts seem much more thoughtfully considered by the deliverer, which one gets in the record of the story that Milarepa delivered but the songs on the other hand is more spontaneous, where Jack Goody writes on his experience in *The Interface between the Written and the Oral* (1987) of recording verses as, “in the first case the speaker was obviously not reciting in the situation of performance and his delivery was much more carefully considered as he often had to pause while I hastened to write down his words.” (81). Thus when one reviews the structure of *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) subsumable with this analogy one can find that, while the story telling might have been coordinated

which is well evident with the chapter sequences ,the collections of Milarepa's songs are rather originally oral in note for their spontaneity .The spiritual songs of Milarepa, the songs of his realization are thus not narration but are collections that were put together from fragments of the past, sung and recorded in memory by the listeners who came across his songs.

One can refer to the process of composition of songs by LoDagaa of the northern Ghana which comes closer to Milarepa's composition of doha songs ,where alike to Tibetan saint and repas of Tibet ,they have a cult where one of the individual of the community "sometimes sit down at the xylophone and deliberately compose a short song; at other times, the same individual will sing a song he knows 'by heart', yet the music will often consist of free variations on the common theme in the manner of many jazz musicians "(Goody 81).While Milarepa never uses any musical instruments ,the composition of his songs are rather deliberated and immediate ,they seldom becomes a reiteration .What however comes as a reiterated songs are songs of the repas ,who travelled places and sang songs of Milarepa .Still just as the doha songs one can inevitably say that what gets transferred through the reiterated songs are not much song itself but the form and structure which thus reaches another singer who appropriates the songs according to her/his perception and situation ,thus the similar landscape might carry different emotion for different singers.

When on goes to the transmission and preservation of oral works and information of the authors of oral lineage ,Tibet can be seen in much forward and authentic in accounts of preserving the author and his works for as has been discussed, the cult of *namthar* greatly helped to keep the author alive beyond the significance of the woks, another tradition in the literary corpus of Tibetan canon existed where the tradition of orality was such that before any account be it story ,song or folklore the

reverence is paid to a teacher and thus an account of one's origin ,the origin of the tribe one belongs to ,all fits in the introductory lines ,thus there always stands a space for the account of progenitor ,this thus greatly helped to preserve the connection between the singer and the song ,the tale and the teller ,the story and the story narrator. There are lines to suggest how Milarepa gave his introduction in many of his songs before starting his spontaneous lines. In "The Song Of the Snow Ranges", he sings ,

You and I-patrons, patronesses, and old Milarepa,
Under the blessed canopy of this auspicious sky,
Meet once more before our worldly lives .(Chang vol 1 26)

Likewise, in "The Journey to Lashi" he introduces his teacher Marpa and himself in the song:

I, who see the ultimate essence of being,
Sing the song of [Seven] Adornments.
pay homage to Marpa the Translator, ...
Do you know who I am?
I am the Yogi Milarepa. (Chang volume 1 14-16)

When one analyses the comparative study of the biography of Milarepa and Thoreau's memoir as *Walden* (1854), one can indelibly write that the significance of memory is different in these two genres. Where memory in Milarepa's songs is more about the current situational viewpoints towards life, a confession of a time that is not about Milarepa's past but about Milarepa himself where, "the oral tradition was characterized by continual creation; it was the written that encouraged repetition, at least of established texts "(Goody 85). The peculiarity of Milarepa's oral songs varies in the sense that rather than being a simple reiteration and a memory the oral songs rather becomes a mode of dialogue with questions, questions of the listener to Milarepa and

to which Milarepa answers in song ,thus as every question varies ,every answer varies for that matter .

Thus when Milarepa is said to have made a great change in his songs from the tradition of his teacher Marpa , it is much evident that the Repas who sang the songs of Milarepa to the general audience must have brought out his songs in different tone, thus lacking verbatim precision. Thus when the song is about the nature description that Milarepa emphasises we can see a change from original songs to the songs of the repas, as Derro Zogic admits that “two singers won’t sing the same song alike. .. They add, or they make mistakes, and they forget” (qtd .in Goody 88). Still it can undoubtedly be said that just as Peta, Milarepa’s sister listening to the songs of hunters likened the meanings of the song and thus asks about its originator, she received the happiest answer as it was informed to her that it was sung by Milarepa, thus though the tone of the song might have varied through generations at times, the language ,the meaning delivered becomes much more important than change itself.

Thus, in the comparative study of the doha songs and memoir of Thoreau one can come to the conclusion that just as the oral songs were sang and transmitted but never recorded as are the written accounts that can be preserved for comparative judgements over the span of time ,there exist often in the oral transmission of Milarepa’s biography what can be taken as the limitation of memory while Thoreau’s account of *Walden* (1854) has a memory in record.

Memory as such is used in a different mode in oral and written traditions .While in orality memory is the memory of an individual’s current situation and a recollection of long forgotten past, individual’s sole experience that is sung, the song itself becomes an evolving memory as one remember and forgets various phrases ,which further gives new shape to the existent oral songs .The memory that sometimes loses its existence in

itself and becomes a metaphor as of hanging indent where the absence and exactness of records marks its subtle presence. The memory in written tradition is however not a record of only individualised world but a memory of a form that is emulated. Thoreau's memoir *Walden* (1854) for that matter diversely takes materials from old works which however would not have been possible if it was the case of orality, thus memory used in oral and written form varies diversely.

In the first-person narrative Henry David Thoreau views himself in *Walden* (1854), writes of the account of nature in forefront but also sees himself in the center of the narrative. *Walden* (1854) at times becomes a memory of a moment phased out as in the intervals of his thinking process Thoreau becomes an observer, looks at the transformation of nature and ponders the transformation in himself, feels a sense of change in himself where speculation of external nature is a flashback of his sole self in the past that is analyzed through the lane of memory. When Thoreau refers in *Walden* (1854) to Walden pond as a "well" that was dug by some "ancient settler"(142), it implies his perception of well to have a connection of a memory of his childhood that looks through the nomenclature which has its basis in cultural formation, a predominant water storage in the then America. James A. Papa further elucidates how "it is important to remember that Walden Pond doesn't ever abandon its shape or its banks, as the creek does when it floods"(Schneider 74), this fixity and constancy and structural orderliness is what makes *Walden* (1854) a narration that supposedly has a similar tempo throughout its course thus the landscape finds a relation with the genre adoption. Milarepa's songs on the other hand if a memory at all is the memory in presence that just as the different landscape that Milarepa visits differs in resonance.

The time with which nature works is something that goes beyond our record, as such what one gets when one looks at nature is just a moment one knows is fleeting

and taking it as a scale one tries to measure nature .Taking the anthropocentric monumental time ,Thoreau often narrates a change in nature but how consistent is the narration and how appropriate the scale is difficult to decipher where what Thoreau writes can be taken as an assumptive confidence to know nature enough to record it. Thoreau writes, “The pond rises and falls, but whether regularly or not, and within what period, nobody knows, though, as usual, many pretend to know”(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 140).

Thoreau writes of the pond that it is like a mirror that reflects the viewer where “the beholder measures the depth of his own nature”(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 145).This reflection of the reflected matter at some point implies that every time Thoreau looked into the pond ,he got nothing different but his own reflection, yet it is the distortions that differs .Thoreau signifies the pond as having a close connotation with “lake country” ,his knowing of the place somewhat emancipates its measurability for it is knowable and hence decipherable .At a point his attempt to measure the pond leads him to a culturally framed assimilation of what he thinks as ,the power of human over unfathomable nature ,here he seeks to adopt a measuring rod made in the flame of constant fluttering of civilization as he ponders in the lines of his journals ,“What is nature unless there is an eventful human life passing within her?” (qtd. in Simmons 227).

“Walking” (1862) of Thoreau can be revisited for lines where Thoreau blatantly accepts that he wants to represent nature through his words. He writes , “I wish to speak a word for Nature”. To the readers inquisitiveness there are two questions that comes out of this line whether nature can be represented in words, if somehow it is represented does the individual’s perception of nature be taken as a universal doctrine to be followed by all in voices of singularity and why does Thoreau feel that he needs to

represent it ,does his voicing the need imply its misrepresentation till now .Nancy Craig Simmons marks in this regard that what is best represented in Thoreau's perception of nature is all in his journal ,the essays and his later works that makes an emergence are result of memory and thus tend to be fallible .She writes :

The best “form” for his Journal thoughts is the running record of his perceptions, not the literary essays he might compose out of them. To write “extra-vagantly” is to resist the power of cultural modes of thinking — the forms, traditions, figures of speech, and habits that trap and deaden experience, limiting and determining what one can say and reducing nature to an object for human consumption. (Simmons 225)

There are records of the time when Thoreau had been in the process of compiling *Walden* (1854) and he made frequent walks to the forest. A record in his journal dated February 5,1854, has a trail of following a fox, in this action he himself thinks like a fox and the junction between the humans and the non-humans is at this point distorted. In the chapter “ Spring” of *Walden* (1854) we find a similar trail that goes well into the narrative . Though *Walden* (1854) is an accounted record of Thoreau who , after having left the concord records memory of the two years ,at times we find how his present experience of fox chasing becomes a part of *Walden* (1854) narrative .Thus it becomes ambiguous to ascertain whether *Walden*(1854) is the record of the past or of present scenario .Only when a critic reads the Journal and the *Walden* (1854) simultaneously that one is able to account what Nancy Craig has openly discussed as to how , his “entry mixes current and past events and experiences, indoor and outdoor activity, drafts for *Walden*, reading notes — “dead history” and “living poetry”(Simmons 231).

Thus in *Walden* (1854) ,it goes not without doubt that Thoreau takes present record not for present read but makes it a journey back to time via memory .He

emphasises on the enhancements of lines as he passes through seasons ,wherein in his journals he writes how the summer's warmth can be enhanced and felt when read in winter evenings .He thus writes, "You only need to make a faithful record of an average summer day's experience & summer mood — & read it in the winter" to get the "rarest flavour — the purest melody — of the season " (qtd. in Simmons 228).Nature also provides Thoreau a sense of stay ,a space for contemplation as in the narrative he goes back to his past life in Massachusetts and reviews the frenziness of his past life in contrast to the solitary existence of Walden pond .Thus going along binaries and dualities he views his current position in relation to his past position and frames a memoir that goes beyond current situations .While Milarepa's description of nature comes in its objectiveness as he describes nature in the exact form he sees it ,he seizes the moment and sings the account of the moment ,in Thoreau we see the evolution of past in the present .

Thus ,a genuine and non-faulty perception in representation of nature is ascribed as one where before culture and language comes the feeling of being one with nature, the essence that is unchanged by language ,where language is rather seen as a mode of expression and not the central emotion .While writers like Sharon Cameron speaks for non-inclusion of oneself .The identifying self can be amounted to a backseat when one reads and writes nature .This at some points resolves the dilemma of anthropocentric representation as in Nancy Craig Simmons we get the query in simplified yet never ending question to which she alludes in words as , "But, how successful is Thoreau — or any "nature writer" — in accomplishing this goal? Given that the instrument for "speaking for" is human language, can any writer speak for nature without reducing it to a human construct?" (Simmons 225)

Thoreau in *Walden* (1854) though discourages anthropocentric perception on the subjective description of nature and seeks to demonstrate a close affinity between words and place still what comes to us through the narrative in *Walden* (1854) is the appropriateness in- the making of Walden experience via memory rather than what can be termed as a Walden that has completed its construction .Thus Thoreau’s narrative at times differs from Milarepa’s narrative, for if in Milarepa we see spontaneity where he describes what he sees before him ,in Thoreau we know that he appropriates nature from his recorded journals to a linear narration as *Walden* (1854).Thoreau himself emphasises on this dementia that occurs when a record is made after a span of time ,the perception towards a place alters and so does the essence of the situation .He thus writes in chapter “Sounds” of this admonition of the role of memory in narration :

we are in danger of forgetting the language which all things and events speak without metaphor ... The rays which stream through the shutter will be no longer remembered when the shutter is wholly removed. No method nor discipline can supersede the necessity of being forever on the alert. (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 86)

This fear of forgetting and an obliged position of creating a metaphor seldom touches the songs of Milarepa because for him ,it is never a burden of forgetfulness that clings to his narrative for he describes not from the recorded journals but from what passes before him .Just as in the East consciousness is often described in the metaphor of thunder that makes its presence for a moment and again dissipates in a similar way, what we see in Milarepa is the timely description of that light while in Thoreau the light of the nature is recorded which in the process of scrutiny tends to alter .Truth and reality as such comes to Milarepa in the form of actuality while Thoreau battles up the feeling to find a form and structure to fit the insight as he admits in his journals , “Perhaps I

can never find so good a setting for my thoughts as I shall thus have taken them out of”(qtd. in Johnson 183). As such what sometimes we lack to see in Thoreau’s narrative that we get in terms of Milarepa’s songs is the time conscious description, moment recorded in its flow, moment described as moment and not appropriated as moment to be or moment as.

4.5 Impact of Environment and Ecology on the Choice of Genre and in Genre Formation

Dating back to the year 1869 Ecology found its origin in its use by Ernest Heckel ,a study that Heckel wrote on was a scientific temper that made a study of the interactive process between organism and its environment .The essence of ecology and its study still cannot be circumscribed to the nineteenth century for it had made its origin much prior to the date 1869 in the word *Oikos* which in translation from Greek word implies ‘home’. In the introduction of the book *Ecology :from Individuals to Ecosystems* (1986) Michael Begon , Colin R. Townsend And John L. Harper brings to the readers three levels on which ecology works, “organism”, “ population” and “community”, where the study of organism well specifies to bring the relative relation between individuals and the environment ,a level where “ ecology deals with how individuals are affected by (and how they affect) their environment”(xi).

The fundamental linkage that binds organism to environment can be taken as a relationship fostered by evolution. In the words of Russian American biologist Theodosius Dobzhansky, “Nothing in biology makes sense, except in the light of evolution”, and this is very much implacable in the relation between organism and the environment. The crux of the relation between genre and landscape in itself entails an evolutionary process. This evolution is much reflected in the life of Thoreau as in the life of any other organism ,the abrupt change of environment of city life to the solitude

of Walden pond marks out this adaptive phase in Thoreau's life. Charles Robert Darwin (1809-1882) chiefly proposes this survival of the organisms in the environment with the predicted relation with reproduction. His study like *On the Origin of the Species* (1859) focuses on the relation between individual and the environment but solely the point of study is on "species", their production, their multiplication, their descendants.

Now, if one analyses the outcome of this conjugal relation between organism and environment to be a literal born outcome, then one can see in terms of the thought process, the selection of an object of study in nature to be different from selecting the species. Here the section of the landscape can be seen differently from the selective process of plants and animals. Nature here, "does not actively select in this way: it simply sets the scene within which the evolutionary play of differential survival and reproduction is played out" (Begon et al. 4).

In this case the relation between the writer and the environment can be analysed in analogy where the analysis and adoption of the set environment is based on not what s/he thinks is fit to be recorded, but rather it is his experience of survival with the environment that influences the reproduction of the work. Taking this into account Milarepa's songs are not his chosen object that was caricatured in the lines of the spontaneous songs but rather it is the interaction with the scene that is evolutionary, that keeps a pace with his perception to create the narration. This is similarly the case with Thoreau's *Walden* (1854) as he records in the lines of the narrative not only those beautiful aspects of his life lived in Walden, but it is also his account of survival, his active evolutionary communication with the environment.

The teleological sequence in *Walden* (1854) itself marks the emulation of landscape as it marks a change in account from winter to spring and so does he chapters the *Walden* (1854) narrative, where it is not a mere coincidence that Thoreau begins his

stay in Walden in spring and ends the chapter as “Spring”, coming a full circle in life, in narrative and in his lines. He writes in chapter “Spring”, on what he believes as :

The first sparrow of spring! The year beginning with younger hope than ever!
The faint silvery warblings heard over the partially bare and moist fields from the bluebird, the song sparrow, and the red-wing, as if the last flakes of winter tinkled as they fell! What at such a time are histories, chronologies, traditions, and all written revelations? (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 241)

Even in the course of thinking, Thoreau with the space adjunct thinks in the manner of the landscape that he inhabits within the precinct of the space specified. In his chapter “Visitors” he addresses this thinking process in relation with the environ he is in. He writes, “One inconvenience I sometimes experienced in so small a house, the difficulty of getting to a sufficient distance from my guest when we began to utter the big thoughts in big words. You want room for your thoughts to get into sailing trim and run a course or two before they make their port” (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 108). Thus at time Thoreau narrates the sense of boundedness to the space where his thoughts truncates in want for wider landscape. Milarepa on the other hand seeks no space for himself, for he alters the habitat. Whether it is a change of caves or of change of the place, his life embarks on a pilgrim to solitude where the space is not constrained and that is well reflected by the variety in his songs.

If one takes into study the itinerant movement of Milarepa in various places that gives variety to his songs in contrast to the immobility of Thoreau in the precinct of Walden we can see in the movement of Milarepa ,a motile existence in contrast to Thoreau’s sessile immobility where in the study of ecology , “Motile organisms have a large measure of control over the environment in which they live; they can recoil or retreat from a lethal or unfavourable environment and actively seek another. Sessile,

immobile organisms have no such freedom” (Begon et al. 5). Thus, if in Milarepa we see how he matches environment to himself, in Thoreau we see a rather struggled way as he tries to match himself to the environment.

There are instances where we can see a greater influence of landscape in Milarepa where especially in his *thanka* paintings we can see the mountains and caves surrounding him and before him an accumulation of large group of people that is visibly the portraiture of the people that sits before a story teller, a bard ,a singer. Thus it is to be peculiarly acknowledged that just as the openness of the mountain, the valley that Milarepa frequents and the terrain of Tibet all gives an apposite space for the song to be delivered in the open spaces that it flows horizontally to the listeners.

Just like the mountains that encumbers Milarepa and just like the cave that shelters him the song that he sang of ,the life that he depicted in his nature songs ,the nature that he communicated with ,echoes in the infinite voices of the oral transmission. It goes through the mouth of Milarepa ,reaches the hunters and traders who further sing the tunes to the gatherings of people where the ladies of the Tibet again sings it back to the land as they cultivate their fields and to the children who sings now the songs of their ancestors ,thus the songs originates from the land and sings about the land . Truly, alike to the echo in the mountains that never escapes the land, the songs of Milarepa barely escapes the land without reiteration, his oral transmission as such went on the process of reverberated voices to have its existence among us today. To this one can definitely see even a symbolic relation between landscape and genre, place and narration, age and orality.

In the narration of *Walden* (1854) and in the spontaneous songs of Milarepa there also stands the relation between ecology and perception which finds its ultimate connection in the context of genre emergence where the whatness of things determines

author's howness of describing pattern .In some points ,the landscape can be seen as an inspiring muse that goes to encourage both the individual and the writer .It has its undoubtable influence on the words ,on narration as Thoreau refers to Catalian fountain, the spring of muses .He writes thus of the Walden pond, “Who knows in how many unremembered nations’ literatures this has been the Castalian Fountain?”(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 140).Vera Norwood provides a statement that collides with what we can call the influence of nature on human culture where “Nature and culture are interactive processes: human culture is affected by the landscape as well as effecting change on it”(qtd. in Garrard 76), while there are writers like Mary Austin who in her work *The Land of Little Rain* (1903) sought a relation where “she believed that poetic meter and rhyme schemes directly correspond to specific topography” (Blakemore 126).

In a broader analysis of genre in relation with *Walden* (1854) and in his essays, it has often come to the notice of the readers how he prefers rather prose as appropriate medium of thought transference, as an appropriate mode that can be used to depict this connection with nature. In the analysis of the choice of genre the study is also the study of negation of any other genre and the question remains on his choice of prose in his nature and life depiction .Thoreau occasions in 1851 to write how his perception of nature never “melts into a song” as he takes “notes of birds in the winter, — the faintest occasional tinkling sound, and mostly the woodpecker kind or the harsh jay or crow” (qtd.in Bryson 134).It is after all the song of nature that he dreamt of explaining whether by prose or poetry .At some point however the peculiarity that he gave to the form like taking account of the songs of birds in the form of notes and minute sounds could have been described realistically but in prose ,for poetry as Flaubert writes in letter to Louise Colet on 14th of August 1853 is “subject as precise as geometry” while Thoreau as a

meticulous perceiver had always felt of non-substitutional position of nature where the depiction of the evolving nature could not be captured fully in metaphors.

There has been instances to prove how Thoreau as a writer subsumed his source and his focus from the nature that stood before him rather than taking account of all that had already been described in nature writing .At one instance he takes us back to the year 1841 wher there is an account of Thoreau’s visit to Harvard College Library where he was called for selection of poems in an anthology ,at this occasion one can find his remark in his journal of the encounter of nature in woods and encounter of nature in the old rusty pages that marks his astonishment where “looking over the dry and dusty volumes of the English poets” gives him a surprise that makes him think “that those fresh and fair creations [he] had imagined are contained in them”(qtd. in Bryson 134).

Thoreau’s poems like “Nature” can be seen as to how he frames nature ,the lines in itself speaks about the formulation that tends more to the philosophy of life rather than factual nature description where he writes on this cohabitation as :

In some withdrawn unpublic mead

Let me sigh upon a reed,

Or in the woods with leafy din

Whisper the still evening in,

For I had rather be thy child

And pupil in the forest wild

Than be the king of men elsewhere. (Bode, “Introduction,” 216)

In his poems he is rather a character playacting rather than a person in his prose who keeps himself afar and speaks only about the subjective perception of nature. Prose as such seems to be a genre that marks Thoreau’s accurate observation where he wastes not a moment to define himself and his perception but only a perception towards nature

that is taken into account for that fully examines nature alone. His journal entry from 1851 marks the reason behind his lesser acknowledgement to poetry than to prose. He writes:

The best poets, after all, exhibit only a tame and civil side of nature — They have not seen the west side of any mountain. Day and night — mountain and wood are visible from the wilderness as well as the village — They have their primeval aspects — sterner savager — than any poet has sung (qtd. in Bryson 135)

J. Scott Bryson in the essay “Seeing the West Side of Any Mountain Thoreau and Contemporary Ecological Poetry”, takes this attachment to prose also as an effect of the evolution of poetry in nineteenth century as to how, “modern geology would hardly allow readers to Thoreau and Contemporary Ecological Poetry accept a poem that unselfconsciously anthropomorphized nonhuman nature or celebrated nature’s intentional benevolence toward humans”(135-136).

The poetry of Gary Snyder and other eco-poets comes to us as an evolving genre of nature writing which finds assimilation of humans and non-humans where unlike Thoreau they strike a balance of perceiver and perceived to a greater picture where flame and fannel stands in equal term where differentiating one from other becomes an impossibility .As such to a greater extent the landscape does surfaces as a major influence in author’s choice of genre.Genre as such marks one of the important factor that if at one point comes up as a relative bonding with the author at other times it carries a history of the land ,of its own evolution that emancipates author and ecology in summation .

To a great extent the landscape Thoreau inhabits also serves his choice of genre for he stays in the precinct of Walden and not just lives but explores the landscape.

Unlike Milarepa travelling to various places and singing only the essence of the land that touches his current emotion, the very fact that Thoreau spent more than two years in a single place reflects that his emphasis is not variety from various sights but rather his constant attempt in *Walden* (1854) is taken as variety from single variant. . Undoubtedly many chapters of *Walden* (1854) is a proof of his different ways of seeing the same landscape, where the onus of influence lie at one single landscape where multiple forms connects the non-harboured perception of Thoreau .

The assimilation of memoir and the prose style in *Walden* (1854) marks in Thoreau not the dearth of choice but rather his earlier poems that filled his literary history and his later adoption of prose as a better and fitted mode of expression for Thoreau reveals “innumerable avenues to a perception of the truth” which goes the way of experimenting things as he writes. “You must try a thousand themes before you find the right one” (qtd. in McGrath 150). Though Thoreau’s prose does not flow like the songs of Milarepa in spontaneity and in the nature of terseness wherein the songs of Milarepa encumbers the whole listeners swapping them in the cult of raga, yet the ecology does have influence on his style where at times in his memoir writing some poetic lines comes up like beads.

Still, Thoreau in *Walden* (1854) coming at other side of the pole in comparison to Milarepa’s simplified songs stages the narrative in philosophical lines that at very instance needs the touch of intellect as every line and every intertextual allusion craves forth a deeper meaning to the reader. Thus landscape can be seen as a major relative bond that sets the narrative of *Walden* (1854) where Thoreau spending two years in the same Walden space could not be described in a simplified way but in the philosophical and esoteric notes, without which *Walden* (1854) would have simply been an account of an everyday life in a place, precisely to say a diary, a journal at most .

Milarepa unlike Thoreau could not record his thoughts in his everyday journal, Milarepa had no means of delivering his songs but in rhythmic verses which further suited the listeners who would later sing the song in groups, thus to an extent the songs could not have been esoteric in nature, it was alike to Shakespeare's language meant for common man which could be retained by the listeners. However it goes not without saying that Thoreau inhabited the land for more than two years, this everyday connection with the space fostered the alteration of space to place and it seems that the impact of ecology on genre and perception can be held together as long as it tends to be a space, an unfamiliarity that still sets the viewer in awe, where his subjective perception is negated, but as the progression is made in this relation to place, as the relative feeling towards a space alters and takes a view of place, then the subjective perception starts to curb in and thus the influence of environment and landscape changes from influence on author to influence of author's own perception on nature.

Thus, the relation between genre and landscape is also about the understanding of space and place, Milarepa's position in *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) in a way comes as a relation with a space as he seldom gets time to familiarize with ecology, he pens down what he sees. As such the impact of ecology on the choice of genre can be taken into account as long as the author is unknown to the landscape. Apart from the influence of landscape on the choice/ change of genre what further motivates the change is the invisible yet inevitable presence of the readers. While in Thoreau the change of his accounts of Walden experience from everyday journal to lines of prose in *Walden* (1854) finds the presence of readers as an important unit in the alteration of the presentation of his thoughts, to the long elaborated descriptive lines of *Walden* (1854), the influence of the readers is reflected well in the songs of Milarepa too, especially the weather does impact the listeners patience and thus effecting the length of

Milarepa's songs. Milarepa is very much time conscious as he lengthen his songs according to the hurried or unhurried pace of the listeners. Thus when people genuinely ask for his song, he sings then long elaborate songs while at times when he is not asked for a song but he resolves to deliver his thoughts in some times he composes then meticulous short songs, fitting to the situation, likewise expressively his songs narrated at night differs diversely from the songs narrated in day time. Thus the influence of the listeners and to a great extent the influence of environment does adhere the change in the pattern and length of Milarepa's songs.

Thus, Thoreau and Milarepa took language as a medium, drew their lines in search of a language that could copy nature and act as a common bond between human and non-human, a language that could pen down their emotion as well as the rare impulses that crafted them as an artist –in making. They proposed to find a genre that fitted their mode of representing nature and in the process one can see how genre in itself is in the radar of the influence of the land and of the readers and the listeners where what becomes most important is the deliverance of thought process rather than the mode of thought transference.

Here, if it is accepted that nature cannot be rendered a visible colour without human formulation of words, it sets another question i.e. how the language of representing nature we call anthropocentric varies as people filter their experience of nature. Subtly it cannot have an adjunct point where even mere anthropocentrism be made a basis of universality, language the so-called human construct varies and with this variation one has to view nature in myriad forms. The question again arise that if somehow language is having an impact on nature representation can it be formulated that the way nature radiates to each person differentiates and thus if one goes to the hierarchy of the impact factor, it seems that nature is the one who might have yielded

human perception and creates a representation of oneself that is non universal ,which is nature's construct thus in the representation of nature we can see a leap from human centrisim to nature centrisim where nature speaks of its own self in variation .

CHAPTER-V

Conclusion

The dissimilarity and heterogeneous existence of diverse elements between nature and human world symbolizes the advent of symbiotic existence and a need for symbiotic exchange. In Guyot's formula of "mutual exchange of relations" we see how "everywhere a simple difference, be it of matter, be it of condition, be it of position, excites a manifestation of vital forces, a mutual exchange between the bodies, each giving to the other what the other does not possess" (qtd. in Schneider in 47-48). While humans through anthropocentric standardisation perceive nature and rather dictates it in terms of desirability and essentiality , there are initiatives like "Earth First !" that is directed towards relation between organisms which emphasises on equality of species. The biography of Jetsun Milarepa ,*The Life of Milarepa* (1997) bestows a similar perception of Milarepa towards plants and animals where he seeks to cohabit the space and sees organism that surrounds him not in the biased look of necessity or desirability but on what is manifested as the right of every organism to live .While he encounters maggots in his food, he claims thus , "This is neither my fate nor my right. It is not fair to rob the maggots of their food. I no longer want it" (Lhalungpa 120).

It comes not as a surprise how Walt Whitman speaks of the conscious presence of the Redwood tree in "Song of the Redwood Tree". It depicts the pangs and the passage of the evolutionary greed in man which still haunts ecology. To a greater point Milarepa also successfully draws on how each being, each element of nature has consciousness. This consciousness however reciprocates to all perceiver in different intensity, just as Whitman writes on how he could hear the sad farewell of Redwood tree but the choppers were deaf to the song, ecoconsciousness as such can be termed as

ingrained phenomena and a quality present in all yet only few can awaken the so called closer relation with nature, where nature speaks through the Redwood tree as:

You untold life of me,

.....

O the great patient rugged joys, my soul's strong joys

unreck'd by man,

(For know I bear the soul befitting me, I too have

consciousness, identity,

And all the rocks and mountains have, and all the earth,)

Joys of the life befitting me and brothers mine,

Our time, our term has come.

The task thus remains to depict nature which deludes all extremes ,nor the exposition of the trees that decides to “leave the field” for humanity nor humanity be as despised as is brought out in “The Last One” (1964) by W.S.Merwin whom even “birds despise”, but rather the age needs an environmental praxis where both nature and humans can coexist without leaving the arena for another and the experience of Thoreau in the Walden space and Milarepa’s spontaneous songs speaks for such relation .At times when Thoreau shares the food of acquaintance with the animals and trees of the place as is depicted in *Walden* (1854) ,it speaks for this symbiosis where we see Thoreau speak of his relation with the mice as , “The mice which haunted my house ... would come out regularly at lunch time and pick up the crumbs at my feet” (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 175).Thus it cannot be said that the place and environment alone marks a change in the author’s perception but rather the role has been multi directional where both nature and man assimilates an existence that can be framed as dwelling together .

I believe that it is in this type of relation that comparative studies aims to arrive at .The knowledge that is like the ideal perfection ,never complete in itself but a process in formulation, ever expanding sphere of the black hole that engulfs every bit of matter in its way or rather what nature teaches us with simplicity that the full-fledged evolution of the caterpillar is not the end but beginning of the life of butterfly ,thus marks the ecocritical way, a study that lays its basis not in the final record of the relation between man and nature in the literary interpretation but it is the evolution in their position that becomes a phenomenal mark of its evolving present ,the importance that can be marked in co-existence .

It is this relation that the cult of nature and humans are bound to take through the influences both positive and negative ,where if at times nature has the power to alter the perception of humans ,humans can likewise portray a different nature from what had been narrated by the ancestral voice, the comparative study of *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) with Thoreau' s work *Walden* (1854) aims at this kind of relative change that can be recorded and re -analysed where the bond of contradictions themselves blurs the two culture of Tibet and America into one unified world literature .

When one analyses the importance of the text *Walden* (1854) in contemporary period one can see that going beyond the common perception of his time Thoreau saw nature as an indispensable companion , and solitude the best company .He took various ways to analyze how best to represent nature and at times fails in his attempt to fully imitate its grandeur in anthropocentric words ,still with time consciousness approach he views nature in its natural time of the seasons and saw change in nature and change in himself in the adjacent years .Even in the midst of nature he had frequent visits of people that made him realize the essence of solitude amidst Walden, with the individualism ingrained he set to phrase his own economy towards life where his work

Walden (1854) stand before us as a way of life that in itself comes as a mode to be replicated as he emphasizes on simplicity and on simplicity ,trailed his path on both western and eastern philosophy and inculcated the importance of symbiosis .He identified ecology that remains outside as well as a working ecology within him .In the state of pure solace among nature ,he recounts in *Walden* (1854) , “I grew in those seasons like corn in the night, and they were far better than any work of the hands would have been”(Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 86).

He resisted being a member of a society who lost sight of permanent truth and rather focused his days on what could be called a worthy pursuit .Emphasising on People’s habit of spending much on things for the sole sake of being called sane, Thoreau in “Economy” depicts a society with lust for money where *Walden* (1854) is important even in our current times for it teaches us to live in terms of consciousness, to have experiment with life rather than taking the doctrinal trademark that society imposes on us as his prose work engages in bitter truths of life .Thoreau however never leaves the civilization as he gets to the zenith of realization so does Milarepa who at times visits the village that lies beneath the mountain range at intervals, travels beyond the range of the rugged land to fertile plains .Thoreau thus writes in *Walking* (1862) , “Our expeditions are but tours, and come round again at evening to the old hearth-side from which we set out. Half the walk is but retracing our steps” (Thoreau *Walking* 60)

Thoreau and Milarepa thus traces their footsteps back to Nature yet moves forward with eco-consciousness into better understanding of the society where if they walk toward nature from civilization they retrace their footsteps back to civilization again but this time with a greater understanding and insight towards life. Thus the words of *Walden* (1854) and songs of Milarepa begins from the land and ends in its return to home again ,the regenerated *oikos*,the home .

The works of Thoreau and Milarepa at various juncture compels the reader to be the narrator of yet another emerging story beyond the boundary of past and present circumference. Just as the account of chasing the fox had made a vivid entrance into the narrative of *Walden* (1854) much later during its compilation, the songs of Milarepa and the words of Thoreau's work never fails to enthrall us as it never becomes a dead history, a memoir alone for it engulfs present in the recorded past, where we ourselves as a reader have our own Walden in making; our own fox to be chased, our own record of the tinted leaves that we can articulate through our senses as Thoreau as an author compels us to look and thus find the evolving nature as he writes, "what I have endeavoured to describe. All this you surely *will* see, and much more, if you are prepared to see it, — if you *look* for it." (Thoreau "Autumnal Tints" 136)

Further, to study Milarepa and Thoreau and to study ecology and emancipation of ecocriticism comprises of principles that goes beyond national and cultural periphery where the theme of nature is conceptualised and globalised, wherein we see the condition of nature in praxis or in the printed pages to have been marked by a unified global environment, the term that is well brought out and that explains the essence behind the word transition in Ursula Heise's term coinage of "ecocosmopolitan" which implies a situational suffering where suffering of one part of the land and animals speaks of a larger degradation in another space and time.

Again coming to Milarepa's perception of nature in eleventh century, from his initial years of life under the tutelage of teachers, what he acquaints is the two vast realization of the importance of the other beyond the self where after having killed many animals and birds he feels a sense of remorse for he now acknowledges their importance not based on utility but on common responsibility. Apart from this, Milarepa to a greater extent brings out the point in the narrative that when humans try

to have dominion over nature, the result is that of destruction. It is undoubtedly true that he tried to caricature nature in his songs where a greater reference has been made to nature symbolism where if Milarepa connects the freedom of clouds to freedom of mind that has possibility to reach places, Thoreau in *Walden* (1854) seeks to see in the chapter “Higher Laws”, the advancement of the senses as a product of what he gets from nature where as an ardent Transcendentalist, Thoreau’s work reflects his vision where he sees the anatomy of human existence in parallel bounds to nature as he perceives and has communion with it.

Further, apart from the influence of the nature that imparts change on Thoreau, in *Walden* (1854), he brings a whole new set of nature perception that ranges beyond himself to the readers. In the memoir, Thoreau as a viewer, infiltrates every natural colour of Walden space where he is given the sole power to change the perspective of the reader cum looker. He successfully takes us to a myriad impression of nature where he gives his prose work multiple vision with its pictorial quality. He successfully organizes *Walden* (1854) in a form equivalent to a painter and unleashes his prose description of landscape without any restrictions where his colourful imagination aids him. Thoreau thus writes in *Maine Woods* (1864) how “howling wilderness does not howl: it is the imagination of the traveller that does the howling”(“The Maine Woods” 300). In a similar manner, Milarepa’s instance of ecology perception was beyond dearth of food, clothes and sheltered space as he accounts “I will seek food as do the mice and birds, so I have no need of a field”(Lhalungpa 111), on the other hand Thoreau seeks in *Walden* (1854) a balance to preserve ecology along with keeping the daily source of nourishment going by cultivating beans on his field, the difference in perception can be seen “since it is not part of the idea of conscience that it should pronounce identically to different men” (Findlay xxv).

Likewise the chapters of the dissertation has marked a study of the relation between genre and ecology ,an elaborated analysis of the form of oral tradition and poetic genre in Milarepa to autobiographical records in *Walden* (1854), the transition in genres which inevitably portray the evolution in ecology of respective individuals place .In this context it can be said that Milarepa’s use of songs as oral transmission of thoughts might be one instance of the reflection of the large cult of assimilating the crowd as listeners indicating the passage of his ecocritical thoughts in a more copious space while in *Walden* (1854) the autobiographical style of writing tend to bring the whole experience of Thoreau and his ecological perception within the precinct of Walden space, may imply as what Peter Barry marks in *Beginning Theory*, area three including (hills, fields ,woods) suggesting lessening of forest space of area one to area three in subsequent centuries (Barry).

Thus, at times we see variation in perception of Milarepa and Thoreau towards nature. While Thoreau takes nature as a commodity that serves his narration where he blatantly accepts that his saunter amidst nature are, “only for the sake of tropes and expression, to serve a parable -maker one day” (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 125),this marked fundamental perception towards nature is contrastingly dissimilar to Milarepa wherefore what Milarepa looks into is for a picture that he sings of in exactness. The spontaneity also recurs as an evidence that nature was never taken as a metaphor but it is in the pressing moments of spontaneity that he describes nature as what it really is , a picture before him .He never gets the leisured time like Thoreau to go back to the cabin and admire and admonish his thoughts before he sets it in his paper. The choice and change of genre as such can be seen as an effect not of the place alone where the narrative is set but rather it is what can be taken as not “what I see” , but “how I see”, and in the process of narrative discourse ,how one wants other to see.

As Robert Frost writes in respect of poetic lines in “The Figure a Poem Makes”(1939), “Read it a hundred times :it will forever keep its freshness as a petal keeps its fragrance”.

Still there are various instances where we find the two thinkers ,Milarepa and Thoreau in a common plain of conscious thinking where rather than following the then past degraded environmental condition or turning oneself to the future apocalyptic end of the earth ,what Milarepa and Thoreau’s narrative seeks to deliver is how Thoreau focused in each seasons of the year in a manner that puts a larger emphasis on current perception and of which Milarepa sings , “I cut the stalks and reap the fruit of action” (Lhalungpa 113).

Apart from some major and minor differences and similarities between Milarepa and Thoreau’s perception towards nature, we see in them the coming together of nature outside and human nature in one instance of togetherness. Just as Marx formulates or rather disintegrates nature into two strata, a concept brought forward as external and internal nature, “‘external’ or ‘first’ nature, that gave birth to humankind. But humans then worked on this ‘first’ nature to produce a ‘second’ nature: the material creations of society plus its institutions, ideas and values” (qtd. in Garrard 29).This process can be assimilated when we look at the natural evolution of Milarepa and Thoreau , we see in them the urge to go back to the primary nature by moving across the influence of societal values, where the external nature seeps forth and forms an embodied nature that is well reflected in the skin colour of Milarepa where in metaphorically the green colour of Milarepa symbolises the nature emulation .Just so in the case of Henry David Thoreau ,we see how the external nature and Thoreau comes forth in a manner of complementary assuage ,where in the fish in the Walden pond cannot be termed and framed as existing in internal space of the frozen pond alone for

it is still visible in the external, outside the pond ecology ,in the similar manner its externality also has an internal connection with its presence in the pond . In *Walden* (1854) we can also see the in betweenness of the pond, the middle position that it inherits between land and sky, so does Thoreau come to moderation between practicality and philosophical imaginings. Thoreau writes, “A field of water betrays the spirit that is in the air. It is continually receiving new life and motion from above. It is intermediate in its nature between land and sky” (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* 147).

To conclude ,what the narration of Henry David Thoreau’s *Walden* (1854) and the biography of Jetsun Milarepa, *The Life of Milarepa* (1997) embarks to make note of is how Thoreau and Milarepa assimilates the position of non-extremity and brings to the readers ,the life that is not based on extreme individualism nor extreme ascetism, where if in the narration of the biography of Milarepa, he is more about the harmonious assuage ,the meditative middle path between indulgence and strong ascetism ,though Milarepa himself adopts a strong sense of discipline in his meditation, we see in Milarepa a light that stands as a metaphor on equal mindedness of which transcendentalist seeks to see as a better version of a man that adheres this mid-position of a derided passage between exploited society and its subjugating canons and awareness of the thinking process that can balance nature and culture ,most importantly the sense that balances the notion of self and other.Thus it is believed that what remained after Milarepa’s physical absence from the world was only his “ few worldly possessions: a cap, a walking staff, strips of his cotton robe, pieces of hard rock sugar” (Quintman 32).The things that were left became all that Milarepa possessed ,it is all that necessitated his life ,nothing that was far fetched from need and near to want .To answer the query of what he left to this world is more precisely to answer through his

songs and oral stories that still marks his indelible presence .And , in a similar manner Thoreau likewise emancipates in brevity in *Walden* (1854) , the adoption of Simplicity and simplicity alone .

It will not be far fetched to write that they are not yogis but becomes one, the awakened one that acquires the state of knowledge through follies ,for when Thoreau kills a birds ,he again realizes and finds better ways of learning ornithology than by the power of the gun ,we see in them thus an evolutionary man .

Works Cited

Primary Sources

- Lhalungpa, Lobsang P., translator. *The Life of Milarepa*. Book Faith India, 1979.
- Thoreau, Henry David. *Walden and Civil Disobedience*, edited by Tom Griffith. Wordsworth Editions, 2016.

Secondary Sources

- Adam, Barbara. *Timescapes of Modernity: The Environment and Invisible Hazards*. Routledge, 1998.
- Alan Roberts ,Peter .*The Biographies of Rechungpa :The Evolution of a Tibetan Hagiography* .Routledge ,2007.
- Allen , Bruce . “First There Were Stories: Michiko Ishimure’s Narratives of Resistance and Reconciliation”. *East Asian Ecocriticisms: Critical Reader*, Estok, Simon C. and Won-Chung Kim, editors . Palgrave Macmillan 2013.
- Atkinson, Brooks. *The Complete Essays and Other Writings of Ralph Waldo Emerson*. Random house,1940.
- Atwood, Margaret. *Surfacing*. Virago Press,2009.
- Barry, Peter. *Beginning Theory: An Introduction to Literary and Cultural Theory*. 2002.
- Begon, Michael, et al. *Ecology from Individuals to Ecosystems*. Blackwell Publishing, 2006.
- Bhabha, Homi K. *The Location of Culture*. Routledge,1994.
- Blakemore, Peter. “Reading Home: Thoreau, Literature and the Phenomenon of Inhabitation”. *Thoreau’s Sense of the Place: Essays in American Environmental Writing*, edited by Richard J. Schneider. University of Iowa Press, 2000.

- Bode, Carl. *Introduction to Collected Poems of Henry Thoreau*, edited by Carl Bode. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1964.
- Bouton, Christophe and Philippe Huneman, Editors. *Time of Nature and the Nature of Time: Philosophical Perspectives of Time in Natural Sciences*. Springer ,2017.
- Britannica: Ready Reference Encyclopedia*. Encyclopedia Britannica Inc,2006. Isbn 81-8131-098-5. Vol 5, pp. 24.
- Bryson, J. Scott. "Seeing the West Side of Any Mountain Thoreau and Contemporary Ecological Poetry". *Thoreau's Sense of the Place: Essays in American Environmental Writing*, edited by Richard J. Schneider. University of Iowa Press, 2000.
- Buell, Lawrence. foreword in *Thoreau's sense of place: Essays in American Environmental Writing*, edited by Richard J. Schneider. University of Iowa Press,2000.
- Cafaro, Philip. *Thoreau's Living Ethics: Walden and the Pursuit of Virtue*. University of Georgia Press,2004.
- Cain, William E. *A Historical Guide to Henry David Thoreau*. Oxford U P ,2000.
- Chang, Grama C.C., translator. *The Hundred Thousand Songs of Milarepa*. Shambhala,1977.2 Vols.Editions, 2001.
- Estok, Simon C. and Won-Chung Kim, editors. *East Asian Ecocriticisms: Critical Reader*. Palgrave Macmillan ,2013.
- Findlay, J.N. foreword. *Phenomenology of Spirit* by G.W.F. Hegel. Oxford UP, 1977.
- Foley, John Miles, editor. *Oral Tradition in Literature: Interpretation in Context*. University of Missouri Press Columbia, 1986.
- Foster, David R. *Thoreau's Country: Journey Through a Transformed Landscape*. Harvard UP, 2001.

- Garrard, Greg. *Ecocriticism*. Routledge, 2004.
- Glotfelty, Cheryll, and Harold Fromm, editors. *The Ecocriticism Reader: Landmarks in Literary Ecology*. University of Georgia Press, 1996.
- Goody, Jack *The interface between the written and the oral*. Cambridge University Press 1987.
- Grath, James G. MC. "Ten Ways of Seeing Landscapes in *Walden* and Beyond". *Thoreau's Sense of the Place: Essays in American Environmental Writing*, edited by Richard J. Schneider. University of Iowa Press, 2000.
- Johnson, Rochelle. "Walden, *Rural Hours*, and the Dilemma of Representation". *Thoreau's Sense of the Place: Essays in American Environmental Writing*, edited by Richard J. Schneider. University of Iowa Press, 2000.
- Leopold, Aldo. *A Sand Country Almanac: And Sketches Here and There*. Illustrated by Charles W. Schwartz. Oxford U P, 1949.
- Lopez, Donald S., Jr. Introduction. *The Life of Milarepa*, by Tsangnyon Heruka, Penguin, 2010.
- Lord, Albert B "The Merging of Two Worlds: Oral and Written Poetry as Carriers of Ancient Values". *Oral Tradition in Literature: Interpretation in Context*, Edited by John Miles Foley. University of Missouri Press, 1986.
- Lyon, Thomas J. *This Incomparable Land: A Guide to American Nature Writing*. Milkweed, 2001.
- Olson, Ted. "'In Search of a More Human Nature: Wendell Berry's Revision of Thoreau's Experiment. *Thoreau's Sense of the Place: Essays in American Environmental Writing*, edited by Richard J. Schneider. University of Iowa Press, 2000". pp 61-69.

- Papa, Jr., James A. "Water-Signs: Place and Metaphor in Dillard and Thoreau". *Thoreau's Sense of the Place: Essays in American Environmental Writing*, edited by Richard J. Schneider. University of Iowa Press, 2000.
- Porte, Joel. *Consciousness and Culture: Emerson and Thoreau Reviewed*. Yale U P, 2004.
- Quintman, Andrew H. *The Yogin and the Madman: Reading the Biographical Corpus of Tibet's Great Saint Milarepa*. Columbia UP, 2014.
- Rinpoche, Lama Kunga, and Brian Cutillo. *Drinking the Mountain Stream: Songs of Tibet's Beloved Saint, Milarepa*. Wisdom, 1995.
- Rossi, William. "Thoreau's Transcendental Ecocentrism" *Thoreau's sense of place: Essays in American Environmental Writing*, edited by Richard J. Schneider. University of Iowa Press, 2000.
- Schneider, Richard J., "'Climate Does Thus React on Man': Wilderness and Geographic Determinism in Thoreau's 'Walking'". *Thoreau's Sense of the Place: Essays in American Environmental Writing*, edited by Richard J. Schneider. University of Iowa Press, 2000.
- Schneider, Richard J., editor. *Thoreau's Sense of the Place: Essays in American Environmental Writing*. University of Iowa Press, 2000.
- Simmons, Nancy Craig. "Speaking for Nature Thoreau and the 'Problem' of 'Nature Writing'". *Thoreau's Sense of the Place: Essays in American Environmental Writing*, edited by Richard J. Schneider. University of Iowa Press, 2000.
- Smithson, Isaiah. "Thoreau, Thomas Cole, and Asher Durand: Composing the American Landscape". *Thoreau's Sense of the Place: Essays in American Environmental Writing*, edited by Richard J. Schneider. University of Iowa Press, 2000. pp. 93-114.

- Tally, Robert T., Jr. and Christine M. Battista, editors. *Ecocriticism and Geocriticism: Overlapping Territories in Environmental and Spatial literary studies*. Palgrave Macmillan, 2016.
- Thompson, Paul, and Joanna Bornat. *The Voice of the Past: Oral History*. Oxford UP, 2000.
- Thoreau, Henry David . “Walking”. *Wild Apples and Other Natural History Essays by Henry D. Thoreau*, edited by Rossi William. The University of Georgia Press, 2002.
- Thoreau, Henry David . “Autumnal Tints ”. *Wild Apples and Other Natural History Essays by Henry D. Thoreau*, edited by Rossi William. The University of Georgia Press, 2002.
- Thoreau, Henry David . *The Maine Woods*. Edited by Joseph Moldenhauer. Princeton UP ,1972.
- Thoreau, Henry David . *Wild Apples and Other Natural History Essays by Henry D. Thoreau*, edited by Rossi William. The University of Georgia Press, 2002.
- Thornber, Karen “Afterword: Ecocritical and Literary Futures”. *East Asian Ecocriticisms: Critical Reader*, edited by Simon C Estok and Won-Chung Kim. Palgrave Macmillan 2013.
- Thorson, Robert M., *Walden’s shore: Henry David Thoreau and nineteenth- century science*. Harvard U P ,2014.
- Walls, Laura Dassow. “Believing in Nature: Wilderness and Wildness in Thoreauvian Science” *Thoreau’s Sense of the Place: Essays in American Environmental Writing*, edited by Richard J. Schneider. University of Iowa Press, 2000. pp15-27.

Wentz, W.Y. Evans. *Tibet's Great Yogi Milarepa*. Pilgrims Publishing, ISBN: 81-7769-0655.

Journals and Weblinks

Ekvall, Robert B., "The Message of Milarepa by Humphrey Clarke .The Journal of Asian Studies ,vol.19,No3 (May ,1960),pp.360-361,published by Association for Asian Studies. Stable URL: <http://www.jstore.org/stable/2943519>, Accessed 10/06/2014 17:12

Eliot, T.S. "Tradition and the Individual Talent ." *Perspecta*, vol.19,1982, pp .36-42. JSTOR, www.jstor.org/stable/1567048.Accessed 14 Dec .2020

Huebener, Paul. "Timely Ecocriticism :Reading Time Critically in the Environmental Humanities" *Interdisciplinary Studies in Literature and Environment*, 2018.

Johns, Donald, and Gary Snyder. "An Interview with Gary Snyder 'Language is Wild.'" *Writing on the Edge* ,vol.2, no.1, 1990 ,pp.100-112. JSTOR, www.jstor.org/stable/43158666. Accessed 1 Dec .2020.

Rondolino, Massimo A. "Prolegomena to a Comparative Reading of 'The Major Life of St. Francis' and 'The Life of Milarepa.'" *Buddhist -Christian Studies*, vol.35,2015, pp.163-180., www.jstore.org/stable/24801395.Accessed 3 Nov. 2020.

Tiso, Francis V. "The Biographical Tradition of Milarepa: Orality, Literacy and Iconography. The Tibet Journal, Vol. 21, no. 2,1996, pp. 10-23. JSTOR, www.jstore.org/stable/43302275. Accessed :7. Nov .2020.

Waldman ,Anne. "Poetry as Siddhi". *Buddhist Women on the Edge: Contemporary Perspectives from the Western Frontier* .North Atlantic Books.

Wikipedia Contributors . 'Enactivism', *Wikipedia, The free Encyclopedia* ,16 February. 2021.Web

Wikipedia Contributors. 'Namtar (biography)', *Wikipedia, The Free Encyclopedia*.

Wikipedia, 15 Dec. 2020.

Wikipedia Contributors. "Henry given name." *Wikipedia, The Free Encyclopedia*, 24.

Nov.2020, [https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Henry_\(given_name\)](https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Henry_(given_name)).

Wikipedia Contributors. "Thanka." *Wikipedia, The Free Encyclopedia*. Wikipedia ,18

Nov. 2020.